"Though Not an Irishman": Henry George and the American Irish

By Edward T. O'Donnell

ABSTRACT. One of the most important elements to the rise of Henry George to international prominence in the 1880s was his successful cultivation of a large Irish-American following. This was no small accomplishment, given the fact that George was not Irish Catholic, but rather English-American Protestant. Nonetheless, through his early interest in Ireland's troubles, marriage to Irish Catholic Annie McCloskey Fox, friendship with Patrick Ford and Michael Davitt, activism in the Irish Land League, travels through Ireland during the Land War as a correspondent for the Irish World, and linking the struggle of Irish peasants against economic injustice to a similar struggle of American workers, George developed an enormous Irish-American following. This relationship accounted for much of the early sales of Progress and Poverty and subsequent lecture opportunities, as well as making him known widely throughout the British Isles. The culmination of this phenomenon was George's sensational run for mayor of New York City in 1886.

1

Introduction

Henry George's rise from an obscure editor in San Francisco to an internationally known economist and reformer represents one of the more remarkable stories of the nineteenth century. Formally educated only to age 14, he nonetheless published in 1879 a book that went on to become the century's best-selling work of political economy, Progress and Poverty. In it George examined the "great enigma" of the age: why the increase in material progress of the Industrial Revolution was accompanied by an in-

*Edward T. O'Donnell is Assistant Professor of History at Hunter College, CUNY in New York City. He is currently finishing a social biography of Henry George entitled Henry George and Gilded Age America. He has published articles on Henry George, the Irish-American experience, and labor history in journals such as the Journal of Urban History and numerous anthologies.

crease in poverty. His conclusion—that land monopoly was to blame and that a "single tax" on land values was the solution—drew the attention of economists, labor leaders, politicians, reformers, and the general public in both America and Europe. In 1886, at the height of his fame, he ran (and nearly won) as a Labor party candidate for mayor of New York.

Yet George's eventual emergence as a public figure obscures the fact that in 1879–80 it appeared that few people might ever read his book. For months after its publication, George waited in vain for significant recognition. Undaunted, he made a momentous decision in mid-1880: to move from San Francisco to New York City in search of a larger stage from which to promote his radical reform agenda. There, in the communications, publishing, and media nexus of the nation, George believed Progress and Poverty would reach a larger audience. His intuition proved correct, and within two years of his arrival in New York, he was an international figure. But the city itself was not the only critical factor that accounts for his rise. Of even greater significance was his cultivation of a large Irish-American following.1

By all measures, the task of ingratiating himself to an Irish-American audience would seem daunting, if not impossible. After all, as an English-American Evangelical Protestant reformer from San Francisco and an outspoken advocate of free trade (which the Irish viewed as pro-British), he seemed to have more in common with the Reverend Henry Ward Beecher than with Tammany Hall "boss" John Kelly. Generally such personal characteristics garnered a public figure derision and scorn from Irish-Americans, not a mass following. What then, occurred in George's early years in New York to account for the fact that he managed to attract such wide support among Irish-Americans?

First, long before ever moving to New York City, George demonstrated an interest in the problems that plagued Ireland. In 1869, for example, George served as acting editor for a small Catholic weekly, The Monitor, in which he gave extensive coverage to Ireland's troubled social, economic, and political situation and the struggles of Irish immigrants in San Francisco.2 Years later, just months after completing Progress and Poverty, he accepted an offer from the Sacramento Bee to write an article entitled "The Irish Land Question." Ireland at that moment had just suffered a disastrous harvest, and many feared that famine would once again visit the Emerald Isle.3 Seeing in this agrarian crisis an opportunity to promote the land re-
form program articulated in his recent book, George jumped at the opportunity. Predictably, he concluded that Ireland (and much of the world) suffered from land monopoly and required radical reform. He called for the abolition of landlordism and its attendant inequality, crushing rents, and evictions. In so doing, he expressed the central demands of an emerging nationalist movement in Ireland and the United States known as the Land League. Aware of his potential to reach a sympathetic Irish-American audience, George soon sent 25 copies of Progress and Poverty to a friend in New York to distribute "to the radicals or the leaders of the Irish movement" residing there.4

One of those radicals turned out to be Patrick Ford, a man who would play a central role in developing George's fortuitous relationship with the American Irish. Ford, the founder and editor of the Irish World, the largest-selling Irish-American paper in the Gilded Age, was one of the most influential Irish-Americans of the day. An emigrant from Ireland during the Great Famine, he expressed an interest in radical political thought at an early age. Quite likely this interest stemmed from one of his first jobs: working as a printer's assistant in the offices of William Lloyd Garrison's The Liberator, the leading national organ of radical abolitionism. After service in the Union Army and a brief postwar stint in the South, Ford settled in New York City, where he founded his paper in 1870.5

