

# SGIR Review

## Editor

Lydia Moland, *Colby College*

## Consulting Editor

Gerad Gentry, *Lewis University*

## SGIR Advisory Board

Frederick Beiser, *Syracuse University*

Daniel Breazeale, *University of Kentucky*

Hannah Ginsborg, *University of California–Berkeley*

Kristin Gjesdal, *Temple University*

Johannes Haag, *Universität Potsdam*

Rolf-Peter Horstmann, *Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin*

Stephen Houlgate, *University of Warwick*

Michale Forster, *University of Chicago and Universität Bonn*

Eckart Förster, *Johns Hopkins University and Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin*

Manfred Frank, *Universität Tübingen*

Pablo Muchnick, *Emerson College*

Terry Pinkard, *Georgetown University*

Anne Pollok, *University of South Carolina*

Konstantin Pollok, *University of South Carolina*

Tobias Rosefeldt, *Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin*

Sally Sedgwick, *University of Illinois at Chicago*

David Wellbery, *University of Chicago*

Rachel Zuckert, *Northwestern University*

Günter Zöller, *Universität München*

---

The *SGIR Review* is published by the Society for German Idealism and Romanticism. It includes reviews and responses written for SGIR Author-Meets-Critics Sessions at annual American Philosophical Association conferences (Eastern, Central, and Pacific) as well as stand-alone reviews of recent publications. The *SGIR Review* cooperates with other journals in the field such as the *Kantian Review*. At times, the *SGIR Review* provides these journals with one of its own reviews from a symposium book review series. In such cases, we note the copyright transfer in the bibliographic portion of the review and reproduce it here with the permission of *Cambridge Journals*.

The aim of the *SGIR Review* is to provide scholars in the History of Modern Philosophy with a source for in-depth discussion of scholarly works published within the last year. The *SGIR Review* will publish eleven critical reviews and author responses in our first volume, to be divided between two issues.

## Table of Contents

Preface .....ii

### **SGIR Author-Meets-Critics Book Symposium, 2018 Pacific APA:**

1. Kristin Gjesdal, *Herder’s Hermeneutics: History, Poetry, Enlightenment*, reviewed by  
Karl Ameriks..... 1

2. Kristin Gjesdal, *Herder’s Hermeneutics: History, Poetry, Enlightenment*, reviewed by  
Anne Pollok .....13

3. Herder’s Hermeneutics: Reply to Anne Pollok and Karl Ameriks, author response by  
Kristin Gjesdal .....27

### **SGIR Author-Meets-Critics Book Symposium, 2018 Central APA:**

4. Michel Chaouli, *Thinking with Kant’s Critique of Judgment*, reviewed by  
Katalin Makkai.....40

5. Michel Chaouli, *Thinking with Kant’s Critique of Judgment*, reviewed by  
Joseph J. Tinguely.....51

6. Between Passivity and Activity: Reply to Katalin Makkai and Joseph Tinguely by  
Michel Chaouli.....67