

Lamorinda School Bus Transportation Agency
Regular Meeting AGENDA
DATE: January 11, 2019 TIME: 2:00 p.m.
City of Lafayette, 3675 Mt. Diablo Blvd., Lafayette CA
Conference Room 240 (Second Floor)

- 1) CALL TO ORDER
- 2) ADOPTION OF AGENDA
- 3) PUBLIC COMMENT – items not on the agenda
- 4) ADOPTION OF MINUTES – November 26, 2018
- 5) ELECTION OF CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR
- 6) OLD BUSINESS
 - a. Review Results of LSBTA Parent Survey 2018
Recommendation: Receive and File.
 - b. Review Proposal from First Student for Transportation Services Starting 2019
Recommendation: Consider Options in October 31, 2019 Staff Report.
- 7) LATE BUS REPORTS – November 2018
- 8) CHAIR AND BOARD MEMBERS' REPORTS
- 9) WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS
 - a. Email from Bryan Garbo, January 4, 2019 re: Springhill 27 and Stanley 22.
- 10) NEXT MEETING DATE - tbd
- 11) ADJOURNMENT

I, Juliet Hansen, declare under penalty of perjury, that this agenda has been posted at least 72 hours in advance in the following locations: City of Lafayette Offices, 3675 Mt. Diablo Blvd., in the glass case downstairs, Lafayette, CA.

Juliet Hansen, Program Manager

*Any writings or documents pertaining to an open session item provided to a majority of the LSBTA less than 72 hours prior to the meeting shall be made available for public inspection at the Lamorinda School Bus Program office at 3675 Mt. Diablo Blvd., Suite 255, Lafayette CA during normal business hours. Agendas and packets are available for review by the public during regular Monday – Friday work hours at the Lamorinda School Bus Program office at 3675 Mt. Diablo Blvd., Suite 255, Lafayette CA and on the website at www.lamorindaschoolbus.org Agendas and packets shall be made available at least 72 hours in advance of each meeting. Upon request this agenda will be made available in appropriate alternative formats to persons with disabilities, as required by Section 202 of the ADA Act of 1990 (42 U.S.D. Sec. 12132). Any person with a disability who requires a modification or accommodation in order to participate in a meeting should direct such request to Juliet Hansen, Program Manager, at 925-299-3216 at least 48 hours before the meeting if possible.

Lamorinda School Bus Transportation Agency

DRAFT MINUTES

City of Lafayette Offices
3675 Mt. Diablo Blvd.,
Lafayette, CA 94549

Date: November 26, 2018
Time: 2:00 p.m.

Present: Chair Tatzin, Vice Chair Worth and Board Members Gerson, Kendzierski, Korpus, and Rossiter.

Absent: Board Member O'Donnell.

Also Present: Henry Cooper, First Student; Juliet Hansen and Sue Graves, LSBP Staff; Cam Burks, Lafayette City Council; Cara Hoxie, OUSD; Brain Mangold, Stanley Middle School Vice Principal; Jean Follmer, incoming LSD Board; and Mary Kubiatowicz, Springhill Liaison.

1. Call to Order: Chair Tatzin called the meeting to order at 2:01p.m.
2. Adoption of Agenda: The agenda was adopted M/S/C/U (Worth/ Kendzierski).
3. Public Comment: None.
4. Approval of Minutes: The minutes of October 31, 2018 were approved M/S/C/U (Worth/ Kendzierski).
5. Old Business
 - a. Review Proposal from First Student for Transportation Services Starting 2019

Ms. Hansen reviewed for the Board the proposed pricing scenarios from First Student. There would be no savings on delaying the introduction of new buses. Henry Cooper, First Student, commented that new vehicles and standardization of the fleet is more efficient. He also stated that the bid is good until February/March 2019 but that new buses need to be ordered in January. This item was continued until January 2019, when the new board members will be in place.

