

# MEETING MINUTES

## STATE OF WASHINGTON BOARD OF PILOTAGE COMMISSIONERS

October 21, 2008

---

--

### Present:

Chairman: *By telephone conference call - Harry Dudley*

Commissioners: Pat Hannigan, Bill Snyder, Vince Addington, Norm Davis  
*By telephone conference call - Chuck Davis, Ole Mackey*

Administration: Peggy Larson, Judy Bell

Dr. Roberta Chinn, Dr. Norman Hertz: COMIRA

Captain Eric vonBrandenfels: Puget Sound Pilots - Open Session only

Joe Brady, Scott Anacker, Dave Shaffer: Pilot applicants - Open Session only

### **CLOSED SESSION**

A Closed Session was convened at 12:00 noon by Chairman Harry Dudley by telephone conference call originating in the Third Floor F & A Conference Room, 2901 Third Avenue, Seattle, Washington, to discuss matters related to the Written Pilot Exam and Simulator Evaluation for the Puget Sound Pilotage District. Drs. Roberta Chinn and Norman Hertz from COMIRA participated in this discussion.

### **SPECIAL MEETING**

A special meeting of the Board of Pilotage Commissioners was convened by Chairman Harry Dudley by telephone conference call immediately following the Closed Session at 1:15 p.m.

The purpose of the special meeting was to discuss and consider action on the following bulleted items:

- Set the Minimum Passing Score for the Written Examination: It was moved by Commissioner Hannigan and seconded by Commissioner Addington that in accordance with WAC 363-116-076(1) that the minimum passing score for the written examination be set at 105 points. The motion carried.
- Review Applicants' Protest Forms and Determine the Outcome: It was moved by Commissioner Hannigan and seconded by Commissioner Snyder that the Board advise all applicants that under the guidance of COMIRA all the *Protest Forms* submitted during the written examination of October 20, 2008, were reviewed and none were found to meet the minimum standards required under WAC 363-116-083. The motion carried. It was moved by Commissioner Hannigan and seconded by Commissioner Addington that the results of the Board's review of each applicant's *Protest Forms* be included in the letters of notification advising each applicant of their written examination results and eligibility to advance to the simulator evaluation. The motion carried.
- Set the Number of Applicants Who Will Advance to the Simulator Evaluation: It was moved by Commissioner Addington and seconded by Commissioner C. Davis that the number of applicants who will advance to the simulator evaluation be set at 28. The motion carried. The Board chose the number 28 based on a recommendation by COMIRA that a relative cut score of 119 points be used to determine the number of candidates moving on to the simulator exam. COMIRA derived the relative cut score of 119 through analysis of the test results and their application of psychometric principles.
- Establish a Tie-Breaking Mechanism: It was moved by Commissioner Snyder and seconded by Commissioner N. Davis that the Tie-Breaking Mechanism as described in the *Policies and Procedures Relative to the Simulator Evaluation* document be approved as follows: If two or more applicants have the same total score, the score on the written examination will be used as a tie breaker. The applicant who has the highest score on the written examination will be given precedence in the ranking. In the event that two or more applicants have the same score on both the written examination and the simulator evaluation, precedence in the ranking will be

given to the applicant who has the most days of sea service that qualifies him/her under WAC 363-116-0751. The motion carried.

- Approve the Policies and Procedures Relative to the Simulator Evaluation: It was moved by Commissioner Hannigan and seconded by Commissioner Addington that the *Policies and Procedures Relative to the Simulator Evaluation* as reviewed and considered by the Board be approved as written. The motion carried.
- Determine the Scoring Method on the Simulator Evaluation and the Relative Weight of This Score to the Whole Examination: It was moved by Commissioner Hannigan and seconded by Commissioner Snyder that the relative weight of the simulator evaluation to the whole examination be set at 50% which means the relative weight of the written examination is also 50%. The motion carried. It was moved by Commissioner Hannigan and seconded by Commissioner Addington that the scoring method on the simulator evaluation be as described by Dr. Hertz as follows: The simulator evaluation has 30 measurement opportunities and they are measured on a four point scale from “highly effective” to “unsafe”. Points are assigned to each of the areas and the evaluators add their scores and the average of those is the scoring method for each of the measurement opportunities. The final score is the basis of the summation of the average scores on the 30 opportunities. Because each section of the examination is equally weighted at 50%, there are 150 multiple choice questions and a maximum of 60 points that can be obtained in the simulator evaluation, there needs to be a linear transformation to place them on the same scale. It’s a similar process as calculating a Z score so that the numbers have the same meaning; and because the scale is so broad it needs to be equated. The motion carried.
- Set the Minimum Passing Score for the Simulator Evaluation: Dr. Hertz stated that the cut score for the simulator evaluation should be set after the simulator evaluations have been completed in order to take full benefit of the events that occur during the exam. Four days of simulator evaluations will run from October 27-30. Chairman Harry Dudley called for a special meeting to be held on October 31<sup>st</sup> at 2:00 p.m. for purposes of setting the minimum passing score for the simulator evaluation. It was also determined that possible actions relative to the training program may also be necessary. The Special Meeting will be preceded by a Closed Session to review trainee evaluations and discuss matters relative to the pilot examination.
- Consider Other Matters Relative to the Pilot Examination as Necessary: Based on 28 applicants moving on to the simulator evaluation, the cost per applicant will be calculated and each applicant notified.

There being no further business to come before the Board, the Chairman adjourned the special session Board meeting at 1:40 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

---

Peggy Larson, Administrator

---

Harry H. Dudley, Chairman

---

Charles M. Davis, Vice Chairman

---

Commissioner Oliver E. Mackey

---

Commissioner Patrick M. Hannigan

---

Commissioner William H. Snyder

---

Commissioner Vincent Addington

---

**Absent**  
Commissioner Craig W. Lee

---

Commissioner Norman W. Davis

---

**Absent**  
Commissioner Elsie J. Hulsizer