

Promoting Institutional and Scholarly Capacity for ECD in Sub-Saharan Africa

This report provides background to and results from the Early Childhood Development African Tertiary Survey:

A partnership between the Association for the Development of Education in Africa-Working Group on Early Childhood Development (ADEA-WGECD), UNESCO/BREDA and the University of Victoria (UVic), Early Childhood Development Virtual University (ECDVU).

Final Activity Report

A. Description and Background

The impetus for this project grew out of a convergence of interests and undertakings by various organizations regarding the further development of Early Childhood Education, Care and Development in Sub-Saharan Africa. One facet for accomplishing this objective is to increase both the capacity of tertiary institutions to play key innovative and supportive roles in the evolution of integrated Early Childhood Development (ECD) in their country, and the ability of individual scholars to expand Africa's contributions to the international ECD and child development literature while enhancing country and regional research. It was critical, therefore, to determine the existing institutional ECD programmes and capacities and to identify key institutions and scholars that could move this agenda forward.

In early 2009 discussions between Dr. Aster Haregot of UNICEF's Eastern and Southern Africa Region (ESAR) and Dr. Alan Pence (UVic-ECDVU) resulted in a collaboration that produced a survey which asked respondents to identify undergraduate and graduate programmes in Early Childhood Education, Care and Development (ECD/ECCD/ECE) within tertiary institutions in their country, as well as scholars with an interest and expertise in the field. The survey was sent to 29 countries in sub-Saharan Africa (including 7 countries in the Western and Central Africa Region (WCAR) that had participated in the ECDVU programme). A total of 25 countries responded to the survey providing the basis for a 2.5-day planning workshop in Lusaka, Zambia in July 2010. The workshop, held in conjunction with the International Society for the Study of Behavioural Development (ISSBD) Biennial International Congress, was facilitated by Drs. Alan Pence (Director of ECDVU and Professor, University of Victoria) and Jophus Anamuah-Mensa (Professor and former Vice Chancellor of the University of Education-Winneba, Ghana)

and involved 22 English-speaking participants (from 15 institutions in 12 countries) plus 6 UNICEF representatives. The results of the survey for the ESAR¹ are provided in Appendix 1.

Following the success of the Lusaka workshop Dr. Pence held discussions with Mme. Rokhaya Diawara of UNESCO-BREDA and the ADEA-WGECD in November 2010. It was agreed that the extension of the tertiary institutions survey further into WCA would complement the stated objectives of UNESCO/BREDA; the ADEA-WGECD 2011-2012 Work Plan (specifically Strategic Objective 3); the mission of the UNESCO Chair for Early Childhood Education, Care and Development (Dr. Pence); and the work of the ECDVU and, therefore, an agreement was finalized in late November 2011.

The specific goals were to: (1) gather similar data, using the ESAR survey instrument, concerning existing ECD tertiary capacity for as many of the remaining countries in Sub-Saharan Africa as possible; (2) identify programmes that sought to develop, expand or were in the process of expanding; and (3) highlight institutions and individuals to participate in a second Scholars and Institutions workshop relevant for WCA.

An English version of the tertiary survey was provided to UNESCO-BREDA and the WGECD on December 1, 2011, translated into French, and circulated to the WGECD focal points for the first time on January 10, 2012. During the next five months a number of follow up requests were made in an attempt to maximize the return rate and to clarify the information provided. In April 2012 (following discussions at an ADEA-WGECD meeting in Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso), Dr. Yumiko Yokozeki of UNICEF-WCAR agreed to assist by ensuring the survey was sent to the appropriate UNICEF regional offices for countries that had not yet replied.

The detailed data obtained from the WCA² survey activities to May 31 (the cut-off deadline for this report) has been collated in Appendix 2³ to this report.

¹ The list of ESA countries was obtained from UNICEF at <http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/esaro.html>, last retrieved May 10, 2012. Although Mauritius does not appear on the UNICEF list of ESAR offices, survey results were received and, because of its geographic location, Mauritius has been included in the data and statistical analysis for the ESAR. Djibouti and Reunion Island are not on the list of UNICEF ESAR offices either, but since no survey results were received for them, they are not included in the data and statistical analysis for the ESAR.

² The list of WCA countries was obtained from UNICEF at http://www.unicef.org/wcaro/Countries_1829.html, last retrieved May 10, 2012.

³ Since survey data was provided at different times, the survey summaries indicate when the information regarding a country was last updated.