6. New Business
 - a. Review Draft LSBTA Parent Survey

The Board held a discussion regarding launching a parent survey. Board Member Korpus stated that the information sent to the parents needs to present the reasons for the increase in parent fees. Chair Tatzin stated that next year is the first of 2 years of increased costs. Vice Chair Worth stated that parents currently pay a quarter of the cost of running the buses. Board Member Kendzierski stated that the price increase should be front loaded instead of over 2 years. There was consensus to modify the survey to start at \$90/month. Board Member

Korpus will join the survey subcommittee. There was also consensus to include a survey of incoming 6th grade students.

7. Late Bus Report: No discussion
8. Chair's and Board Members' Report: None
9. Written Communications:

There was a short discussion regarding an email from Serge Milman regarding the RFP process. Chair Tatzin stated that he would respond to the email.

10. Next Meeting Date: January 2019, date to be determined.
11. Adjournment: The meeting was adjourned at 2:57 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Sue Graves, Administrative Aide

LSBTA Meeting
January 11, 2019
Staff Report

Lamorinda School Bus Program
Staff Report

Date: January 7, 2019
To: Lamorinda School Bus Transportation Agency
From: Juliet Hansen, Program Manager
Re: Review Results of LSBTA Parent Survey 2018

Background

At its last meeting on November 26, 2018, the LSBTA authorized the release of a parent survey to evaluate willingness to pay higher fees for school bus service next year. The introduction and survey were distributed on December 6, 2018 to 1100 email addresses (households).

Survey Results

- 577 surveys were submitted which is a 52% participation rate
- 92% of parents indicated they are very satisfied or somewhat satisfied with the Lamorinda School Bus Program
- 85% stated the necessity of the school bus for their family is very high or high
- Most parents would drive to school or carpool if there was no school bus service
- 80% of parents indicated they would pay \$90/month or more for ROUND TRIP service next year (numbers adjusted for students that don't ride round trip and responses in the "other" category)
- 82% of parents indicated they would pay \$59/month or more for ONE WAY service next year (numbers adjusted for students that don't ride one way and responses in the "other" category)
- Regarding students that would ride next year, 9% have no students, 54% have one student, 32% have 2 students and 5% have 3 or more students.
- Regarding districts, 16% have students attending AUHSD next year, 33% attending LSD, 19% attending MSD, 37% attending OUSD and less than 1% attending other school districts.
- Regarding routes, there was good participation from most of the 22 bus routes.
- A total of 310 comments were submitted.

Summary

The participation rate for this survey was high. In general, there is support for raising parent fees next year to \$90/month for Round Trip and to \$59/month for One Way.

Recommendation

Receive and File.

Attachments:
Email to Parents
Summary, LSBTA Parent Survey 2018
Comments, LSBTA Parent Survey 2018

Hansen, Juliet

From: Hansen, Juliet
Sent: Thursday, December 6, 2018 5:24 PM
To: Hansen, Juliet
Subject: School Bus Survey - Please Read!

Dear Parents:

The Lamorinda School Bus Transportation Agency (LSBTA) is seeking your input on its school bus program, and the extent of each family's willingness to pay the costs for continuing bus service in the present economic environment. *Please click on the survey link at the end of this email. This survey is for parents of current riders.*

The current transportation contract with our bus provider expires at the end of this school year. Under the current five-year contract, the LSBTA pays out just over \$1.8 Million for the operation of twenty-two bus routes serving 1500 students.

A competitive bid process this fall has revealed that the Bay Area's high cost of labor combined with the ever-increasing demand for drivers (public transit, school buses, private businesses and tech companies) will result in a significant increase in the cost of school bus transportation next year. The LSBTA has been largely insulated from these market forces due to previously low, locked-in rates under the current contract. However, the LSBTA is now facing a 45% cost of services increase over the next five years.

