



October 27, 2014

Page | 1

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE  
National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration  
Office of the Chief Information Officer  
High Performance Computing and Communications  
NOAA Freedom of Information Officer  
Public Reference Facility (SOU1000)  
1315 East-West Highway (SSMC3)  
Room 9719  
Silver Spring, Maryland 20910

**Attention:** Mr. Bruce Gibbs  
Mr. Gerard Fox  
Dr. Wendy Schumacher

Re: FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694  
Tranche/Cache of Clearly and Obviously Identified NOAA Files

Dear Mr. Gibbs,

I appreciate your taking my phone call during the morning of last Tuesday, October 21, 2014 to, once again, discuss NOAA's continued "inability" to identify the records for which disclosure has been sought pursuant to Institute for Trade, Standards and Sustainable Development ("ITSSD") FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694 filed on September 22, 2014.<sup>1</sup>

The purpose of this letter is to make actionable the mutual verbal agreement reached during our phone discussion. As you may recall, and as confirmed again today by telephone, we agreed that it would aid NOAA's efforts in performing a good faith search of agency files in response to FOIA request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694 if ITSSD were to separate into two tranches/caches the documents for which agency disclosure is sought.

You will recognize, as does Mr. Fox and Dr. Schumacher, that FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694 was the *second* request ITSSD prepared in good faith pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act (the first was filed in March 2014<sup>2</sup>) to secure NOAA's disclosure of specific records related to the prior peer reviews of ten (10) clearly identified NOAA-developed scientific assessments supporting the Environmental Protection Agency's 2009 Clean Air Section 202(a) GHG Endangerment Findings. These ten NOAA-developed assessments are referenced immediately below.

As set forth in Section III, paragraph 4.a-4.b of FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694 (p. 22), and restated in "Appendix 1A: NOAA-Developed USGCRP/CCSP Assessments Supporting EPA

GHG Endangerment Findings” accompanying said FOIA request (p. 86), these ten documents were clearly identified as follows:

“4. [...] NOAA-developed assessments/reports:

- a. Designated directly in Table 1.1 of the EPA-TSD [Environmental Protection Agency Technical Support Document] as “core reference documents, including those containing computer models and related datasets and specific applications thereof, and which qualified under the OMB Peer Review Bulletin as “highly influential scientific assessments” (“HISAs”) or influential scientific information (“ISI”):”<sup>3</sup>
  - i. SAP1.1/CCSP(2006) (HISA);<sup>4</sup>
  - ii. SAP1.3/CCSP(2008g) (HISA);<sup>5</sup>
  - iii. SAP2.4/CCSP(2008h) (HISA);<sup>6</sup>
  - iv. SAP3.2/CCSP(2008d) (HISA);<sup>7</sup>
  - v. SAP3.3/CCSP(2008i) (HISA);<sup>8</sup>
  - vi. *Global Climate Change Impacts in the United States* (“NCA2-2009”) (HISA); and
  - vii. *State of the Climate in 2008* (“SOC-2008”) (ISI);<sup>9</sup>
- b. NOAA-developed HISAs, including those containing computer models and related datasets and specific applications thereof, not designated in Table 1.1 of the EPA-TSD as “core reference documents”, but otherwise incorporated-by-reference within NCA2-2009 - a NOAA-developed HISA the EPA-TSD designated as a “core reference document; (i.e., the EPA-TSD indirectly designated the following assessments as “core reference documents”):
  - i. SAP2.2/CCSP(2007);<sup>10</sup>
  - ii. SAP5.2/CCSP(2009);<sup>11</sup> and
  - iii. SAP5.3/CCSP(2008).<sup>12</sup>”

FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694 generally and specifically sought disclosure of “NOAA climate science-related peer review files” substantiating compliance of NOAA and NOAA-commissioned third party peer reviews of these specific ten (10) assessments with the most rigorous and least discretionary of standards imposed by the Information Quality Act.

To repeat, pursuant to the mutual verbal agreement we reached during our phone discussion of October 21, 2014, as confirmed again today by telephone, it was agreed that ITSSD would separate the documents for which ITSSD FOIA request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694 sought disclosure into two distinct tranches/caches and that, in return, NOAA would expeditiously and in good faith endeavor to fulfill that request in responding to ITSSD’s FOIA request. The first tranche/cache would consist of those documents in said FOIA request that already provide clear and obvious identification of documents for which immediate uncensored disclosure is sought. The second tranche/cache would consist of documents in said FOIA request which are not as clearly identified by name, but rather, by subject matter and issue, and which would require further iterative discussion between NOAA and ITSSD to reach a higher level of clarification.