The establishment of Ford's newspaper represented the coming-of-age of Irish-American thought.6 Before the Civil War, the Irish in America suffered from the stigma of being on the wrong side of all the burning social issues of mid-nineteenth-century America: be it temperance, abolition, or public education. Native-born Protestants attributed this to narrow-minded Catholicism. In reality, the lack of reformist zeal on the part of Irish-Americans came from their observation that the reformers in the 1840s and 1850s invariably were also anti-Catholic, anti-Irish bigots. In the 1870s, the diminishing (though not disappearance) of anti-Irish hostility and the onset of a severe depression (1873–1879) resulted in a growing interest in progressive causes among Irish-Americans. Significantly, the causes that attracted them centered not on traditional areas of genteel reform (e.g., temperance or civil service), but rather greenbackism, antimonopolism, labor unionism, and land reform.7

Leading the way in this exploration of radical ideas and causes was Patrick Ford, with his newspaper. Ford's editorials supported movements for
women's suffrage, an income tax, currency reform, land nationalization, the elimination of monopolies, and the advancement of the cause of organized labor. Not surprisingly, his brand of Irish nationalism reflected his social views. Like George, he advocated both Irish independence and a radical transformation of Irish society. To emphasize this range of concerns beyond parochial Irish or Catholic issues, Ford changed the name of his paper in 1878 from the Irish World to the Irish World and Industrial Literator.

When Ford received his copy of Progress and Poverty in early 1880, he was impressed by the author and his theory of land reform, particularly in light of the growing Irish Land League movement. He gave it a favorable review in his newspaper, and soon thereafter he republished George's "Irish Land Question" essay from the Sacramento Bee.

Aware of this influential figure and his positive disposition to his ideas, George called on Ford immediately after arriving in New York in the fall of 1880. They soon grew to be good friends who consulted and corresponded with each other frequently. George found Ford an inspiration—"He is not a politician but a single hearted devotee to principle"—and "without exception, the most modest man I ever knew." Ford admired George and his reform program and promoted both in the pages of the Irish World. More than any single person, Ford deserves credit for placing the ideas of Henry George before the widest possible audience of Irish-Americans.

George benefited from his relationship with Ford in another crucial way: it allowed him to go beyond his role as a mere commentator on Irish affairs to become an active participant in the Irish nationalist movement. The timing of George's publication of Progress and Poverty (1879) and his move to New York City (1880) coincided with an explosion of Irish nationalist activity, both in Ireland and in America. A number of factors, not the least of which was the agricultural distress gripping the Irish countryside, had combined to bring together three factions of Irish nationalism: Clan na Gaeil, led by John Devoy, which sought Ireland's complete independence by any means (including armed insurrection); the Home Rulers, under Charles Stewart Parnell, who sought through peaceful constitutional means home rule for Ireland (as a first step toward full independence); and a group of progressive nationalists headed by Michael Davitt, who sought, in addition to Irish independence, far-reaching social and economic change, especially land reform. This movement, known as the Land League (1879–1883), spread throughout Ireland and America.11

Within weeks of arriving in New York and meeting Ford, George joined the American Land League.12 George's association with the League, like his publication of the "Irish Land Question," made great sense to him. Land monopoly, he argued, threatened all nations, not just the United States, and the Irish Land League movement appeared poised to eliminate it. Success in Ireland would strengthen George's attempts to redress economic and social problems in America.

By this time, Irish nationalists active in the emerging Land League movement in America took notice of George and sought him out as a speaker. Typical was the letter of James Murphy, who invited him to speak before his Land League chapter because "a number of the members have read your lectures and know of your hearty interest in the Land League." Through opportunities such as this, George soon assumed an important role in the movement.13 In his absence activists often read George's works at their meetings. Spring of 1881 found him traveling through New England, Canada, and upstate New York, drumming up support and raising funds for the league.14

Friendship with Ford and work with the Land League brought George yet another opportunity to establish firm ties to the Irish-American community. Just months after their meeting, Ford introduced George to Michael Davitt, who was then on a fundraising mission to the United States. Born into a poor family in County Mayo, Ireland, in 1846, Davitt became a nationalist at a young age, joining the Fenians and playing a leading role in their ill-fated uprising of 1867. After seven years in prison, Davitt rejoined the nationalist cause. With the birth of the Land League in 1879, he became identified as the head of its progressive faction, which drew its strength from Ireland's masses of poor tenant farmers. Like Henry George and Patrick Ford in America, he advocated sweeping social reform, especially land reform, in addition to independence from Great Britain.15 Davitt was impressed with George's ideas about land reform and their application to Ireland. He took a copy of Progress and Poverty with him and agreed to promote the book in Ireland.16