Current Parent fees provide only 30% of the annual operating revenue for the school bus program. Measure J, a ½ percent sales tax in Contra Costa County, provides the remaining 70%. The LSBTA must generate the additional revenue it needs for the cost of services increase by raising Parent fees (as Measure J funds are largely fixed, and the likelihood of finding significant revenue from other sources is small).

| 2018-19 Revenues | | | |
|------------------|-------|--------------|------|
| Parent Fees | | \$ 630,060 | 30% |
| Measure J | | \$ 1,449,809 | 70% |
| | TOTAL | \$ 2,079,869 | 100% |

| 2018-19 Bus Pass Costs | | | |
|------------------------|-----------|----------|---------|
| | Annually | Monthly | Daily |
| Round Trip | \$ 517.00 | \$ 51.70 | \$ 2.87 |
| One-Way | \$ 336.00 | \$ 33.60 | \$ 1.87 |

The LSBTA projects it will need parents to pay at least 46% of the total revenue stream required to continue providing service to all 1500 students next school year. Thus, to maintain service for all students currently served, the cost of the Round Trip Annual Bus Pass will need to increase **to at least** \$900^[1] next school year, which is \$90/month or \$5.00/day. The LSBTA is considering monthly automatic billing in order to assist parents with payment.

If the increased cost of present services cannot be met by families who use the bus service, then routes will need to be cut as necessary, based upon the amount parents are willing to pay for bus service.

Please participate thoughtfully in the 2018 LSBTA Survey of Parents so we can use the data to define the most appropriate and successful parameters within which the LSBTA bus program can continue to operate in this new financial landscape.

^[1] This is the minimum cost for next school year because any reduction in ridership is likely to increase ridership costs for remaining riders, as the costs for LSBTA services will have to be spread amongst participating families.

SURVEY LINK <https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/LSBTAsurveyofparents2018>

Thank you,

Juliet Hansen, Program Manager
Lamorinda School Bus Program/ City of Lafayette Public Art Committee
3675 Mt. Diablo Blvd., Suite 255
Lafayette, CA 94549
(925) 299-3216 ph (925) 283-2181 fx
lamorindaschoolbus.org

^[1] This is the minimum cost for next school year because any reduction in ridership is likely to increase ridership costs for remaining riders, as the costs for LSBTA services will have to be spread amongst participating families.

LSBTA Meeting
November 26, 2018
Staff Report

Lamorinda School Bus Program
Staff Report

Date: November 23, 2018
To: Lamorinda School Bus Transportation Agency
From: Juliet Hansen, Program Manager
Re: Request for Proposal for Transportation Services Starting fall 2019

Background

At the last meeting on October 31, 2018, the LSBTA reviewed five pricing scenarios from First Student for school bus service starting fall 2019. For the five-year scenario, First Student was asked to break out the capital related costs for the buses in year 1 and 3 versus year 2 and 4. The board also wanted to know if there was a cost savings to start with the existing buses in year 1. For the one-year extension, First Student was asked to break out the capital related costs for buses and maintenance.

First Student Response

Attached is the First Student response. It does not appear that there is a cost savings or reduction in price in the additional information provided.

First Student Pricing Scenarios

The five pricing scenarios included in the 10-31-18 packet are still on the table and can be viewed in the 10-31-18 staff report attached. The summary and recommendation remain the same,

Recommendation

Discuss and direct staff.

From: [Rogers, Lori K.](#)
To: [Hansen, Juliet](#)
Subject: RE: Meeting follow up.
Date: Monday, November 19, 2018 3:46:05 PM
Attachments: [image002.png](#)
[Lamorinda SBTA Year 1 Fleet Cost Comparison.pdf](#)
[Lamorinda SBTA Alternate 5-Year Proposal 2018-11-16.pdf](#)

Hi Juliet,

I've attached the comparison of the fleet cost in the 1-year extension vs. year 1 of the 5-year term. Also attached is alternate pricing for a 5-year term with vehicle replacements deferred to years 2 and 4, rather than years 1 and 3, however there is no savings in this option given the additional cost in year 1 when the existing fleet is retained.

Please let me know if there are any questions; I would be happy to discuss with you.

Regards,

Lori K. Rogers
Finance Manager, West Region
First Student, Inc.

Mobile: 925-300-6594
firststudentinc.com
firstcharterbus.com



We provide easy and convenient mobility, improving quality of life by connecting people and communities

Committed to our customers | Dedicated to safety | Supportive of each other | Accountable for performance | Setting the highest standards

From: Hansen, Juliet <JHansen@ci.lafayette.ca.us>
Sent: Monday, November 19, 2018 1:09 PM
To: Rogers, Lori K. <Lori.Rogers2@firstgroup.com>
Subject: RE: Meeting follow up.