B. Survey return rates

The overall ESA response rate to May 31, 2012 was 18 out of 23 (78%) and, by official European language, response rates were as follows⁴:

Anglophone ⁵ :	15 of 15 (100%)
Francophone:	1 of 2 (50%)
Lusophone:	2 of 2 (100%)
Other ⁶ :	0 of 4 (0%)

The overall WCA response rate to May 31, 2012 was 19 out of 24 (79%) and, by official European language, response rates were as follows⁷:

Anglophone:	7 of 7 (100%)
Francophone:	11 of 13 (85%)
Lusophone:	1 of 3 (33%)
Other:	0 of 1 (0%)

C. Summary of ESA survey results⁸

This section summarizes the information provided by respondents to the surveys that were distributed to ESA countries. (The primary European language(s) used in each country has been identified in brackets: English, French, Portuguese)

a. Countries with post-secondary ECE/ECD⁹ programme(s) in place:

1. **Angola (P):** Dom Bosco offers a 4 year ECD Caregivers programme and the new Instituto Superior de Serviço Social had a Masters in Early Childhood Caregiving under development in 2010.

⁴ The responses for countries with more than one official language (as determined primarily by reference to http://www.nationsonline.org/africa_languages.htm) have been included in the language category in which the ECE/ECD specific courses or programmes reported in the survey responses are delivered.

⁵ Given that Rwanda is transitioning from French to English as the official language, Rwanda has been grouped with the Anglophone countries. However, it is not clear from the survey responses whether the courses and programmes offered at the National University of Rwanda (which has historically been bilingual) and the Kigali Institute of Education (which is a relatively young institution founded in 1999) are delivered in English and/or French.

⁶ Comoros and Seychelles are tri-lingual and are included in the 'Other' category along with Somalia and Sudan/South Sudan.

⁷ Although Cameroon is bi-lingual (English and French), all ECD programmes and courses reported in the survey responses are delivered in English so Cameroon has been grouped with the Anglophone countries. Equatorial Guinea, which is bilingual (Spanish and French), has been included in the Other statistics.

⁸ As noted previously, data collection from the ESAR was initiated in 2010 and, while a few countries provided updated information in February 2011 or after, most figures and statements relating to ESA are from 2010.

⁹ Early childhood care and education programs use various acronyms, for example: ECE, ECCE, ECCD and ECD. The acronym ECD (as used by the ECDVU) refers to a more multi-disciplinary approach to early childhood that includes disciplines of health, nutrition, social welfare, psychology and related other departments/disciplines designed to develop a more holistic view of children and children's services. The acronyms used here primarily reflect terms used by various institutions in the survey responses.

2. **Kenya (E):** Kenyatta University offers a diploma in ECCE, a B.Ed. in ECE and an MA, M.Ed. and Ph.D. in Early Childhood Studies; the University of Nairobi has a certificate, diploma and a M.Ed. in ECE and a B.Ed. in Early Childhood and Primary Education (ECPE); and Moi University offers a B.Ed. in ECPE.
3. **Lesotho (E):** Lesotho College of Education has a certificate in ECE and certain departments in the National University of Lesotho (Home Economics, Psychology and Sociology) offer various courses with ECE/ECD content. In addition, the Ministry of Education and Training (ECCD Unit) has plans to have the University introduce an ECE programme that would offer degrees in child related studies.
4. **Mauritius (E¹⁰):** The Mauritius Institute of Education offers a 2 year Certificate of Proficiency in ECE as well as various ECE certificates and diplomas to teachers in its 1 or 2 year part-time programmes.
5. **Mozambique (P):** The Universidade Politecnica; Instituto Superior de Ciencias de Saude, the Unversidade Pedagogica and the Universidade Eduardo Mondland all offer a B.Ed. in ECD.
6. **Namibia (E):** The Namibian College of Open Learning has a 1 year certificate in ECD and has developed a Diploma in Early Childhood and Pre-Primary Education that was launched in April 2012.
7. **Republic of South Africa (E):** Both the University of Pretoria and the University of South Africa (UNISA) have B.Ed., M.Ed. and Ph.D. programmes in ECE/ECD or Early Childhood Intervention; Wits University has a B.Ed. (ECD Specialization) as do the University of Kwa Zulu Natal and Rhodes University. Also, the University of Cape Town is planning to offer a Post Graduate Certificate in Education (PGCE) and the Walter Sisulu University expects to launch an ECE/ECD programme, both in 2012.
8. **Tanzania (E):** The University of Dodoma offers a 3 year ECE programme and the University of Dar es Salaam has a 3 year degree in ECE. As at April 2011 the Open University of Tanzania (OUT) was expecting to launch an ECD Certificate programme in 2011/12. By contrast, no post-graduate ECE/ECD courses are offered in Zanzibar where all teacher training certificate courses were phased out in 2009 and there are now only Diploma courses in primary and secondary education.