In confirmation of our verbal agreement, ITSSD hereby sets forth below the first tranche/cache of documents clearly and obviously identifying documents itemized in FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694 for which immediate uncensored disclosure from NOAA is sought.

As set forth in Section II, paragraph 1(h) of FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694 (p. 16), ITSSD seeks immediate and uncensored disclosure of NOAA agency documents revealing the:

- “(h) Selection criteria and identities of all members, including chairs, of each *ad hoc* federal advisory committee that NOAA established, operated and terminated during the period spanning from January 1, 2005 through December 31, 2011, in connection with the NOAA’s development of synthetic assessment products under the USGCRP/CCSP, and the peer review, author/report development and/or advisory roles played by each such person, *including, but not limited to, the following*:
- i. Climate Change Science Program (CCSP) Product Development Committee for Synthesis and Assessment Product 1.1 (“CPDC-S&A 1.1”) (established 2005 and terminated 2006);
  - ii. Climate Change Science Program CCSP Product Development Committee for Synthesis and Assessment Product 1.3 (“CPDC-S&A 1.3”) (established 2006 and terminated 2009);
  - iii. Climate Change Science Program (CCSP) Product Development Committee for Synthesis and Assessment Product 3.3 (“CPDC-S&A 3.3”) (established and terminated 2008);
  - iv. CCSP Product Development Committee for Synthesis and Assessment Product 5.3 (“CPDC-S&A 5.3”) (established 2006 and terminated 2009); and
  - v. CCSP Unified Synthesis Product Development Committee (“USPDC”) (established 2008 and terminated 2009).”

In addition, as set forth in Section II, paragraph 4 of FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694 (p. 19), ITSSD seeks immediate and uncensored disclosure of:

- “4. Copies of all NOAA and other federal agency climate science-related agreements commissioning the NAS/NRC to perform peer reviews of NOAA-developed SAPs 1.1, 1.3, 2.4, 3.2, 3.3, 5.2 and 5.3, as identified in Section III.5.a.iii.A-E of this new FOIA Request, and commissioning the NAS/NRC to develop climate science assessments, as identified in Section III.5.a.iii.F-H of this new FOIA Request;

Section III, paragraphs 5.a.iii.A-E and 5.a.iii.F-H of FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694 (p.24) set forth the following clearly identified documents:

- “5. a. Climate science-related contractual or other reciprocal arrangements entered into between NOAA and third parties [...]
- iii. Entered into by NOAA, or by another federal agency on NOAA’s behalf, pursuant to which the NAS/NRC performed climate science-related report development and/or peer review services (substantive peer review, peer review management and/or peer review oversight) jointly or solely for NOAA, with respect to NOAA-developed USGCRP/CCSP SAPs 1.1, 1.3, 2.4, 3.2, 3.3, 5.2 and 5.3, which EPA-TSD Table 1.1 directly and indirectly designated as “core reference documents,” in exchange for some form of consideration, *including* [...]:
- A. NAS Proposal No. 04-DELS-385-01,<sup>13</sup> commissioning the NAS/NRC to perform a peer review of NOAA-developed SAP1.1;
  - B. NSF grant number ATM-0455946,<sup>14 15 16</sup> commissioning the NAS/NRC to perform a peer review of three (3) NOAA-developed SAPs: SAP1.3, SAP3.2 and SAP5.2;
  - C. NOAA Contract No. DG133R07SE2247,<sup>17</sup> commissioning the NAS/NRC to perform a peer review of NOAA-developed SAP2.4;
  - D. NOAA Grant No. DG133R-04-CQ-009, TO#27,<sup>18</sup> commissioning the NAS/NRC to perform a peer review of NOAA-developed SAP3.3;
  - E. DOC Contract/Grant No. DG133R07SE2248,<sup>19</sup> National Aeronautics and Space Administration (Contract No. NNH07CC79B) and National Science Foundation (Grant No. 0436369) commissioning the NAS/NRC to perform a peer review of NOAA-developed SAP5.3;
  - F. NOAA Contract No. NASW-01008,<sup>20</sup> commissioning the NAS/NRC to develop an assessment/report on climate forcing agents (i.e., on radiative forcings);
  - G. NOAA Contract No. FC133CO5SE6428,<sup>21</sup> commissioning the NRC to develop an assessment/report on mitigating shore erosion;
  - H. Contract No. 50-DKNA-7-90052<sup>22</sup> pursuant to which NOAA and NASA collectively commissioned the NRC to develop an assessment/report on abrupt climate change.”