Hi, Lori: I have not received anything from you yet.

Juliet Hansen, Program Manager
Lamorinda School Bus Program/ City of Lafayette Public Art Committee
3675 Mt. Diablo Blvd., Suite 255
Lafayette, CA 94549



Lamorinda School Bus Transportation Agency
 Fleet Cost Comparison
 1-Year Term vs. Year 1 of 5-Year Term

| Total Cost | Buses | Vehicle Depreciation | Vehicle Maintenance | Fuel Efficiency (22 Routes) |
|------------------------------|-------|----------------------|---------------------|-----------------------------|
| 1-Year Term | 26 | 224,419 | 198,941 | 199,759 |
| Year 1 of 5-Year Term | 24 | 202,625 | 161,967 | 196,037 |
| Savings with 5-Year Proposal | | 21,794 | 36,974 | 3,722 |

| Cost Per Bus | Buses | Vehicle Depreciation | Vehicle Maintenance | Fuel Efficiency (22 Routes) |
|--------------------------|-------|----------------------|---------------------|-----------------------------|
| 1-Year Term | 26 | 8,632 | 7,652 | 9,080 |
| Year 1 of 5-Year Term | 24 | 8,443 | 6,749 | 8,911 |
| Savings with 5-Year Term | | 189 | 903 | 169 |

Note:

The overall cost reduction when vehicles are replaced in Year 1 is primarily the result of converting to an all conventional fleet, eliminating the need for 2 additional spare buses. With an all conventional fleet, the average price per vehicle is lower and there is also an improvement in fuel efficiency, reducing the overall fuel cost.

Lamorinda School Bus Program
Staff Report

Date: October 26, 2018
To: Lamorinda School Bus Transportation Agency
From: Juliet Hansen, Program Manager
Re: Request for Proposal for Transportation Services Starting fall 2019

Background

The LSBTA received one proposal from First Student in response to its RFP for school bus transportation services starting fall 2019. The proposal is for new buses and a five year contract as requested by the agency. The daily rate is much higher than anticipated and represents a 33.5% increase. At its last meeting on October 9, 2018, the LSBTA reviewed alternative pricing scenarios from First Student and also cost comparisons from other school districts. Staff was directed to request a price from First Student for a one year extension and two year extension. Staff was also asked to contact additional Marin County school bus programs for cost comparison.

First Student Alternate Pricing Scenarios

First Student has submitted four new pricing scenarios, which are in addition to the original proposal which was submitted in response to the Request for Proposal. Analysis is included below.

First Student Proposals

Original Proposal - First Student Proposal received on August 22, 2018

The current daily rate for a four hour minimum is \$456.39/day and the new price for 2019/20 is \$609.28/day which is a 33.5% increase. Prices increase by 2.5% a year thereafter. *Impacts: The LSBTA would need to reduce the fleet to 17 buses in the first year (eliminate 5 buses) and increase parent fees by at least 33.5% (from \$517/round trip to \$690/round trip).*

Alternative Pricing Scenarios

a. (New) Alternative Five Year Contract

This proposal has been updated since the last meeting with new prices. Change to all-conventional fleet size (e.g. 71 passengers), phase in new buses. *Impacts: This is a 19.3% increase in the first year, 11% in the second year and 3% thereafter. Please refer to the chart attached for impacts regarding number of buses and parent fees. This is staff's preferred pricing scenario at this time.*

c. Extend the Current Contract

Extend by One, Two or Three Years using existing fleet of three different bus sizes. *Impacts: The increase varies between 21% and 30%. Initially, the advantage of extending the contract was to lower the price (from the original 33.5%) and to partner with another agency in a future contract. However, First Student is now offering a new lower price for a five year contract with buses transitioned in over time.*

Price Comparisons – Other School Districts

The price comparison analysis has been updated to include the three school districts in Marin County that use county tax dollars for school bus transportation as traffic mitigation – Reed School District, Mill Valley School District and Ross Valley School District. Fairfax and San Anselmo also contribute \$10,000 each annually.

