Summary
Scenario Task Force Call #1
June 15, 2011, 3:30 – 5:00 PM EDT

1. **Introduction and context --** Margaret Pinard from Keystone provided the following background and contextual information:
   - The format for the Scenario Task Force calls will follow the same ground rules as the SSC Work Groups. SSC-designated Task Force members will have the first chance to speak and respond, with time being given at intervals for others on the call to participate.
   - Keystone sees the Scenario Task Force completing its mission in three phases:
     - In this first phase, Task Force members will consider objectives and decide on criteria for selecting the three final scenarios, which will be presented to the SSC at its July meeting.
     - In the second phase, members will apply those SSC-approved criteria to suggestions, and develop recommendations for the three scenarios to be presented to the SSC at its September meeting.
     - Finally, the Scenario Task Force members will do a final review before confirmation of scenario inputs to be handed over to EIPC and CRA to model in Phase II.

2. **Review of project purpose, Phase II objectives, and importance of scenario selection criteria**
   - Margaret Pinard highlighted the importance of criteria development from a process perspective. Developing sound criteria that relate to the project goals will give task force members a touchstone to evaluate the many choices they will have once all the modeling results are in.
   - David Meyer provided the following comments: Phase II may be more technical, but it should not be less transparent than Phase I.
     - The objective of these scenarios and build-outs is to do some 'intellectual reconnaissance' and discover what type of transmission grid will be the most resilient to different policy options and unanticipated events.
     - The set of 3 scenario build-outs should constitute a 'balanced set,' which collectively should push the envelope; it may be helpful to think of them as a 'triangular' set rather than bookends.
     - An idea for a range would be have one scenario that is transmission-intensive, one that is a 'smart-car model' and more minimalist about building transmission, and something in between. The difference between these three options should show effects of transmission choices on electricity prices, generation mix, and carbon emissions.
     - It is important to use this study to study the effects of using new transmission technology, such as how HVDC lines would interact with the current AC network.
   - David Whiteley then iterated the key goals of the project and Phase II in particular from EIPC's perspective:
     - In Phase II, EIPC's aim is not necessarily to reflect a particular policy (or combination of policies) in the build-out scenarios. Rather their focus will be on the desired location and amount of both resources and load, and figuring out how to bridge the two through the transmission build-outs.

    - Stakeholders should understand that the results won't be fully optimized – meaning, the generation will stay fixed, and it won't adjust based on the findings related to transmission costs.
    - It is anticipated that the results will provide a broad spectrum of useful information about the relative costs and adequacy of various transmission expansion possibilities.

3. **Review of criteria/objectives concepts previously raised by SSC –** Caitlin Connelly from Keystone reviewed key concepts that emerged from the SSC's discussion about scenario selection criteria from the May 18-19 meeting, which included the following:
    - Bundles/clusters**:** Start with generation and transmission outcomes from Phase I, determine which Futures have similar outcomes, and therefore would likely result in similar transmission build-outs, "bundle" them into groups, then select/develop three scenarios that are representative of the three preferred "bundles."
    - Bookends: Develop/select scenarios that represent opposite "bookends" of some spectrum that is of interest to stakeholders (with the third scenario presumably somewhere in between the two bookends).
    - Policy-driven scenarios: Develop/select scenarios encompassing different narratives of how the future will unfold, driven by a coherent policy set.

4. **Task Force members' discussion of criteria and objectives**
    - The Bookends approach was discussed at length. Task Force members indicated that this concept could dovetail with the Clustering approach. Some of the variables and factors task force members discussed included:
        - Location and types of generation
        - Planning approach employed -- regional, super-regional, or EI-wide
        - Anticipated transmission build-outs – extent to which long-range transfers are needed; types of technology utilized; range of anticipated costs
        - Variety of pathways to meeting consumer energy needs
        - Policies and goals – range of goals; likelihood of being implemented
        - Reasonableness/ likelihood of accomplishing a particular transmission build-out in the timeframe being studied
    - Some of the objectives discussed include the following:
        - See a transmission build-out with the fewest transmission corridors necessary
        - See a transmission build-out resilient to unanticipated events
        - See transmission build-outs driven by policy choices that are plausible
        - See robust transmission possibilities that accommodate a range of generation mixes
        - Show three different ways of meeting consumer energy needs
        - See what kind of transmission is needed for a clean energy future
        - See cost information of a grid for that clean energy future
        - See impact of integrating long-range and offshore wind and other resources
    - Additional goals and considerations mentioned by task force members included:
        - Wanting to see how costs to end users can be minimized within different policy approaches
        - Needing to balance the 'push-the-envelope' inclination with the ability to accomplish a particular transmission build-out in the timeframe being studied

- Several requests for more information or concerns about the objectives/ criteria discussion were noted:
    - Level of reliability analysis to be done by EIPC in Phase II.
        - Dave Whiteley explained that the planning authorities (PAs) are working on determining process now, and will be able to report out in more detail at the July SSC meeting.
    - How HVDC would be integrated into scenarios -- who would specify that input, or is it an output?
        - Dave Whiteley explained that there will be opportunities for the SSC to provide input to EIPC on where DC lines might be an appropriate solution during the transmission analysis work in Phase II.
    - Comparison of results from 8 Futures on variables of interest to the Task Force, including generation expansion types and location, transfer limits, load, high-level costs (G&T), energy output, etc.
        - Keystone will work to determine whether there is an individual or group who can compile this information.
    - Phase II modeling process, capabilities, inputs, outputs.
        - Keystone will explore options for getting Task Force members the information they need on this topic.
    - Types of cost information and analyses to be provided for BAU Future and baseline infrastructure.
        - Dave Whiteley reiterated that there will be no production cost modeling on the Baseline Infrastructure, which was developed from a roll-up of regional plans for the year 2020, and therefore is not comparable to the build-out scenarios. There will be high-level transmission cost analysis of BAU Future (and the rest of the seven Futures). Process for high-level transmission cost analyses is being revised to accommodate stakeholder input and more information will be presented before the July SSC meeting.

5. Next steps

- Keystone will circulate questions for Task Force members and their sectors to consider between now and the next call.
- Keystone will also compile a draft scenario selection criteria write-up based on the input from today's call, which will be circulated in advance of the next call, for Task Force members to react to and use as the basis for the next discussion.
- A listserv will soon be up and running. Task Force designees will be added automatically; other stakeholders will have to opt in through the Contact Us form on the EIPC website.
- The next call will take place 6/29 at 3:30 EDT. The following call will be held 7/12 at 3:30 EDT.