

Analyzing Evidence... Slavery and Religion in the Colonies

From the 2012 Original Framework

Historical thinking involves the ability to **describe and evaluate evidence** about the past from diverse sources (including written documents, works of art, archaeological artifacts, oral traditions, and other primary sources) and requires the students to pay attention to the content, authorship, purpose, format, and audience of such sources. It involves the capacity to **extract useful information**, make **supportable inferences**, and **draw appropriate conclusions** from historical evidence, while also **noting the context** in which the evidence was produced and used, recognizing its limitations and assessing the points of view it reflects. Students are expected to analyze features of historical evidence such as audience, purpose, point of view, format, argument, limitations, and context germane to the evidence considered... and based on analysis and evaluation of historical evidence, make supportable inferences and draw appropriate conclusions.

From the 2015 Revised Framework:

Historical Thinking Skill Category: Analyzing Historical Sources and Evidence – Primary and Secondary Sources

Historical Thinking Skill: Analyzing Evidence: Content and Sourcing (Primary Source Analysis)

Historical thinking involves the ability to describe, select, and evaluate relevant evidence about the past from diverse sources (including written documents, works of art, archaeological artifacts, oral traditions, and other primary sources) and draw conclusions about their relevance to different historical issues.

From the 2015 Revised DBQ rubric:

Explains the significance of the **author's point of view, author's purpose, historical context, and/or audience** for at least four documents (1 of 7 possible points)

Note to Teachers: If you combine the revisions with the rubric, you will notice the skill and assessment of skill have not truly changed. The purpose of the revision was not to necessarily change the skill or course but to *clarify* the skill for both teachers and students. The purpose of this activity is to introduce the skill of analyzing evidence to students while also providing practice for skill development. This type of activity is typically used in my classroom as a collaborative activity following student reading and brief class discussion of main ideas. My approach is to maximize time for student processing and analysis while minimizing time lecturing and “spoon-feeding” information to students. Success in this course requires much more than just memorizing facts, and lecture often yields little more than memorization and regurgitation.

A Note to Students about Analyzing Historical Evidence Appropriately

In our study of U.S. history, we will be examining and analyzing many primary sources. The ability to effectively incorporate document analysis into historical essays will be a major component of the AP exam (Document Based Question), and the ability to make inferences and draw conclusions will be necessary when answering many short answer questions and most multiple choice questions as most will have some sort of primary or secondary source stimulus.

In addition to increasing our knowledge of history and gaining evidence that could aid in defense of a thesis, we will be analyzing documents to find the HIPP. This is an acronym you will need to memorize! These steps will allow you to construct concise analysis and gain one or more points on APUSH essays. (Essays will be graded on 7 point scale).

It is important to remember to bring in outside information... don't just rely on what you find in a document!

- H: Historical Context** ... who, what, when, where, how, why? ... understanding the document but also *going beyond* just what is found in document...
- I: Intended Audience** ... to whom is the author speaking?
- P: Purpose** ... what is the author hoping to communicate, gain, accomplish?
- P: Point of View** ... what is the stand/viewpoint of the author?

When you combine your HIPP analysis into one or more complete sentences, remember you are not only explaining the document, you are making inferences and drawing conclusions.

This is the skill College Board refers to as “Analyzing Evidence.”

Directions for Activity:

On the following two pages, you will read and analyze two primary source documents using the HIPP strategy. You are not only identifying the HIPP components, but you are also using your analysis to answer a question. Remember it is not just about analyzing the document... it is also about using your analysis to address a prompt.

A Minute Against Slavery, Addressed to Germantown Monthly Meeting, 1688.

This is to ye Monthly Meeting held at Richard Worrell's.

These are the reasons why we are against the traffick of men-body, as foloweth. Is there any that would be done or handled at this manner? viz., to be sold or made a slave for all the time of his life? How fearful and faint-hearted are many on sea, when they see a strange vessel, - being afraid it should be a Turk, and they should be taken, and sold for slaves into Turkey. Now what is this better done, as Turks doe? Yea, rather it is worse for them, which say they are Christians; for we hear that y^e most part of such negers are brought hither against their will and consent, and that many of them are stolen. Now, ^{tho} they are black, we can not conceive there is more liberty to have them slaves, as it is to have other white ones. There is a saying that we shall doe to all men like as we will be done ourselves; making no difference of what generation, descent or colour they are. And those who steal or robb men, and those who buy or purchase them, are they not all alike? Here is liberty of conscience ^{wch} is right and reasonable; here ought to be liberty of y^e body, except of evil-doers, ^{wch} is an other case. But to bring men hither, or to rob and sell them against their will, we stand against.