Furthermore, as set forth in Section II, paragraph 6 of FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694 (p. 19), ITSSD seeks immediate and uncensored disclosure of:

- “6. Copies of all Memorandums of Agreement (“MOA”s) NOAA had entered into with, and/or grant/award contracts NOAA had issued to, universities and nonprofit institutes

that NOAA had selected to establish, reestablish and/or expand NOAA-grant-funded Cooperative Institute Programs, as described in Section III.5.b.i-xxii of this new FOIA Request;”

Section III, paragraph 5.b.i-xxii of FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694 (pp. 25-26), set forth the following specifically identified memorandums of agreement and/or grant contracts NOAA issued to no fewer than sixteen (16) specifically identified universities and nonprofit institutes participating in the NOAA Cooperative Institute Programs:

- “5. [...] b. Specific Memorandums of Agreement (“MOA”s) and/or grant/award contracts NOAA entered into with universities and nonprofit institutes NOAA had selected to establish, reestablish and/or expand NOAA-grant-funded Cooperative Institute Programs, as identified in Appendix 3E: “Approximate Reported Funding NOAA Cooperative Institute Programs FYs 2004-2010” accompanying this new FOIA Request [pp. 112-116], *including* [...]:
- i. Cooperative Institute for Climate Science at Princeton Univ. (CICS-P) - NOAA Cooperative Institute (“CI”) Contract No. NA08OAR4320752; CI Shadow Award No. NA08OAR4320915;
  - ii. Cooperative Institute for Climate and Studies at Univ. of Maryland (CICS-M) - NOAA CI Contract No. NA17EC1483;
  - iii. Cooperative Institute for Climate and Satellite Studies at the Univ. of Maryland (CICS-M) - NOAA CI Contract Nos. NA17EC1483; NA09NES0006;
  - iv. Cooperative Institute for Research in the Atmosphere (CIRA) at Colorado State Univ. - NOAA CI Contract Nos. NA17RJ1228; NA09OAR4320074;
  - v. Cooperative Institute for Meteorological Satellite Studies (CIMSS) at the Univ. of Wisconsin-Madison - NOAA CI Contract Nos. NA06NES4400002; NA10NES4400013;
  - vi. Cooperative Institute for Arctic Research (CIFAR - I) at the Univ. of Alaska-Fairbanks - NOAA CI Contract No. NA17RJ1224;
  - vii. Cooperative Institute for Alaskan Research (CIFAR - II) at the Univ. of Alaska-Fairbanks - NOAA CI Contract No. NA08OAR4320751; CI Shadow Contract No. NA08OAR4320870;
  - viii. Cooperative Institute for Climate Applications and Research (CICAR) at Columbia Univ. - NOAA CI Contract Nos. NA03OAR4320179 and NA08OAR4320754; CI Shadow Grant No. NA08OAR4320912;
  - ix. Cooperative Institute for Limnology and Ecosystems Research (CILER) at the Univ. of Michigan - NOAA CI Contract No. NA07OAR4320006;
  - x. Cooperative Institute for Marine and Atmospheric Studies (CIMAS) at the Univ. of Miami - NOAA CI Contract No. NA17RJ1226; CI

- Continuation Award NA08OAR4320892; CI Shadow Award NA08OAR4320889;
- xi. Cooperative Institute for Mesoscale Meteorological Studies (CIMMS) at the Univ. of Oklahoma - NOAA CI Contract No. NA17RJ1227; CI Extension Agreement NA08OAR4320904; CI Shadow Agreement NA08OAR4320886;
  - xii. The undisclosed CI Agreement(s) NOAA entered into with the Cooperative Institute for Oceanographic Satellite Studies (CIOSS) at Oregon State Univ. (if different from the CI Agreements NOAA entered into with CIMRS);
  - xiii. Cooperative Institute for Marine Resources Studies (CIMRS) at Oregon State Univ. – NOAA CI Contract Nos. NA17FE2705; NA17FE1167; NA17RJ1362; NA06NMF4550286;
  - xiv. Cooperative Institute for Research in Environmental Sciences (CIRES) at the Univ. of Colorado-Boulder - NOAA CI Contract No. NA17RJ1229;
  - xv. Joint Institute for Marine and Atmospheric Research (JIMAR) at the Univ. of Hawaii – NOAA CI Contract Nos. NA17RJ1230; NA08OAR4320910; NA09OAR4320075;
  - xvi. Cooperative Institute for Pacific Island Research at the Joint Institute for Marine and Atmospheric Research (JIMAR/CIPIR) at the Univ. of Hawaii - NOAA CI Contract Nos. NA09OAR4320075; NA11NMF4320128;
  - xvii. Joint Institute for the Study of the Atmosphere and Ocean (JISAO) at the Univ. of Washington - NOAA CI Contract No. NA10OAR4320148;
  - xviii. North Gulf Institute (NGI) at Mississippi State Univ. - NOAA CI Contract No. NA06OAR4320264;
  - xix. Joint Institute for Marine Observations (JIMO) at UC San Diego Scripps Institution - NOAA CI Contract Nos. NA17RJ1231; NA08OAR4320894;
  - xx. Cooperative Institute for Marine Ecosystems and Climate (CIMEC) at UC San Diego - NOAA CI Contract No. NA10OAR4320156;
  - xxi. Cooperative Institute for Ocean Exploration, Research and Technology (CIOERT) at Florida Atlantic Univ. - NOAA CI Contract No. NA09OAR4320073; and
  - xxii. Cooperative Institute for the North Atlantic Region (CINAR) at Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution - NOAA CI Contract No. NA09OAR4320129.”