¹⁰ Although the constitution of Mauritius makes no mention of an official language and French and Mauritius Creole are more commonly spoken, since the vast majority of ECD programmes and courses reported in the survey are offered in English, Mauritius has been classified as an Anglophone country for purposes of this report.

9. **Uganda (E):** Kyambogo University has a 2 year B.Ed. in ECE and the Nsamizi Training Institute for Social Development is exploring the possibility of a Diploma in ECD. In addition, as of June 2010, there were 83 privately run ECD training institutions offering Certificates in ECD. The Ministry of Education and Sports was in the process of validating them based on set criteria and expected that a number of them would be accredited shortly.
 10. **Zambia (E):** Zambia Open University has a Bachelors of ECE and the University of Zambia offers B.Ed., M.Ed. and M.A. courses in its Psychology and Education departments as well as a Ph.D. in the Education department with various courses in those programmes having ECE/ECD content.
 11. **Zimbabwe (E):** The University of Zimbabwe is associated with a number of colleges in the country which offer a 3 year diploma in ECD. Eleven of twelve Primary Teacher Colleges in the country offer training in ECD to teachers. In addition, the Faculty of Education has B.Ed. and Masters programmes in Early Childhood Education, Primary Education and Technical Education¹¹ and a Ph.D. programme in Education Research. The Great Zimbabwe University has B.Ed. programmes in ECD and Primary Education and has offered a Masters in Educational Foundations in the past.
- b. Countries with post-secondary ECE/ECD programme(s) planned or considered:**
1. **Botswana (E):** As at February 2011 the University of Botswana had developed a Bachelors programme in ECD (which was in the process of being approved) and a Masters in ECE under development. Other institutions in the country offer 1 year certificates.
 2. **Ethiopia (E):** As at February 2011 Addis Ababa University had draft undergraduate, graduate and Ph.D. curriculum ready for discussion with stakeholders with the hope that the graduate programme might be launched in 2011/2012.
 3. **Malawi (E):** In 2010 the University of Malawi, Chancellor College submitted an ECD Postgraduate Diploma proposal to UNICEF for funding. In addition, the departments of Home Economics, Psychology and Sociology offer various courses with ECE content and Masters students in Curriculum Studies can focus on ECD related topics.

¹¹ Technical Education focuses on nutrition, family care and health, children's wear (design and technology) and family management and economics.

4. **Rwanda (E):** As at February 2011 both a Diploma and a B.Ed. in ECD had been developed by the Kigali Institute of Education with the first cohort scheduled to commence in the fall of that year. A M.Ed. programme has also been developed but the launch will be deferred until sometime after the undergraduate programmes become operational. The National University of Rwanda does not have an ECD programme per se, but the School of Public Health offers various courses with ECD content.
 5. **Swaziland (E):** As at June 2010 the University of Swaziland was in the process of considering a proposal for a B.Ed. in ECE.
- c. Countries with some post-secondary ECE/ECD related courses or course content but no known ECE/ECD specific programme:**
1. **Burundi (F):** The University of Burundi Faculty of Psychology and Education Sciences offers courses in which certain aspects of child development are addressed.
 2. **Eritrea (E):** The Eritrea Institute of Technology Educational Psychology department offers various courses with content relating to children.
- d. Countries that responded to the questionnaire indicating no known post-secondary ECE/ECD courses or programmes:**
- None
- e. Countries that did not respond to the survey:**
- In spite of best efforts, it was not possible to obtain completed surveys from the following ESA countries:
1. Comoros (Comorian, Arabic & F)
 2. Madagascar (F)
 3. Seychelles (Seychellois Creole, E & F)
 4. Somalia (Somali)
 5. South Sudan and Sudan (Arabic)

D. Summary of WCA survey results

This section summarizes the information provided by respondents to the surveys that were distributed to WCA countries. (The primary European language(s) used in each country has been identified in brackets: English, French, Lusophone/Portuguese and Spanish.)