In Europe there are many oppressed for conscience sake; and here there are those oppressed ^{wh} are of a black colour. And we who know than men must not comitt adultery, - some do committ adultery, in separating wives from their husbands and giving them to others; and some sell the children of these poor creatures to other men. Ah! doe consider will this thing, you who doe it, if you would be done at this manner? And if it is done according to Christianity? You surpass Holland and Germany in this thing. This makes an ill report in all those countries of Europe, where they hear of, that y^e Quakers doe here handel men as they handel there y^e cattle. And for that reason some have no mind or inclination to come hither. And who shall maintain this your cause, or pleid for it. Truly we can not do so, except you shall inform us better hereof, viz., that Christians have liberty to practise these things. Pray, what thing in the world can be done worse towards us, than if men should rob or steal us away, and sell us for slaves to strange countries; separating husbands from their wives and children. Being now that this is not done in the manner we would be done at therefore we contradict and are against this traffic of men-body. And we who profess that is is not lawful to steal, must, likewise, avoid to purchase such things as are stolen, but rather help to stop this robbing and stealing if possible. And such men ought to be delivered out of y^e hands of y^e robbers, and set free as well as in Europe. Then is Pennsylvania to have a good report, instead it hath now a bad one for this sake in other countries. Especially whereas y^e Europeans are desirous to know in what manner y^e Quakers doe rule in their province; - and most of them doe look upon us with an envious eye. But if this is done well, what shall we say is done evil?

If once these slaves (^{wch} they say are so wicked and stubborn men) should join themselves, - fight for their freedom, - and handel their masters and mastrisses as they did handel them before; will these masters and mastrisses take the sword at hand and warr against these poor slaves, licke, we are able to believe, some will not refuse to doe; or have these negers not as much right to fight for their freedom, as you have to keep them slaves? Now consider will this thing, if it is good or bad? And in case you find it to be good to handle these blacks at that manner, we desire and require you hereby lovingly, that you may inform us herein, which at this time never was done, viz., that Christians have such a liberty to do so. To the end we shall be be satisfied in this point, and satisfie likewise our good friends and acquaintances in our natif country, to whose it is a terror, or fairful thing, that men should be handeld so in Pennsylvania.

Garret Henderich, Derick up de Graeff, Francis Daniell Pastorius, and Abraham up Den

Analyzing Evidence

H: Historical Context

I: Intended Audience

P: Purpose

P: Point of View

Interpretation of Document with H and one of IPP - one complete sentence – addressing the following prompt: *Explain the causes of cultural conflict in the North American colonies.*

Roger Williams (July 15, 1644)

THE BLOODY TENENT OF PERSECUTION

First, that the blood of so many hundred thousand souls of Protestants and Papists, spilt in the wars of present and former ages, for their respective consciences, is not required nor accepted by Jesus Christ the Prince of Peace.

Secondly, pregnant scriptures and arguments are throughout the work proposed against the doctrine of persecution for cause of conscience.

Thirdly, satisfactory answers are given to scriptures, and objections produced by Mr. Calvin, Beza, Mr. Cotton, and the ministers of the New English churches and others former and later, tending to prove the doctrine of persecution for cause of conscience.

Fourthly, the doctrine of persecution for cause of conscience is proved guilty of all the blood of the souls crying for vengeance under the altar.

Fifthly, all civil states with their officers of justice in their respective constitutions and administrations are proved essentially civil, and therefore not judges, governors, or defenders of the spiritual or Christian state and worship.

Sixthly, it is the will and command of God that (since the coming of his Son the Lord Jesus) a permission of the most paganish, Jewish, Turkish, or antichristian consciences and worships, be granted to all men in all nations and countries; and they are only to be fought against with that sword which is only (in soul matters) able to conquer, to wit, the sword of God's Spirit, the Word of God.

Seventhly, the state of the Land of Israel, the kings and people thereof in peace and war, is proved figurative and ceremonial, and no pattern nor president for any kingdom or civil state in the world to follow.

Eighthly, God requireth not a uniformity of religion to be enacted and enforced in any civil state; which enforced uniformity (sooner or later) is the greatest occasion of civil war, ravishing of conscience, persecution of Christ Jesus in his servants, and of the hypocrisy and destruction of millions of souls.

Ninthly, in holding an enforced uniformity of religion in a civil state, we must necessarily disclaim our desires and hopes of the Jew's conversion to Christ.

Tenthly, an enforced uniformity of religion throughout a nation or civil state, confounds the civil and religious, denies the principles of Christianity and civility, and that Jesus Christ is come in the flesh.

Eleventhly, the permission of other consciences and worships than a state professeth only can (according to God) procure a firm and lasting peace (good assurance being taken according to the wisdom of the civil state for uniformity of civil obedience from all forts).

Twelfthly, lastly, true civility and Christianity may both flourish in a state or kingdom, notwithstanding the permission of divers and contrary consciences, either of Jew or Gentile....

Analyzing Evidence

H: Historical Context

Choose one of IPP to complete

I: Intended Audience

P: Purpose

P: Point of View

Interpretation of Document with H and one of IPP - one complete sentence – addressing the following prompt: *Explain the causes of cultural conflict in the North American colonies.*