This concludes the first tranche/cache of clearly and obviously identified documents for which ITSSD FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694 seeks full and uncensored immediate disclosure, and with respect to which NOAA, pursuant to our verbal agreement, should have no difficulty searching and providing digital files.



Twenty-five (25) business days have elapsed since ITSSD first filed FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694, and nineteen (19) business days have elapsed since ITSSD filed its Clarification of said request in response to NOAA's declared need for "further clarification". ITSSD, therefore, expects that NOAA will be able to provide, in good faith, full and uncensored disclosure of digital copies of each clearly and obviously identified document set forth above in a prompt and expeditious manner, *by no later than* November 10, 2014.

ITSSD also expects that the estimated cost of searching *for these documents* will be far less than NOAA's prior "initial fee estimate [...of] \$7500 for search fees."<sup>23</sup>

Please note that despite its willingness, yet again, to accommodate NOAA's request for clarification, ITSSD hereby reserves all and does not waive any of its rights under the FOIA statute (5 U.S. Code §552 et seq.) and applicable NOAA FOIA regulations (15 C.F.R. §4.1 et seq.).

Very truly yours,

*Lawrence A. Kogan*

Lawrence A. Kogan  
ITSSD  
CEO

---

## ENDNOTES

<sup>1</sup> See Institute for Trade, Standards and Sustainable Development, *Filing of New ITSSD FOIA Request [No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694] and Withdrawal of FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-000714* (Sept. 22, 2014), available at: <https://nebula.wsimg.com/86e0c3d9f0c18e77b33e25d935498bcc?AccessKeyId=39A2DC689E4CA87C906D&disposition=0&alloworigin=1>. As the text of FOIA request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694 states, “ITSSD hereby files this new FOIA Request to supersede the current ITSSD FOIA Request, Docket No. NOAA-HQ-2014-000714, as supplemented by the May 5, 2014 FOIA Request Clarification, which are each hereby simultaneously withdrawn (without prejudice).” See also Institute for Trade, Standards and Sustainable Development, *Clarification of New FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694* (Oct. 1, 2014), available at: <https://nebula.wsimg.com/43d251976355e191bb523611a8fd1cd2?AccessKeyId=39A2DC689E4CA87C906D&disposition=0&alloworigin=1>. And, as the text of the Clarification of FOIA request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694 states, “[t]he Institute for Trade, Standards and Sustainable Development (ITSSD) is in receipt of your correspondence dated September 30, 2014, wherein you cite 15 C.F.R. Section 4.4(c), thereby implying without clearly stating that ITSSD’s new FOIA request for NOAA records is not “described in enough detail to enable Department personnel to locate them with a reasonable amount of effort,” and effectively indicating that NOAA refuses to process ITSSD’s FOIA request until a clarification of the records sought is provided. We appreciate your phone call of this morning seeking to explain your call for greater clarification of ITSSD’s recently filed FOIA request. ITSSD disagrees with the NOAA National FOIA Office’s insinuation that ITSSD’s request does not reasonably describe the records” sought. ITSSD, however, without waiving any of its rights under FOIA, will respond to your offices’ latest request “to clarify the records” ITSSD is seeking.”