a. Countries with post-secondary ECE/ECD programme(s) in place:

1. **Cameroon (E¹² & F):** The Teachers' College of the University of Yaounde has a Grad Diploma in Teacher Education with a specialty in Pre-School Education; the University of Buea has a B.Ed. in Nursery and Primary Education; and Bamenda University has developed a B.Ed. in ECCE which will commence at a future date.
2. **Côte d'Ivoire (F):** The National Institute of Social Education's Department of Early Childhood Education offers a 3 year diploma and the Pre-school Education Department has several courses focusing on children and childhood. There is also a private university (Louis de Montesquieu) looking to create an ECD programme.
3. **Ghana (E):** The University of Education, Winneba offers undergraduate diplomas and degrees in ECCD; the University of Cape Coast calendar shows 3 undergraduate courses with an ECCD focus and several other universities in the country have undergraduate diploma courses of 2-3 years duration.
4. **Nigeria (E):** The University of Ibadan offers a Diploma, B.Ed., M.A. and Ph.D. in ECE. A post-graduate diploma in ECD was approved in 2012 in partnership with ECDVU for high level stakeholders who need knowledge and skills in ECD for effectiveness in policy development, advocacy and implementation and, as at February 2011, a collaboration had been established with the departments of Social Science and Human Nutrition to offer some undergraduate ECD courses to reflect the multi-sectoral nature of ECD. The University of Lagos has a new ECE bachelor degree with 600 students registered as well as established M.Ed. and Ph.D. programmes in ECE. In addition, Obafemi Awolowo University in Ile-Ife offers B.Ed. and M.A. programs, and a very recently approved Ph.D. programme in ECE. Several colleges (typically undergraduate Teacher Training Colleges) in Nigeria offer ECCE Certificate programmes and many others are in the process of developing such programmes to support the implementation of the Nigerian policy decision (2006) to add pre-primary programmes to primary schools throughout the country.
5. **Sierra Leone (E):** The University of Sierra Leone offers a B.Ed. in ECCE and Njala University offers B.Ed. programmes in Nursery Education and Primary School Education in their teaching department.

¹² Although Cameroon is bilingual (English and French) all of the institutions reported in the survey deliver their courses and programmes in English.

b. Countries with post-secondary ECE/ECD programme(s) planned or considered:

1. **Democratic Republic of Congo (F):** The University of Kinshasa planned an ECE programme that never started. The Universities of Kinshasa, Lubumashi and Bukavu all offer undergraduate and Masters programmes in public health and it appears that all three universities are working toward offering doctoral level programmes in public health as well as other disciplines but not specifically in ECE/ECD.
2. **Guinea-Bissau (P):** Although there is no existing ECE/ECD programme recognized by the government, an undergraduate ECE/ECD programme has been proposed to the Ministry of Education for approval.
3. **Senegal (F):** The University of Cheikh Anta Diop (UCAD) has created a Masters programme in Integrated Development in Early Childhood. The program was originally planned for launch in approximately 2008, but was subsequently postponed. A call for applications is scheduled for early June 2012 and the programme is expected to commence in October 2012. The University also has early childhood expertise in its Psychology and Sociology departments.

c. Countries with some post-secondary ECE/ECD related courses or course content but no known ECE/ECD specific programme:

1. **Benin (F):** The University of Abomey-Calavi has undergraduate and Masters programmes in child psychology and a specialization in kindergarten is offered by the Teacher Training College of Allada.
2. **Burkina Faso (F):** The University of Ouagadougou offers undergraduate and Masters programmes in child psychology and educational psychology and certain courses in those programmes contain ECE/ECD content. The National Training Institute for Social Work trains teachers, monitors and inspectors of education in 2 and 3 year programmes.
3. **Gambia (E):** The University of Gambia has no specific ECD programme but does offer individual ECD courses in various departments. The Gambia Teacher Training College has a module on ECE/ECD in the Primary Teacher Training Programme.
4. **Liberia (E):** There are three main institutions in Liberia (A.M. Dogliotti College of Medicine, Cuttington University College and United Methodist College) that offer general training related to pediatrics, but no specific ECE/ECD courses.
5. **Mali (F):** The University of Bamako offers several human and social development programmes (psychology, sociology, anthropology, educational sciences) at the

undergraduate, Masters and Ph.D. levels. Mali also has a Higher Institute for Training and Applied Research, Teacher Training Colleges (including pre-school education for professionals), and a National Training Institute for Social Workers that offers technical and university courses. Certain of the courses contain aspects relating to early childhood development, but no specific ECE/ECD courses or programmes were identified on the survey.

