

**Subject:**

FW: Request to Sponsor MGM Bill

From: John Ragan [<mailto:rep.john.ragan@capitol.tn.gov>]

Sent: Wednesday, January 12, 2011 9:57 AM

To: Tom Kulaga

Subject: RE: Request to Sponsor MGM Bill

Dear Mr. Kulga:

Thank you for expressing your interest in this topic to me. However, I cannot support your position until some other issues have been addressed.

First, while your message is informative with some quotes from the Royal Dutch Medical Association, etc., you failed to provide some essential comparative statistics. Such information is critical for data-based decision making.

Specifically, the required, operative statistics for decisions in this area are how many total circumcisions are performed without medical complication versus how many have some sort of serious complication.

Additionally, it would be necessary to include a comparison of how many medical complications develop in uncircumcised males (that could be potentially avoided by the procedure) versus how many of the same types of complications occur in the circumcised population.

Such statistics would need to be "controlled" for socio-economic status, race, religion, geographic location, doctor-performed versus Rabbi versus "other," etc. Statistical confidence intervals, standard deviations, total population size studied, distribution characterizations (Gaussian, Poisson, Laplace, etc.), are also need-to-know information for adequate decision making.

Second, you failed to explain how such a bill could avoid running afoul of Constitutionally prohibited, state interference in religion, specifically Judaism. The Supreme Court has ruled in the past that for such state interference to avoid infringement on the First Amendment to the US Constitution (or Article I, Section 3 of the Tennessee State Constitution), there must be an overwhelming state interest that can be served in no other, less intrusive manner.

Your involvement in your state's governmental decision processes is much appreciated. I hope the information I have addressed has been helpful to you. Unfortunately, more data is essential before any bill on this topic could gain my support, or, I suspect, that of other General Assembly members.

Regards,

John Ragan,  
Tennessee State Representative, District 33