<sup>2</sup> See Institute for Trade, Standards and Sustainable Development, *Filing of New ITSSD FOIA Request [No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694] and Withdrawal of FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-000714* (Sept. 22, 2014), *supra*; Institute for Trade, Standards and Sustainable Development, *Clarification of New FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694* (Oct. 1, 2014), available at: <https://nebula.wsimg.com/43d251976355e191bb523611a8fd1cd2?AccessKeyId=39A2DC689E4CA87C906D&disposition=0&alloworigin=1>. As the text of FOIA request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694 states, “ITSSD hereby files this new FOIA Request to supersede the current ITSSD FOIA Request, Docket No. NOAA-HQ-2014-000714, as supplemented by the May 5, 2014 FOIA Request Clarification, which are each hereby simultaneously withdrawn (without prejudice).” See also Institute for Trade, Standards and Sustainable Development, *Re: FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-000714*, (March 26, 2014), available at: <http://nebula.wsimg.com/1ec660f37bd6e62a136dbf64b95ff247?AccessKeyId=39A2DC689E4CA87C906D&disposition=0&alloworigin=1>.

<sup>3</sup> See “Appendix I: EPA-TSD Table 1.1 “Core Reference Documents”” (at p. 86), referencing United States Environmental Protection Agency, *Technical Support Document for the Advanced Notice of Proposed Rulemaking for Greenhouse Gases; Stationary Sources, Section VII - EPA-HQ-OAR-2008-0318-0081* (June 5, 2008, Final Draft), at Table 1.1, available at: <http://www.regulations.gov/#!documentDetail;D=EPA-HQ-OAR-2008-0318-0081>.

<sup>4</sup> See U.S. Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research, *Temperature Trends in the Lower Atmosphere: Steps for Understanding and Reconciling Differences (SAP1.1/CCSP(2006))*, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, National Climatic Data Center (Thomas R. Karl, Susan J. Hassol, Christopher D. Miller, and William L. Murray, editors, 2006), available at: <http://downloads.globalchange.gov/sap/sap1-1/sap1-1-final-all.pdf>.

<sup>5</sup> See e.g., U.S. Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research, *Reanalysis of Historical Climate Data for Key Atmospheric Features: Implications for Attribution of Causes of Observed Change (SAP1.3/CCSP(2008g))*, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, National Climatic Data Center (Randall Dole, Martin Hoerling, and Siegfried Schubert (eds.)) (2008), at Sec. 2.5.2, p. 43, available at: <http://library.globalchange.gov/sap-1-3-reanalysis-of-historical-climate-data-for-key-atmospheric-features-implications-for-attribution-of-causes-of-observed-change>.



<sup>6</sup> See, e.g., U.S. Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research, *Trends in Emissions of Ozone-Depleting Substances, Ozone Layer Recovery, and Implications for Ultraviolet Radiation Exposure (SAP 2.4/CCSP(2008h))*, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, National Climatic Data Center (Ravishankara, A.R., M.J. Kurylo, and C.A. Ennis (eds.)), at Sections 4.3 and 4.3.1, pp. 120, 121, available at: <http://downloads.globalchange.gov/sap/sap2-4/sap2-4-final-all.pdf>.

<sup>7</sup> See, e.g., U.S. Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research, *Climate Projections Based on Emissions Scenarios for Long-Lived and Short-Lived Radiatively Active Gases and Aerosols (SAP 3.2/CCSP(2008d))*, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, National Climatic Data Center (H. Levy II, D.T. Shindell, A. Gilliland, M.D. Schwarzkopf, L.W. Horowitz, (eds.)), at Sec. 2.1, p. 17, Sec. 2.2, p. 19, Sec. 2.3, p. 20, available at: <http://downloads.globalchange.gov/sap/sap3-2/sap3-2-final-report-all.pdf>.

<sup>8</sup> See, e.g., U.S. Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research, *Weather and Climate Extremes in a Changing Climate. Regions of Focus: North America, Hawaii, Caribbean, and U.S. Pacific Islands (SAP3.3/CCSP(2008i))*, Department of Commerce, NOAA's National Climatic Data Center (Thomas R. Karl, Gerald A. Meehl, Christopher D. Miller, Susan J. Hassol, Anne M. Waple, and William L. Murray (eds.)), at Sec. 3.2.4.3.1, pp. 95, 97, Sec. 3.3.9, p. 106, available at: <http://downloads.globalchange.gov/sap/sap3-3/sap3-3-final-all.pdf>

<sup>9</sup> See United States Department of Commerce, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, *State of the Climate in 2008 (SOC-2008)*, Bulletin of the Meteorological Society Vol. 90, No. 8 (T.C. Peterson and M.O. Baringer, Eds. 2009), *supra* at Figure 2.33, p. S40, p. S47-S48, S52, S65, S67, S71, S104, S110-S111, S113, available at: <http://www1.ncdc.noaa.gov/pub/data/cmb/bams-sotc/climate-assessment-2008-lo-rez.pdf>.

