

**Lamorinda School Bus Transportation Agency**  
**Regular Meeting AGENDA**  
**DATE: Wednesday, October 31, 2018    TIME: 1:00 p.m.**  
City of Lafayette, 3675 Mt. Diablo Blvd., Lafayette CA  
Conference Room 240 (Second Floor)

---

- 1) CALL TO ORDER
- 2) ADOPTION OF AGENDA
- 3) PUBLIC COMMENT – items not on the agenda
- 4) ADOPTION OF MINUTES – October 9, 2018
- 5) OLD BUSINESS
  - a. Review Proposal from First Student for Transportation Services Starting 2019  
Recommendation: Discuss Options; direct staff
- 6) LATE BUS REPORTS
- 7) CHAIR AND BOARD MEMBERS' REPORTS
- 8) WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS
- 9) NEXT MEETING DATE - tbd
- 10) ADJOURNMENT

I, Juliet Hansen, declare under penalty of perjury, that this agenda has been posted at least 72 hours in advance in the following locations: City of Lafayette Offices, 3675 Mt. Diablo Blvd., in the glass case downstairs, Lafayette, CA.

---

Juliet Hansen, Program Manager

\*Any writings or documents pertaining to an open session item provided to a majority of the LSBTA less than 72 hours prior to the meeting shall be made available for public inspection at the Lamorinda School Bus Program office at 3675 Mt. Diablo Blvd., Suite 255, Lafayette CA during normal business hours. Agendas and packets are available for review by the public during regular Monday – Friday work hours at the Lamorinda School Bus Program office at 3675 Mt. Diablo Blvd., Suite 255, Lafayette CA and on the website at [www.lamorindaschoolbus.org](http://www.lamorindaschoolbus.org). Agendas and packets shall be made available at least 72 hours in advance of each meeting. Upon request this agenda will be made available in appropriate alternative formats to persons with disabilities, as required by Section 202 of the ADA Act of 1990 (42 U.S.D. Sec. 12132). Any person with a disability who requires a modification or accommodation in order to participate in a meeting should direct such request to Juliet Hansen, Program Manager, at 925-299-3216 at least 48 hours before the meeting if possible.

# Lamorinda School Bus Transportation Agency

## DRAFT MINUTES

City of Lafayette Offices  
3675 Mt. Diablo Blvd.,  
Lafayette, CA 94549

Date: October 9, 2018  
Time: 9:30 a.m.

Present: Chair Tatzin, Vice Chair Worth and Board Members Gerson, Kendzierski, Korpus, O'Donnell and Rossiter.

Absent: None

Also Present: Juliet Hansen and Sue Graves, LSBP Staff.

1. Call to Order: Chair Tatzin called the meeting to order at 9:32.
2. Adoption of Agenda: The agenda was adopted M/S/C/U (Worth/Gerson).
3. Public Comment: None.
4. Approval of Minutes: The minutes were approved as corrected M/S/C/U (Gerson/Rossiter).
5. Old Business
  - a. Review Proposal from First Student for Transportation Services Starting 2019

Ms. Hansen review for the board the pricing data she had collected from other agencies. It appears that the daily rate for the Lamorinda School Bus Program is on the low side currently; however the new rate is on the high side for a future contract. There are a number of agencies that will go out for bid in the next year or two. Vice Chair Worth stated that doing an extension would allow the program to go out to bid with a partner. There was a discussion regarding the elimination of service and parent fees. Chair Tatzin stated that the program could extend the contract with First Student and in the meantime survey parents and look for other agencies to go out to bid with. He also stated that he was reluctant to do an extension with no liquidated damages. There is discussion of putting a new sales tax measure on the 2020 ballot. The board directed staff to request a daily rate for a one and two year extension.

6. Late Bus Report: No Discussion.
7. Chair and Board Members' Reports.

Board Member Korpus reported to the board that former Board Member Jeanette Fritzky passed away on September 28<sup>th</sup>. There will be a tribute walk on October 27<sup>th</sup> from 12-3 pm at the Moraga Commons.