And promote it he did. Soon after returning to Ireland, Davitt, Parnell, and other leaders of the Land League were arrested and thrown in jail. There Davitt read and reread George's book. When he emerged from prison, he announced, in what became the clearest example of the influence Henry George wielded over the Land League agitation, that he had
been won over to George's advocacy of radical land reform. Davitt's conversion caused a sensation among progressive nationalists, George and Ford among them. It also enraged the more conservative factions of the league, who accused him of being duped by George. In response, Davitt said,

Mr. George, though not an Irishman, has gone to Ireland to help the Irish people. I am, therefore, not going to repudiate a personal friend and a warm and generous-hearted American because the political wisdom of some of my critics declares I have fallen into his hands.

Although Davitt gradually retreated from his call for land nationalization, his initial embrace of it in 1882 lent legitimacy to George's ideas and brought the political economist's name before still more Irish-Americans.

George broadened his following among the Irish through an opportunity presented to him in the fall of 1881. Realizing George's growing popularity among Irish-Americans as well as his personal interest in the application of his ideas to the Irish context, Ford offered to send him to Ireland to cover the Land League agitation for the Irish World. George was elated by the proposal. "Thus the chance I have long waited for opens," he wrote to a friend in San Francisco. "It will be a big thing for me, I think the biggest I have had yet."

Indeed it was. From the fall of 1881 to the fall of 1882, the Irish World carried George's vivid descriptions of landlord abuses, evictions, and general economic inequality in Ireland. The following passage from one of his first dispatches, in December 1881, illustrates well the tone and force of those that followed:

Imagine a government...wielded in the interests of a privileged class infuriated with the fear of losing the power of drawing immense incomes from the toil of others. Imagine all constitutional rights suspended, and the whole country at the mercy of an absolute dictatorship, backed by fifty-thousand bayonets in the hands of foreign troops—a dictatorship for which nothing is too arbitrary and nothing too mean. Imagine elected members of the highest legislative body, the trusted leaders of a political party that embraces nine-tenths of the people, lying in jail, and treated with indignities to which convicted felons in civilized countries are not subjected. Imagine the most respected and public-spirited men in their respective localities dragged off daily to prison, without charge or inquiry, upon lettre de cachet issued by a governmental authority at the suggestion of some landlord or police inspector... Let any American, if he can, imagine a country such as this, and he will get some idea of the condition of Ireland to-day. It is a reign of terror.

Words such as these earned George even greater devotion among progressive nationalists both in Ireland and America. Ford later referred to these dispatches as being "among the most brilliant of the contributions to the Irish political literature of those times." Between dispatches, George used his time in Ireland to deliver speeches outlining his radical land reform plan. He also took the opportunity to meet Parnell and other Land League officials then in prison.

Toward the end of his tour of Ireland, George further added to his reputation among Irish-Americans by getting arrested twice by British authorities while traveling in County Galway in the summer of 1882. After being released a second time, George handed out copies of The Irish Land Question to his arresting officers and the magistrate. The arrests put him in the same company with Parnell, Davitt, and other incarcerated Land League leaders and provoked outrage not only among Irish-Americans, but from the U.S. government as well, necessitating a hasty apology from Her Majesty's government.

George also appealed to the Irish in America because although an evangelical Protestant and reformer, he shunned the anti-Catholicism which, at least in the minds of Irish-Americans, so often characterized such leaders. More important, he established a crucial tie between himself and the Catholicism that for many Irish lay at the heart of their cultural identity. This tie began in late 1861 when he married Annie Fox, a practicing Roman Catholic, whose mother, née McCloskey, was Irish Catholic. They would raise their four children in the Catholic faith. Annie George's sister, Theresa, joined the Sisters of Charity and corresponded regularly with George after they met in 1883. Beyond question, however, the most significant event in the process, came from George's befriending of The Reverend Edward McGlynn, the 'radical priest.'