6. **Togo (F):** The National Institute on Education Sciences in Togo offers several undergraduate, Masters and Ph.D. programmes, but none with a specific ECE/ECD focus.

d. Countries that responded to the questionnaire indicating no known post-secondary ECE/ECD courses or programmes:

1. Central African Republic (F)
2. Chad (F)
3. Congo (Brazzaville) (F)
4. Mauritania (Arabic & F)
5. Niger (F)

e. Countries that did not respond to the survey:

In spite of best efforts, it was not possible to obtain completed surveys from the following WCA countries:

1. Cape Verde (P)
2. Equatorial Guinea (Spanish & F)
3. Gabon (F)
4. Guinea-Conakry (F)
5. Sao Tome and Principe (P).

E. Overview of survey findings

First and foremost there is a profound and sobering difference between the number of institutions offering ECE/ECD programmes in countries in the ESA and WCA regions which is clearly demonstrated by Table I below. Of the ESA countries that responded to the survey, 16 of 18 (89%) deliver or are planning ECD programmes compared to only 8 of 19 (42%) in WCA.

Table I: Overview of Survey Responses by Region

	ECE/ECD programme in place	ECE/ECD programme planned	ECE/ECD courses only	No known ECE/ECD programme or courses	Total
ESARO	11	5	2	0	18
WCARO	5	3	6	5	19
Totals	16	8	8	5	37

When the data is presented by language (as in Table II below), the differences in ECE/ECD capacity at post-secondary institutions between Anglophone, Francophone and Lusophone countries also become apparent.

Table II: Overview of Survey Responses by Language

	ECE/ECD programme in place	ECE/ECD programme planned	ECE/ECD courses only	No known ECE/ECD programme or courses	Total
Anglophone	13 (81%)	5	4	0	22
Francophone	1 (6%)	2	4	5	12
Lusophone	2 (13%)	1	0	0	3
Totals	16 (100%)	8	8	5	37

The following calculations are based on the 37 survey responses displayed in Table II:

- 81% of the countries with ECE/ECD programmes in place are Anglophone (only 6% are Francophone and 13% are Lusophone).
- 82% of Anglophone countries deliver or are planning ECE/ECD programmes compared to 25% of Francophone countries. (Only Côte d'Ivoire reported an established ECE/ECD programme delivered in French; Senegal has a fledgling Masters in ECD that, at the time of writing is being launched; and an ECD programme has been proposed in the Democratic Republic of Congo but has never been delivered.)
- 100% of Anglophone countries reported some ECE/ECD content in their post-secondary institutions. The corresponding statistic for Francophone countries is 58%.

- Two of the five Lusophone countries in SSA, (Madagascar and Mozambique) have established ECD programmes and one (Guinea-Bissau) has an ECD programme proposed. (Cape Verde and Sao Tome and Principe, which make up the balance of the Lusophone countries in SSA, did not respond to the survey.)

F. **Recommendations**

Given the survey work done in the ESAR and the success of the Lusaka workshop, the 2012 survey activities and analysis were primarily undertaken to assess and compare the status of ECE/ECD programmes in tertiary institutions in the WCAR with a view to determining appropriate 'next steps', including whether a Lusaka (ESAR)-like workshop would be of benefit. The ESAR survey indicated, and the agenda for the Lusaka workshop recognized, that several ESAR countries had established ECD programmes and that the institutions and participants in that region would benefit from sharing the experience of developing and offering ECE/ECD programmes and discussing ways to move them forward, including adding Masters and Ph.D. programmes to existing Bachelors degrees.

The latest survey results (2012) suggest that a WCAR based workshop is essential to begin to address the disparity between the regions and that it should focus largely on providing support for Francophone institutions with a primary emphasis on 'why and how to establish ECD tertiary programmes'. Assuming, that most of the participants would be from Francophone countries, this workshop might best be offered in French (as the Lusaka workshop was in English—but with invitations to other language groups, as was the case for Lusaka). In planning for the workshop agenda and facilitators, it will be necessary to take into account the structure of and designations granted by the French-based academic system. It is recommended that the workshop be held in a Francophone country—perhaps in Dakar, Senegal given the accessibility of UNESCO and their role with ADEA/WGECD as a co-sponsor of this latest survey. In addition, it is suggested that at least one key academic from Mauritius be included in the instructional team as Mauritius has a quite well developed system of early childhood services with notable strengths in addressing children with special needs (in addition, it is anticipated that a French speaker can be found for this role). The ECDVU program is a good vehicle to reach a broad range of countries and to stimulate useful interactions across borders—its experiences would be useful for this workshop as well.

