

# Argumentation & Document Interpretation & Synthesis... *Cherokee Removal*

## From the 2015 Revised Framework:

Students will be able to..

### **ANALYZE EVIDENCE...**

1. Explain the relevance of the author's point of view, author's purpose, audience, format or medium, and/or historical context as well as the interaction among these features, to demonstrate understanding of the significance of a primary source.
2. Evaluate the usefulness, reliability, and/ or limitations of a primary source in answering particular historical questions.

### **INTERPRET DOCUMENTS...**

1. Analyze a historian's argument, explain how the argument has been supported through the analysis of relevant historical evidence, and evaluate the argument's effectiveness.
2. Analyze diverse historical interpretations.

### **SYNTHESIZE...**

1. Make connections between a given historical issue and related developments in a different historical context, geographical area, period, or era, including the present.
2. Make connections between different course themes and/or approaches to history (such as political, economic, social, cultural, or intellectual) for a given historical issue.

*This skill will be tested on the DBQ as well as the SAQ section. At least one of your short answer question sets will have two viewpoints/documents. The DBQ will have seven documents.*

## From the 2015 Revised DBQ Rubric:

**Argument Development** – 1 Point:

Develops and supports a cohesive argument that recognizes and accounts for historical complexity by explicitly illustrating relationships among historical evidence such as contradiction, corroboration, and/or qualification.

## From the Period 4 Content Outline:

**Key Concept 4.3:** The U.S. interest in increasing foreign trade and expanding its national borders shaped the nation's foreign policy and spurred government and private initiatives.

- I. Struggling to create an independent global presence, the United States sought to claim territory throughout the North American continent and promote foreign trade.
  - A) Following the Louisiana Purchase, **the United States government sought influence and control over North America and the Western Hemisphere through a variety of means**, including exploration, military actions, **American Indian removal**, and diplomatic efforts such as the Monroe Doctrine.
  - B) Frontier settlers tended to champion expansion efforts, while American Indian resistance led to a sequence of wars and federal efforts to control and **relocate American Indian populations**.

**Additional notes:** [USHistory.org](http://USHistory.org) summary of Indian Removal

# Argumentation & Document Interpretation & Synthesis... *Cherokee Removal*

Reminder on synthesizing secondary sources → Such a task requires an appreciation of historiography and realizing that history isn't necessarily what happened in the past. It is our perception of what happened in the past. The story changes as perspectives change, but the goal is the same: to better understand the past. As you analyze sources, consider the perspective of the author, but also consider your own viewpoint.

## 1600's Providential History

Writers wrote about history in terms of man's relationship with God

- History is a chronicle of God's Providence toward his Chosen People
- Success is due to God's blessings, disaster due to His rebukes
- America replaced Britain as God's model of Christian virtue

## 1700's Rationalist History

Writers began describing history in terms of nature or secularism.

- Natural Law dominated the approach as Divine Providence decreased
- Reason and logic explained things
- Self interest, not piety, became the force of man's actions

## 1800s (mid to late) Nationalist History

Writers focus on progress, liberty, and Anglo-Saxon destiny in a more romantic way

- Anglos triumph over others as destiny in order to spread freedom

## 1900's (early) Progressive History

Writers focus on power struggles and the development of democracy.

- History as a series of struggles between the Haves and Have Nots
- The people must fight the elite
- Freedom, democracy, capitalism, are solutions to conflict

## 1940's – 1980's Consent and Consensus History

Writers focus on shared ideas of the people rather than conflict

- Americans are united in their love of freedom
- History is evolution of ideas, beliefs, motivations
- Politics are in the center and really not as divided as once thought
- Capitalism is to be celebrated

## 1950's – Present Conservative History

Writers focus on history serving as a moral guide.

- History is more about people than events
- Heroes should be celebrated
- Natural law governs events

## 1960's-1970's New Left History

Writers focus on the parts of American history that have been overlooked.

- History should expose violence, racism, oppression.
- America is not a melting pot
- Individualists and rebels should be celebrated
- 

## 1980's – present People's History

Writers focus on common people.

- History should be derived from primary sources like diary entries, letters
- Conflict is cultural, not moral or economic
- The ongoing struggle in America is trying to figure out how to live
- History should serve to help people better understand each other
- Global perspective is needed

**CONSIDER HISTORIOGRAPHY WHEN COMPARING THE TWO SOURCES ON THE NEXT PAGE!**

# Argumentation & Document Interpretation & Synthesis... *Cherokee Removal*

**Directions:** Read the two passages and consider historiography, context, authorship, audience, purpose and point of view. Then, answer the short answer questions in complete sentences. Label your answers a.-b.-c. Remember you must go BEYOND THE OBVIOUS and incorporate your outside knowledge in your analysis. Do not quote the documents and do not simply describe them.

[see page IN15 of John P. Irish's book, *Historical Thinking Skills; A Workbook for U.S. History* for the two documents used in this activity]

- a. Briefly explain ONE way Helen Hunt Jackson's point of view differs from that of E. Merton Coulter.
- b. Briefly explain ONE specific piece of outside information (evidence independent from document) that would support Jackson's position.
- c. Briefly explain ONE specific piece of outside information (evidence independent from document) that would support the Coulter's position.