

Review of "Inner Behavior: Empirical Investigations of Private Events"

Evaluation of the Conceptual Analysis

Explicit Recommendation

Accept pending revision

Three issues

Calkin seems to focus on three issues:

- "Inner Behavior" a clear choice in terms over "Private Event"
 - Empirical studies exist that answer questions about such behavior
 - Researchers in the area remain unaware of these studies
-

On Terms

"Inner behavior" instead of "private event" represents an important contribution that would upgrade behavior analysis terminology.

- A private event can be something one does when no one else observes, but doesn't clearly distinguish inner behavior from outer behavior.
 - The short form "inners" communicates more precisely than "privates" in a world where shortened forms tend to dominate.
-

Empirical Studies

Calkin summarizes studies unknown or at least uncited in the four paper section of the Spring 2000 issue. She includes seven specific conclusions drawn from these studies that enhance our understanding of:

- behavior
- inner behavior
- relationship between inner and outer behavior

These citations and conclusions provide a useful reply to Anderson et al's contention that there is a "dearth of research and conceptualizations about private events."

Bridging Verbal Communities

Some behavior analysts might resist the term change suggested because:

- Skinner himself labeled inner behaviors as "private events"
- the change originated from Standard Celeration Charting, an approach tolerated but not embraced by all behavior analysts

Calkin has chosen to share her findings with the greater behavior analysis community rather than submit the manuscript to The Journal of Precision Teaching and Celeration, which published some of the studies cited.

Her action can serve as an important bridge between Behavior Analysis and Standard Celeration Charting and the people who "reside" in both verbal communities.

This manuscript points those interested to the relevant research Calkin cites (which has likely been missed if searching under the descriptor "private event").

Evaluation of the Manuscript Presentation

Three issues Make the three issues identified explicit rather than implicit in both the abstract and the introductory paragraph of the manuscript.

On Terms Consider the possibility of the "On Terms" category as opposed to the "In Response" category listed in The Behavior Analyst's "Instructions for Contributors." That action:

- assumes the main issue involves a change in the terms in use
- documents the choice of "inner behavior" over "private event"

Changes

Please consider the following changes.

Location	Replace	With
page 3: "While this may be true of..."	"Duncan counted inner behavior, <u>charted</u> "	"Duncan counted inner behavior, <u>charting</u> "
page 3: "In 1979, Calkin stated..."	Mahoney (1970)	Mahoney (1972) [from reference citation]
page 4: "2) When counted all day..."	Dean, 1973	Dean, 1974 [from reference citation]
page 4: "Classification... available" [quote]	"Classification should be based on the best natural science available"	"Any classification of private events should be based on the best natural science evidence available." (direct quote wording)
page 4: "Classification should...inductive data."	by deleting "also reflects...natural science: inductive data."	
page 4: " <u>The collection...data.</u> "	by deleting	
page 5: "Those are charts of depression."	" <u>Those are charts of depression.</u> "	" <u>These charts all represent the monitoring of depressive behavior.</u> "
page 5: "This non-scientific statement..."	statement, substantiates	statement substantiates [delete comma]
page 5: "However, while...issues, etc."	<u>PTSD</u>	<u>Post Traumatic Stress Disorder</u>
page 5: "Further, if, as..."	" <u>Further, if, as...clients and students?</u> "	affirmation rather than a question.

Continued on next page

Evaluation of the Manuscript Presentation, Continued

Changes, continued

Location	Replace	With
page 6: "Keller and Schoenfeld..."	<u>"urged other practitioners to study"</u>	<u>"suggested other practitioners study"</u> (avoids repetition of "urge" in next sentence)
page 6: "For 35 years..."	<u>"...Teachers have counted and changed thoughts, feelings, desires, urges, thus addressing the call to study inner behavior empirically."</u>	<u>"...Teachers have responded to this call by counting and changing thoughts, feelings, desires, and urges."</u>
page 6: "By examining these data..."	"By <u>examining</u> these data..."	"By <u>including</u> these data..."

Additions

Please consider the following additions:

Location	Insert
Front of manuscript	an abstract
page 5: Three charts indicate mood induction..."	A definition of mood induction and what would constitute a "mood induction procedure," e.g., a one minute timing on self-affirmations.
page 5: Another person (spring 2000)	<i>How does one cite something such as this where the individual's identity needs to be protected? Another person (Anonymous, spring 2000)</i>
page 7: Cooper, J.O., Kubina, R. M., & Malanga, P. (1998).	article title: Six procedures for showing of Standard Celeration Charts.

Statement by Reviewer Steve Graf

I recognize the manuscript as the work of Abigail Calkin.
I have known Abigail since 1981.
I regard Abigail as an esteemed professional colleague.
I have no difficulty in providing a review of her manuscript because I know
Abigail accepts the intent of the feedback as both loving and quality directed.