The three districts coordinate with Marin Transit though buses are provided by school bus operators. Reed uses First Student and Mill Valley and Ross use Michaels. All three districts collect parent fees. The LSBTA currently charges \$336 for one way and \$517 for round trip.

Reed School District – \$315 one way/\$630 round trip

Mill Valley School District - \$360 one way/\$720 round trip (offers monthly payments)

Ross Valley School District - \$395 one way/\$790 round trip (offers monthly payments)

Options for Action

Options for the LSBTA to consider:

1. If there is support to pursue the original First Student proposal for all new buses OR if there is interest in the alternative pricing scenario where new buses are transitioned in over time:

Action: Enter into negotiations with First Student; consider asking for Best and Final Offer.

2. If there is support to extend the current contract:

Action: Reject the original First Student proposal; Enter into negotiations with First Student to extend the current contract using the existing fleet of buses.

3. If there is support to re-issue the RFP for new buses:

Action: Reject the original First Student proposal; reissue the RFP with changes (revise liquidated damages, delete requirement to drive routes, revise staffing configuration, eliminate base routes, and standardize the fleet). Note: this option is available for a limited time as new buses must be ordered by March 2019.

Summary

The LSBTA received one proposal from First Student in response to its RFP for school bus transportation services starting fall 2019. The proposal is for new buses and a five year contract as requested by the agency. The daily rate is much higher than anticipated and represents a 33.5% increase. Staff requested First Student to prepare alternative pricing scenarios for consideration by the LSBTA. *Since the October 9th meeting, First Student has revised its quote for transitioning to new buses over time and for extending the current contract.* Given the revisions, staff recommends pursuing the option for a five year contract and transitioning to new buses over time. This is a 19.3% increase which is lower than any other scenario, but still has significant impacts to service and to parent fees. First Student representatives will be in attendance on October 31st to clarify the proposals.

Recommendation

Discuss options above; direct staff.

5 Year Contract Term - all conventional fleet, 1/2 new buses Year One, 1/2 new Year Three

Current Contract - First Student

| Daily Rate | Cost Per Bus | # Buses | Parent Fees | RT | Ending Fund Balance |
|------------|--------------|---------|-------------|----|---------------------|
| \$ 456.39 | \$ 82,150 | 22 | \$ 517 | | \$ 241,000 |

Year One - 21 buses (reconfigure one bus route)

| New Daily Rate | Cost Per Bus | # Buses | Parent Fees | RT | Ending Fund Balance |
|----------------|--------------|---------|-------------|-----|---------------------|
| \$ 544.47 | \$ 98,000 | 21 | \$ 900 | | \$ 334,000 |
| 19.3% | | | | 74% | |

Year Two - 21 buses

| New Daily Rate | Cost Per Bus | # Buses | Parent Fees | RT | Ending Fund Balance |
|----------------|--------------|---------|-------------|----|---------------------|
| \$ 604.36 | \$ 108,785 | 21 | \$ 954 | | \$ 295,821 |
| 11.0% | | | | 6% | |