8. Written Communications: None

9. Next Meeting Date: October 31<sup>st</sup> 2018 at 1:00 pm

10. Adjournment: Vice Chair Amy Worth requested that the meeting be adjourned in memory of Jeanette Fritzky. She stated that it is a terrible loss to our community. The meeting was adjourned at 10:22 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

---

Sue Graves, Administrative Aide

LSBTA Meeting  
October 31, 2018  
Staff Report

Lamorinda School Bus Program  
Staff Report

Date: October 26, 2018  
To: Lamorinda School Bus Transportation Agency  
From: Juliet Hansen, Program Manager  
Re: Request for Proposal for Transportation Services Starting fall 2019

---

Background

The LSBTA received one proposal from First Student in response to its RFP for school bus transportation services starting fall 2019. The proposal is for new buses and a five year contract as requested by the agency. The daily rate is much higher than anticipated and represents a 33.5% increase. At its last meeting on October 9, 2018, the LSBTA reviewed alternative pricing scenarios from First Student and also cost comparisons from other school districts. Staff was directed to request a price from First Student for a one year extension and two year extension. Staff was also asked to contact additional Marin County school bus programs for cost comparison.

First Student Alternate Pricing Scenarios

First Student has submitted four new pricing scenarios, which are in addition to the original proposal which was submitted in response to the Request for Proposal. Analysis is included below.

First Student Proposals

Original Proposal - First Student Proposal received on August 22, 2018  
The current daily rate for a four hour minimum is \$456.39/day and the new price for 2019/20 is \$609.28/day which is a 33.5% increase. Prices increase by 2.5% a year thereafter. *Impacts: The LSBTA would need to reduce the fleet to 17 buses in the first year (eliminate 5 buses) and increase parent fees by at least 33.5% (from \$517/round trip to \$690/round trip).*

Alternative Pricing Scenarios

a. (New) Alternative Five Year Contract

This proposal has been updated since the last meeting with new prices. Change to all-conventional fleet size (e.g. 71 passengers), phase in new buses. *Impacts: This is a 19.3% increase in the first year, 11% in the second year and 3% thereafter. Please refer to the chart attached for impacts regarding number of buses and parent fees. This is staff's preferred pricing scenario at this time.*

c. Extend the Current Contract

Extend by One, Two or Three Years using existing fleet of three different bus sizes. *Impacts: The increase varies between 21% and 30%. Initially, the advantage of extending the contract was to lower the price (from the original 33.5%) and to partner with another agency in a future contract. However, First Student is now offering a new lower price for a five year contract with buses transitioned in over time.*

## Price Comparisons – Other School Districts

The price comparison analysis has been updated to include the three school districts in Marin County that use county tax dollars for school bus transportation as traffic mitigation – Reed School District, Mill Valley School District and Ross Valley School District. Fairfax and San Anselmo also contribute \$10,000 each annually.

The three districts coordinate with Marin Transit though buses are provided by school bus operators. Reed uses First Student and Mill Valley and Ross use Michaels. All three districts collect parent fees. The LSBTA currently charges \$336 for one way and \$517 for round trip.

Reed School District – \$315 one way/\$630 round trip

Mill Valley School District - \$360 one way/\$720 round trip (offers monthly payments)

Ross Valley School District - \$395 one way/\$790 round trip (offers monthly payments)

## Options for Action

Options for the LSBTA to consider:

1. If there is support to pursue the original First Student proposal for all new buses OR if there is interest in the alternative pricing scenario where new buses are transitioned in over time:

*Action: Enter into negotiations with First Student; consider asking for Best and Final Offer.*

2. If there is support to extend the current contract:

*Action: Reject the original First Student proposal; Enter into negotiations with First Student to extend the current contract using the existing fleet of buses.*

3. If there is support to re-issue the RFP for new buses:

*Action: Reject the original First Student proposal; reissue the RFP with changes (revise liquidated damages, delete requirement to drive routes, revise staffing configuration, eliminate base routes, and standardize the fleet). Note: this option is available for a limited time as new buses must be ordered by March 2019.*

## Summary

The LSBTA received one proposal from First Student in response to its RFP for school bus transportation services starting fall 2019. The proposal is for new buses and a five year contract as requested by the agency. The daily rate is much higher than anticipated and represents a 33.5% increase. Staff requested First Student to prepare alternative pricing scenarios for consideration by the LSBTA. *Since the October 9<sup>th</sup> meeting, First Student has revised its quote for transitioning to new buses over time and for extending the current contract.* Given the revisions, staff recommends pursuing the option for a five year contract and transitioning to new buses over time. This is a 19.3% increase which is lower than any other scenario, but still has significant impacts to service and to parent fees. First Student representatives will be in attendance on October 31<sup>st</sup> to clarify the proposals.

