

# HISTORICAL ANALYSIS – Comparison... *The New Deal and the Great Society*

## From the 2015 Revised Framework:

### COMPARE & CONTRAST...

1. Compare diverse perspectives represented in primary and secondary sources in order to draw conclusions about one or more historical events.
2. Compare different historical individuals, events, developments, and/ or processes, analyzing both similarities and differences in order to draw historically valid conclusions. Comparisons can be made across different time periods, across different geographical locations, and between different historical events or developments within the same time period and/ or geographical location.

*How does the POV of the two cartoons at right summarize similarities and differences between the two programs?*



## From the Period 7 Content Outline:

**Key Concept 7.1:** Growth expanded opportunity, while economic instability led to new efforts to reform U.S. society and its economic system.

III. During the 1930s, policymakers responded to the mass unemployment and social upheavals of the **Great Depression** by transforming the U.S. into a **limited welfare state**, redefining the goals and ideas of modern **American liberalism**.

- A) **Franklin Roosevelt's New Deal** attempted to end the **Great Depression** by using government power to provide **relief** to the poor, stimulate **recovery**, and **reform** the American economy.
- B) **Radical, union, and populist movements** pushed Roosevelt toward more extensive efforts to change the American economic system, while **conservatives** in Congress and the Supreme Court sought to limit the New Deal's scope.
- C) Although the **New Deal** did not end the Depression, it left a **legacy of reforms** and **regulatory agencies** and fostered a **long-term political realignment** in which many ethnic groups, **African Americans**, and **working-class communities** identified with the **Democratic Party**.

## From the Period 8 Content Outline:

**Key Concept 8.2:** New movements for **civil rights** and **liberal efforts** to **expand the role of government** generated a range of **political and cultural responses**.

III. **Liberalism** influenced **postwar politics** and **court decisions**, but it came under **increasing attack** from **the left** as well as from a **resurgent conservative movement**.

- A) **Liberalism**, based on **anticommunism** abroad and a firm belief in the **efficacy of government** power to achieve **social goals** at home, reached a high point of **political influence** by **mid-1960s**.
- B) **Liberal ideas** found expression in **Lyndon Johnson's Great Society**, which attempted to use **federal legislation** and **programs** to end **racial discrimination**, **eliminate poverty**, and address other **social issues**. A series of **Supreme Court decisions** expanded **civil rights** and **individual liberties**.
- C) In the **1960s**, **conservatives** challenged **liberal laws and court decisions** and perceived **moral and cultural decline**, seeking to **limit the role of the federal government** and enact more assertive **foreign policies**.
- D) Some groups on **the left** also rejected **liberal policies**, arguing that **political leaders** did too little to transform the **racial and economic status quo** at home and pursued **immoral policies** abroad.
- E) **Public confidence and trust** in **government's ability to solve social and economic problems** declined in the **1970s** in the wake of **economic challenges**, **political scandals**, and **foreign policy crises**.
- F) The **1970s** saw growing **clashes between conservatives and liberals** over **social and cultural issues**, the **power of the federal government**, **race**, and **movements for greater individual rights**.

## Comparing and Contrasting *The New Deal and the Great Society*

### Thematic Learning Objectives From the 2015 Revised Framework:

**POL-1.0:** Explain how and why political ideas, beliefs, institutions, party systems, and alignments have developed and changed.

**POL-2.0:** Explain how popular movements, reform efforts, and activist groups have sought to change American society and institutions.

**POL-3.0:** Explain how different beliefs about the federal government’s role in U.S. social and economic life have affected political debates and policies.

**Directions/Prompt:** Compare and contrast Franklin Roosevelt’s New Deal and Lyndon Johnson’s Great Society by explaining how their beliefs and policies affected American society, the role of the federal government, and political alignments. Add your analysis/notes in the space provided. **Highlight key terms** and **underline each time you address the ABC** (three categories outlined in the prompt) and each time you **address the extent to which they were similar or different**. Some entries have been completed for you. Use these as models for what complete entries/analysis should look like.

Area of Reform	FDR's New Deal	LBJ's Great Society	<i>For each reform, explain how</i> FDR & LBJ's beliefs and policies <b>affected</b> American Society, the role of the federal government, or political alignments as well as noting the extent to which they were similar or different.
Social Welfare	<p><b>Social Security Act, 1935</b></p> <p>Aid to Dependent Children, 1939</p>	<p>Economic Opportunity Act, 1964 which created: Office of Economic Opportunity, Head Start, VISTA</p> <p><b>Medical Care Act, 1965 (Medicare and Medicaid)</b></p>	<p><b>FDR:</b></p> <p><b>LBJ:</b></p> <p><b>Were they more similar or different?</b></p>
Labor	<p>Section 7 of NIRA, 1933</p> <p><b>Wagner Act, 1935</b></p> <p>National Labor Relations Board (set up by Wagner Act), 1935</p> <p><b>Fair Labor Standards Act, 1938</b></p>	<p>Minimum Wage Act, 1966</p>	<p><b>FDR:</b></p> <p><b>LBJ:</b></p> <p><b>Were they more similar or different?</b></p>