McGlynn, born of Irish immigrants from Donegal, was pastor of St. Stephen's parish, the largest and poorest in New York City. Long before George's arrival in New York, McGlynn enjoyed a reputation as both a tireless advocate of the poor and an independent priest who sometimes defied the directives of his archbishop. This gained him the undying admiration of his parishioners, who called him their sogarach arbon ('precious priest') and placed him under the watchful eye of the conservative hierarchy.
As work among the poor came to dominate his labors, it began to weigh heavily upon his mind:

I had begun to feel life made a burden by the never-ending procession of men, women and children coming to my door begging so much for alms as for employment; not asking for food, but for my influence and letters of recommendation, and personally appealing to me to obtain for them an opportunity of working for their daily bread. I felt that, no matter how much I might give them, even though I reserved nothing for myself, even though my friends and relatives in debt, I could accomplish nothing. I began to ask myself, "Is there no remedy? Is this God's order that the poor shall be constantly becoming poorer in all our large cities, the world over?"

Henry George asked himself the same questions at virtually the same time and set to work writing *Progress and Poverty*. In 1881 McGlynn received a copy as a gift from a friend who knew of the priest's views. To McGlynn the work appealed to him as "a poem of philosophy, a prophecy and a prayer." Suddenly, he had found the solution to the riddle of why poverty grew worse as the nation experienced remarkable material progress. Overnight McGlynn became George's most zealous champion. Like George, he became active in the American Land League and soon was a popular speaker, constantly promoting George's and Ford's progressive nationalist agenda.

In the fall of 1882, Henry George returned to America an internationally renowned figure. He quickly established contact with McGlynn, and the two took an instant liking to each other. " Already captured by *Progress and Poverty*," remembered McGlynn, "I was now captured by its author." He found in him the characteristics "to be found in men truly great." For George, he quickly "learned to reverence his [McGlynn's] deep and inostentational piety, his broad Catholic spirit, and his devotion to the cause of the poor, to respect his mental grasp and acumen, and to admire a character in which the impulsiveness and warmth of the typical Celt is blended with an iron steadfastness and strength of will." This meeting marked the beginning of a long and fruitful relationship that became a crucial element in George's growing popularity among Irish-American Catholics. As a priest, McGlynn proved vital to George by making clear in the eyes of many Irish-Americans that he was not a typical Anglo-Protestant reformer (i.e., anti-Catholic) and also by deflecting criticisms that his reform ideas were socialistic and anathema to Church teachings.

Unfortunately for McGlynn, his alliance with George drew the attention of both the local archbishop and, more ominously, authorities in Rome. In the late 1870s and 1880s, Church officials on both sides of the Atlantic had grown increasingly concerned about the influence of radicalism on American Catholics, specifically the works of Henry George and the rise of the industrial labor union. The Knights of Labor. Through the valiant work of Cardinal James Gibbons and other liberal members of the American hierarchy, officials in Rome refrained from condemning the Knights of Labor and George's *Progress and Poverty*, thereby avoiding alienating masses of Catholic wage earners. Unfortunately, McGlynn did not fare as well. Because he openly supported George's 1886 bid for mayor of New York City, he was subsequently suspended from his priestly duties and later excommunicated from the Church altogether (although he was reinstated five years later). Nonetheless, for the years leading up to 1886, McGlynn served as one of George's most important links to the American Irish.

Finally, and perhaps most important, George gained a mass following among Irish-Americans for the way he appealed not just to their sentiments as Irish nationalists, but as American workers as well. Overwhelmingly, George derived his support from the poor, wage-earning Irish most buffeted by the Industrial Revolution. Consistently George and those who came to share his views argued that the struggle for economic and social justice in Ireland was the same as that taking place in the United States. As George articulated in *Progress and Poverty*, America no longer enjoyed unique social and economic relations that rendered it immune to the forces of land monopoly. Indeed, as he argued before audiences of workers, America might very well be the first nation to be affected by the coming social revolution after it spread from Ireland. Such a view, George admitted, angered those who wanted to contain the radical implications of his message. "The time-serving politicians, who sought to use this Irish movement, tried to keep back the truth," he told an audience in 1881. "They were trying to keep it a purely Irish movement—they were willing enough to denounce Irish Landlordism, but they tried to prevent all reference to American Landlordism."

George's chief supporter, Patrick Ford, echoed the same sentiments in the *Irish World*, drawing clear parallels between the situation in Ireland—monopolized land, social unrest, hollow democratic institutions, and degraded farmers and laborers—and that emerging in the United States. "The struggle in Ireland," declared Ford, "is radically and essentially the
same as the struggle in America—a contest against legalized forms of oppression.” Davitt too pushed this theme when speaking to Irish-American audiences: “Men of Irish blood and sympathies in America,” he said, “... come to the practical assistance of those in Ireland who are now battling not only for the rights of your kindred, but for those of industrial humanity throughout the world.”