## Recommendation

Discuss options above; direct staff.



**5 Year Contract Term - all conventional fleet, 1/2 new buses Year One, 1/2 new Year Three**

**Current Contract - First Student**

Daily Rate	Cost Per Bus	# Buses	Parent Fees RT	Ending Fund Balance
\$ 456.39	\$ 82,150	22	\$ 517	\$ 241,000

**Scenario A - Keep All 22 Buses**

New Daily Rate	Cost Per Bus	# Buses	Parent Fees RT	Ending Fund Balance
\$ 544.47	\$ 98,000	22	\$ 805	\$ 117,000
19.3%			56%	

**Scenario B - Eliminate 2 Buses**

New Daily Rate	Cost Per Bus	# Buses	Parent Fees RT	Ending Fund Balance
\$ 544.47	\$ 98,000	20	\$ 680	\$ 119,000
19.3%			32%	

**Scenario C - Eliminate 3 Buses**

New Daily Rate	Cost Per Bus	# Buses	Parent Fees RT	Ending Fund Balance
\$ 544.47	\$ 98,000	19	\$ 620	\$ 122,000
19.3%			20%	

All scenarios assume no loss of riders

Transportation Cost Comparison - Other School Districts

Agency	Provider	Bus Size	Service	FY 18-19		FY 19-20		Comments
				Daily Rate		Daily Rate		
LSBTA	First Student	Large, 22 buses	HTS	\$ 456.39	4 hours	\$ 609.28		proposal for all new buses, 5 yrs
LSBTA	First Student	Large, 22 buses	HTS	\$ 456.39	4 hours	\$ 544.47		proposal to transition to new buses 5 yrs
TRAFFIX	First Student	Large, 23 buses	HTS	\$ 503.75	4 hours	\$ 611.81		in negotiation, new buses, 5 yrs
SRVUSD	First Student	Large, 1 bus	Trips	\$ 510.14	3 hours	negotiable		1 yr contract, renewable
Reed S.D. (Marin Transit)	First Student	Large, 8 buses	HTS	\$ 518.66	4 hours	\$ 536.81		1st year of 5 yr contract, new buses*
Mill Valley	Michaels	Large	HTS	\$ 625.00	4 hours	\$ -		expires 2019, bus parking on site
Ross Valley Unified	Michaels	Large	HTS	\$ 578.00	4 hours	\$ 595.00		1st year of 5 year contract**
San Francisco Unified	First Student	Large	HTS	\$ 779.69	4 hours	806.98		4th year of 5 year contract
WCCCU	First Student	Mid - 1 bus	Trips	\$ 414.18	4 hours	\$ 424.53		3rd year of 5 year contract
SRVUSD	First Student	Small	Special Needs	\$ 489.28	3 hours	negotiable		1 yr contract, renewable
CCCOE	Durham	Small	Special Needs	\$ 496.62	4 hours	\$ 514.00		2nd year of 3 yr contract*
WCCCU	First Student	Small	Special Needs	\$ 398.55	4 hours	\$ 408.51		3rd year of 5 year contract
MPTA (JPA)	First Student	Small	Special Needs	\$ 445.00	4 hours	\$ 460.58		4th year of 5 yr contract*
SMOfficeofEd	Durham	Small	Special Needs	\$ 513.24	4 hours	\$ 531.20		4th year of 5 yr contract*
Oakland Unified	First Student	Small	Special Needs	\$ 449.46	5 hours	\$ 465.74		1st year of 2 yr extension
Foster City/San Mateo SD	First Student	Small	Special Needs	not available		\$ -		4th year of 5 yr. contract
Hayward Unified	Storer	Small	Special Needs	not available		\$ -		3rd year of 5 year contract

\*CPI annual increase, assumed at 3.5%

\*\*Contract is between Marin Transit and Michaels

Prepared by Juliet Hansen, Lamorinda School Bus Program

10/26/2018