Area of Reform	FDR's New Deal	LBJ's Great Society	For each reform, explain how FDR & LBJ's beliefs and policies affected American Society, the role of the federal government, or political alignments as well as noting the extent to which they were similar or different.
Gender Equality	No direct acts (but he did nominate first woman to cabinet position, Francis Perkins and First Lady Eleanor fought for women's rights)	Civil Rights Act, 1964	<p><b>FDR:</b> policies did increase opportunity for women but did not significantly impact American society because under NRA, there was a lower minimum wage for women, only 7% of CWA workers were female, and none in CCC. Majority of Americans (and the President) saw the Depression as crisis for bread winners (men).</p> <p><b>LBJ:</b> policies increased opportunities for women as well as changed the role of the federal government because the Civil Rights Act of 1964 banned discrimination based on gender (as well as race) [FYI... JFK also addressed this with the- Equal Pay Act, 1963 which ended gender gap in wages under FDR's Fair Labor Standards Act]</p> <p><b>Were they more similar or different?</b> Although both the New Deal and Great Society addressed gender discrimination by increasing opportunities for women, LBJ was more responsible for change than FDR. Therefore they were similar to a small extent. Although these presidents did support legislation that addressed gender, women like Eleanor Roosevelt, Alice Paul, and Betty Friedan did most of the work to push the issues to the forefront of government.</p>
Immigration; Aliens; Citizens of Foreign Descent	<p>Repatriation of Mexican citizens, 1929-1937</p> <p>Tydings-McDuffie Act, 1934</p> <p>Bracero Program, 1942</p>	<p>Civil Rights Act, 1964</p> <p>Immigration Act, 1965</p>	<p><b>FDR:</b> FDR's policies were in line with long held nativist beliefs and policies so not a big impact on American society because even though in some areas, Mexican-Americans got jobs through New Deal, 500,000 Mexicans deported, Mexican Repatriation (60% were American citizens). After WWII began, demand for labor led to Bracero Program and many of them returned. 20% of Asian immigrants went back to Asia. Japanese-Americans got around the law preventing them from owning land by putting land in the name of the American born children. West Coast racism cut Asian workers out of many employment opportunities. (Chinese-Americans worse off than the Japanese-Americans). Chinese immigrants were classified as "aliens ineligible for citizenship" so couldn't benefit from New Deal programs. Filipinos were from an American territory so they were not impacted by immigration quotas from 1920s and found jobs but after Tydings-McDuffie Act of 1934 they were once again classified as "aliens" and were cut off from New Deal programs.</p> <p><b>LBJ:</b></p> <p><b>Were they more similar or different?</b></p>

Area of Reform	FDR's New Deal	LBJ's Society	Great For each reform, explain how FDR & LBJ's beliefs and policies affected American Society, the role of the federal government, or political alignments as well as noting the extent to which they were similar or different.
Civil Rights for African Americans and American Indians	Indian Reorganization Act, 1934  "Black Cabinet"	Civil Rights Act, 1964  24 <sup>th</sup> Amendment, 1964  Voting Rights Act, 1965	<p><i>FDR: For Blacks - minimally successful in bettering American society because still facing largest numbers of poverty and unemployment. Black jobs in CCC were segregated. Social Security Act and Wagner Act excluded domestic and agricultural jobs held by most Blacks. FDR refused to sign federal anti-lynching bill. The AAA helped White landowners and neglected the Black sharecroppers. However under WPA 18% of jobs for Blacks (were only 10% of population) and the Resettlement Administration protected the rights of Black farmers. Majority of Blacks voted for FDR and remain loyal to the Democratic Party today; affecting political alignment. FDR's "Black Cabinet" employed people like Mary McLeod Bethune who advised the President but he never took bold action for fear of losing Southern votes and support for other New Deal programs. For American Indians -the IRA ended forced assimilation and helped restore tribal ownership, although American Indians were still pretty much controlled by government; the role of the federal government remained constant - controlling Indian Reservations and maintaining their dependence on the government. Most Indians lived on Reservations.</i></p> <p><b>LBJ:</b></p> <p>Were they more similar or different?</p>



Area of Reform	FDR's New Deal	LBJ's Great Society	<i>For each reform, explain how</i> FDR & LBJ's beliefs and policies <b>affected</b> American Society, the role of the federal government, or political alignments as well as noting the extent to which they were similar or different.
Environment	Tennessee Valley Authority, 1933  Civilian Conservation Corps, 1933  Soil Conservation and Domestic Allotment Act, 1933	Wilderness Preservation Act, 1964  Air and Water Quality Acts, 1965	<p><b>FDR:</b></p> <p><b>LBJ:</b></p> <p><i>[FYI... Nixon signed more acts than these two... National Environmental Policy Act, Created the EPA, Clean Air Act, Marine Mammal Protection Act, Safe Drinking Water Act, Endangered Species Act]</i></p> <p><b>Were they more similar or different?</b></p>
Housing and Urban Development	Rural Electrification Administration, 1935  Home Owners Loan Corporation, 1933  Federal Housing Act, 1934  Federal Housing Administration (created by FHA), 1934  Housing Act of 1937, 1937	Urban Mass Transportation Act, 1964  Omnibus Housing Act, 1964  Housing and Urban Development Act, 1965  Metropolitan Area Redevelopment and Demonstration Cities Acts, 1966	<p><b>FDR:</b></p> <p><b>LBJ:</b></p> <p><b>Were they more similar or different?</b></p>



## Comparing and Contrasting *The New Deal and the Great Society*

**Debrief:** After analyzing the similarities and differences between Franklin Roosevelt's New Deal and Lyndon B. Johnson's Great Society, what is your general conclusion? Are they more alike or more different? Did you address all three categories (effects of policies) in your analysis? If not, go back and address what is missing.

**Thesis:** Address the prompt by writing a complete introduction using your formula! This should be several sentences. ATFP = Address The Full Prompt... Make sure you do more than restate the prompt! Make sure you address everything... Make sure you are clear on the skill being tested!

Compare and contrast Franklin Roosevelt's New Deal and Lyndon Johnson's Great Society by explaining how their beliefs and policies affected American society, the role of the federal government, and political alignments.