scenarios assume no loss of ridership

REVISED Jan 8, 2019

Transportation Cost Comparison - Other School Districts

FY 18-19 FY 19-20

| Agency | Provider | Bus Size | Service | Daily Rate | Daily Rate | Comments |
|---------------------------|---------------|-----------------|---------------|---------------|------------|---|
| LSBTA | First Student | Large, 22 buses | HTS | \$ 456.39 | \$ 609.28 | proposal for all new buses, 5 yrs |
| LSBTA | First Student | Large, 22 buses | HTS | \$ 456.39 | \$ 544.47 | proposal to transition to new buses 5 yrs |
| TRAFFIX | First Student | Large, 23 buses | HTS | \$ 503.75 | \$ 611.81 | in negotiation, new buses, 5 yrs |
| SRVUSD | First Student | Large, 1 bus | Trips | \$ 510.14 | negotiable | 1 yr contract, renewable |
| Reed S.D. (Marin Transit) | First Student | Large, 8 buses | HTS | \$ 518.66 | \$ 536.81 | 1st year of 5 yr contract, new buses* |
| Mill Valley | Michaels | Large | HTS | \$ 625.00 | \$ - | expires 2019, bus parking on site |
| Ross Valley Unified | Michaels | Large | HTS | \$ 578.00 | \$ 595.00 | 1st year of 5 year contract** |
| San Francisco Unified | First Student | Large | HTS | \$ 779.69 | 806.98 | 4th year of 5 year contract |
| WCCCU | First Student | Mid - 1 bus | Trips | \$ 414.18 | \$ 424.53 | 3rd year of 5 year contract |
| SRVUSD | First Student | Small | Special Needs | \$ 489.28 | negotiable | 1 yr contract, renewable |
| CCCOE | Durham | Small | Special Needs | \$ 496.62 | \$ 514.00 | 2nd year of 3 yr contract* |
| WCCCU | First Student | Small | Special Needs | \$ 398.55 | \$ 408.51 | 3rd year of 5 year contract |
| MPTA (JPA) | First Student | Small | Special Needs | \$ 445.00 | \$ 460.58 | 4th year of 5 yr contract* |
| SMOfficeofEd | Durham | Small | Special Needs | \$ 513.24 | \$ 531.20 | 4th year of 5 yr contract* |
| Oakland Unified | First Student | Small | Special Needs | \$ 449.46 | \$ 465.74 | 1st year of 2 yr extension |
| Foster City/San Mateo SD | First Student | Small | Special Needs | not available | \$ - | 4th year of 5 yr. contract |
| Hayward Unified | Storer | Small | Special Needs | not available | \$ - | 3rd year of 5 year contract |

*CPI annual increase, assumed at 3.5%

**Contract is between Marin Transit and Michaels

Prepared by Juliet Hansen, Lamorinda School Bus Program
10/26/2018

Hansen, Juliet

From: Bryan Garbo <bryangarbo@mac.com>
Sent: Friday, January 4, 2019 8:48 AM
To: Hansen, Juliet
Cc: Jeanette Garbo
Subject: Re: School Bus Survey - Please Read!

Hi Juliet,

I apologize for not completing the survey in a timely manner but I wanted to let you know how important the bus service is to our family. As the parent of 3 kids, it would take a significant part of my morning and afternoon planning transportation. From my vantage point as a parent and business owner, I would gladly pay an increase in fees to keep the program alive. Not sure what the majority of response was to the survey, but I'm curious to know what the feedback looked like.

Sincerely,
Bryan Garbo

On Dec 6, 2018, at 5:13 PM, Hansen, Juliet <JHansen@ci.lafayette.ca.us> wrote:

Dear Parents:

The Lamorinda School Bus Transportation Agency (LSBTA) is seeking your input on its school bus program, and the extent of each family's willingness to pay the costs for continuing bus service in the present economic environment. *Please click on the survey link at the end of this email. This survey is for parents of current riders.*

The current transportation contract with our bus provider expires at the end of this school year. Under the current five-year contract, the LSBTA pays out just over \$1.8 Million for the operation of twenty-two bus routes serving 1500 students.

A competitive bid process this fall has revealed that the Bay Area's high cost of labor combined with the ever-increasing demand for drivers (public transit, school buses, private businesses and tech companies) will result in a significant increase in the cost of school bus transportation next year. The LSBTA has been largely insulated from these market forces due to previously low, locked-in rates under the current contract. However, the LSBTA is now facing a 45% cost of services increase over the next five years.

Current Parent fees provide only 30% of the annual operating revenue for the school bus program. Measure J, a ½ percent sales tax in Contra Costa County, provides the remaining 70%. The LSBTA must generate the additional revenue it needs for the cost of services increase by raising Parent fees (as Measure J funds are largely fixed, and the likelihood of finding significant revenue from other sources is small).

| 2018-19 Revenues | | | |
|------------------|--|------------|-----|
| Parent Fees | | \$ 630,060 | 30% |