Local labor activist, ardent Irish nationalist, and committed Georgist Robert Blissett warned the hundreds of Land League audiences he lectured that “there are some persons who say that this land question is an Irish question. Why, it concerns every country, and none more so than America, whose wealth and lands are rapidly falling into the hands of a few men.” Another working-class leader influenced by George, P. J. McGuire, concurred. He offered his listeners specific examples of “landlordism” in America:

It is no longer an Irish question because it has come into the arena of world affairs. We [Americans] have known of people driven from their homes at the point of the bayonet. The railroad companies have repeatedly turned out workmen from their homes, and last year in New York City there were 60,000 evictions.

In linking the struggle in Ireland with that taking place in America, George and his followers endeavored to modernize the traditional Irish-American conception of their oppressors, from a cultural-religious one (Anglo-Protestants in Ireland and America), to a socioeconomic one (any illegitimate monopolizer of resources that belong to all of society). They compelled Irish-American workers to examine their own situation in America to understand the universality of the struggle against accumulated, undemocratic power and to get them to see robber barons such as Jay Gould, Cornelius Vanderbilt, and Andrew Carnegie as the “landlords” of the new industrial order. As a result, George would remain a popular figure in working-class circles for years after the collapse of the Land League, a fact that became most evident in 1886.

II

Conclusion

Through his key friendships with men such as Ford, McGlynn, and Davitt, as well as his Land League activities and writings on and travel through Ireland, Henry George successfully cultivated a mass Irish-American following. This provided him not only with fame, book royalties, and speaking engagements, but it also set the stage for his most dramatic moment: the 1886 campaign for mayor of New York City. In endorsing his nomination, Ford reminded his readers of George’s record as “the friend of the people, the friend of oppressed Ireland.” So strong was the bond between George and the Irish of that city, especially its working-class Irish, that thousands defied the two most powerful forces in their community—the Catholic Church and Tammany Hall—to vote for George. As a result, he nearly pulled off the unimaginable. The candidate of a fledgling Labor party, he finished a close second to the winner in a field of three. The campaign and the years of agitation that led up to it proved that it was no longer possible to speak of Irish-Americans as overwhelmingly conservative and against reform. George and those who shared his views had in the 1880s opened the minds of Irish-Americans to a vast array of new ideas and choices about how to best arrange a just, democratic society.

Notes

2. Barker, pp. 125–127. For examples of these editorials, see San Francisco Monitor, August 14 and 21, 1869. For more on San Francisco’s substantial Irish population, see R. A. Burchell, The San Francisco Irish. 1849–1880 (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1979).
8. Brown, pp. 49–54; Rodechko, pp. 58–70.
9. Irish World, March and December 11, 1880, p. 4; May 1, 1886, p. 6; January 8, 1881, p. 5.
10. Letter of H. George to McClatchy, January 27, 1881, Henry George Papers, Corre-
spondence, Reel 2; Irish World, July 18, 1885, p. 8; November 4, 1882, p. 6; Barker, p. 336.


12. At its peak the Land League in America established more than 900 branches nationwide, which together raised over $500,000 to support the struggle of their fellow countrymen in Ireland. See: Brown, pp. 122, 128; Foner, p. 157; Irish World, March 19, 1881, p. 8; Irish-American, March 12, 1881, p. 8.

13. Irish World, November 20, 1880, p. 1; April 23, 1881, p. 5; May 14, 1881, p. 5; May 21, 1881, p. 8; New York Times, April 13, 1881, p. 3.

14. Letter of H. George to Bigelow, June 10, 1881; Letter of H. George to Taylor, June 13, 1881; Letter of H. George to James H. Murphy, March 10, 1881; Letter of H. George to Taylor, March 26, 1881, Henry George Papers, Correspondence, 1876–1882, Reel 2; Irish World, July 9, 1881, p. 8; Barker, pp. 320–324, 338–352, 339–340.

15. Moody, pp. 1–220.

16. Letter of H. George to Taylor, November 2, 1880, Henry George Papers, Correspondence, Reel 2; Irish World, February 19, 1881, p. 7; Brown, p. 118.

17. Davitt actually went beyond George's call for abolishing private property to advocate the nationalization of land—a position from which he later retreated.


23. Barker, pp. 55, 57–59, 435; See also George's correspondence with the Reverend Thomas Dawson, a Catholic priest he met in Ireland. Dawson prodded George to consider conversion to Catholicism, which the latter rejected, but for reasons that explained why he avoided all organized religion, not just Catholicism.


George and the Irish


29. Irish-American, November 6, 1880, p. 5.


33. Irish World, October 16, 1886, p. 4.

Selected References