G. Preliminary and partial identification of key institutions

Solely on the basis of the survey responses, the following institutions, listed in alphabetical order by country, have been identified as key potential participants for the WCA workshop process because of their experience and interest in offering ECD related courses and programmes and/or their capacity for offering graduate level programmes particularly in related fields such as Education, Psychology, Public Health and Home Economics in French. Institutions that reported graduate level programmes in ECE/ECE or other related disciplines are underlined.

1. Benin: University of Abomey-Calavi
2. Burkina Faso: University of Ouagadougou
3. Côte d'Ivoire: National Institute of Social Education-Department of ECE and possibly the private University (Louis de Montesquieu)
4. Democratic Republic of Congo: University of Kinshasa
5. Mali: University of Bamako
6. Senegal: University of Cheikh Anta Diop
7. Togo: National Institute of Education Sciences

Other institutions from these countries (though not exceeding 2 institutions per country) and from other Francophone countries could be considered for inclusion if they have an interest in and commitment to developing ECD programmes. Invitations might also be extended, for example, to a Francophone institution from Cameroon to support the ECD capacity that country has in English, and to Rwanda and Burundi, even though they are in the ESAR.

H. Preliminary and partial identification of key scholars

In addition to providing information on ECD courses and programmes at post-secondary institutions in-country, survey respondents were asked to identify scholars with a demonstrated interest in ECE/ECCD/ECD or any other child-focused scholarly work such as research, publications and/or conference presentations. One third (8/24) of the WCAR¹³ countries provided such names which have been collated and included in Appendix 3a to this report and key potential workshop invitees have been highlighted. Given limitations in the survey responses, additional effort will need to be made to create a substantive list from which to select appropriate potential workshop participants. In particular it will be important to identify key scholars and/or administrators at the University of Kinshasa (DRC), the

¹³ For completeness, Appendix 3b reflects the scholars identified from the survey conducted in the ESAR.

National Institute of Social Education-Department of ECE (Côte d'Ivoire), and the National Institute of Education Sciences (Togo) if these institutions are to send delegates.

Additional ideas regarding a proposed: agenda; list of invitees; workshop facilitator(s), and sources of funding for participants can be developed as part of the implementation of the recommendations in this report.

I. ECD Tertiary Projects by Regional Economic Commission (REC)

Summaries of the survey results for both the WCA and ESA regions are sorted and presented by REC¹⁴ based on the listing of African Union Regional Communities' Membership as at 02 December 2011 (listed below).

East African Community (EAC) Member states (5) include:

Burundi, Kenya, Rwanda, Tanzania and Uganda

Economic Community of Central African States (ECCAS) Member states (10) include:

Angola, Burundi, Cameroon, Central African Republic, Chad, Congo, Democratic Republic of the Congo, Equatorial Guinea, Gabon and Sao Tome and Principe

Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS) Member states (15) include:

Benin, Burkina Faso, Cape Verde, Cote d'Ivoire, Gambia, Ghana, Guinea, Guinea-Bissau, Liberia, Mali, Niger, Nigeria, Senegal, Sierra Leone and Togo

Intergovernmental Authority on Development (IGAD) Member states (7) include:

Djibouti, Eritrea, Ethiopia, Kenya, Somalia, Sudan and Uganda

Southern African Development Community (SADC) Member states (15) include:

Angola, Botswana, Democratic Republic of the Congo, Lesotho, Madagascar, Malawi, Mauritius, Mozambique, Namibia, Seychelles, South Africa, Swaziland, Tanzania, Zambia and Zimbabwe

¹⁴ Some states are members of more than one REC and, therefore, appear on more than one REC Appendix. Appendices were not created for the following RECs: (1) AMU (Arab Maghreb Union) because Mauritania is the only member state that is not in North Africa and North Africa was not surveyed; (2) CEN-SAD (Community of Sahelo-Saharan States) because its member states are either in North Africa or are already reflected in another REC; and (3) COMESA (Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa) because all member states except Comoros are either in North Africa or are already reflected in another REC and because COMESA does not have an education desk.