<sup>10</sup> See U.S. Department of Commerce National Oceanographic Administration, *The First State of the Carbon Cycle Report (SOCCR): The North American Carbon Budget and Implications for the Global Carbon Cycle, (SAP2.2/CCSP(2007))*, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, National Climatic Data Center (King, A.W., L. Dilling, G.P. Zimmerman, D.M. Fairman, R.A. Houghton, G. Marland, A.Z. Rose, and T.J. Wilbanks (eds.)), available at: <http://downloads.globalchange.gov/sap/sap2-2/sap2-2-final-all.pdf>.

<sup>11</sup> See U.S. Department of Commerce National Oceanographic Administration, *Best Practice Approaches for Characterizing, Communicating, and Incorporating Scientific Uncertainty in Decisionmaking, (SAP5.2/CCSP(2009))* (M. Granger Morgan (Lead Author), Hadi Dowlatabadi, Max Henrion, David Keith, Robert Lempert, Sandra McBride, Mitchell Small, and Thomas Wilbanks (Contributing Authors)), available at: <http://downloads.globalchange.gov/sap/sap5-2/sap5-2-final-report-all.pdf>.

<sup>12</sup> See U.S. Department of Commerce National Oceanographic Administration, *Decision Support Experiments and Evaluations Using Seasonal to Interannual Forecasts and Observational Data: A Focus on Water Resources, (SAP5.3/CCSP(2008))* (Nancy Beller-Simms, Helen Ingram, David Feldman, Nathan Mantua, Katharine L. Jacobs, and Anne M. Waple (eds.)), available at: <http://downloads.globalchange.gov/sap/sap5-3/sap5-3-final-all.pdf>.

<sup>13</sup> See National Research Council, *Review of the U.S. Climate Change Science Program's Synthesis and Assessment Product 1.1, "Temperature Trends in the Lower Atmosphere: Steps for Understanding and Reconciling Differences"*, (Wash., DC), The National Academies Press (2005), at pp. ii, 53, available at: [http://www.nap.edu/download.php?record\\_id=11285](http://www.nap.edu/download.php?record_id=11285).

<sup>14</sup> See National Research Council, *Review of the U.S. Climate Change Science Program's Synthesis and Assessment Product 1.3: Reanalyses of Historical Climate Data for Key Atmospheric Features: Implications for Attribution of Causes of Observed Change*, Washington, DC, The National Academies Press (2008), at p. vi, available at: [http://www.nap.edu/openbook.php?record\\_id=12135](http://www.nap.edu/openbook.php?record_id=12135).

<sup>15</sup> See National Research Council, *Review of the U.S. Climate Change Science Program's Synthesis and Assessment Product 3.2, "Climate Projections Based on Emission Scenarios for Long-lived and Short-lived Radiatively Active Gases and Aerosols"*, (Wash., DC), The National Academies Press (2007), at p. vi, available at: [http://www.nap.edu/openbook.php?record\\_id=12035](http://www.nap.edu/openbook.php?record_id=12035).

<sup>16</sup> See National Research Council, *Review of the U.S. Climate Change Science Program's Synthesis and Assessment Product 5.2, "Best Practice Approaches for Characterizing, Communicating, and Incorporating Scientific Uncertainty in Climate Decision Making"*, Wash., DC, The National Academies Press (2007), at p. ii, available at: [http://www.nap.edu/openbook.php?record\\_id=11873](http://www.nap.edu/openbook.php?record_id=11873).

---

<sup>17</sup> See National Research Council, *Review of the U.S. Climate Change Science Program's Draft Synthesis and Assessment Product 2.4: Trends in Emissions of Ozone Depleting Substances, Ozone Layer Recovery, and Implications for Ultraviolet Radiation Exposure*, (Wash., DC), The National Academies Press (2007), at p. vi, [http://www.nap.edu/openbook.php?record\\_id=12076](http://www.nap.edu/openbook.php?record_id=12076).

<sup>18</sup> See National Research Council, *Review of the U.S. Climate Change Science Program's Synthesis and Assessment Product 3.3, "Weather and Climate Extremes in a Changing Climate"*, (Washington, DC) The National Academies Press (2007), at p. ii, available at: [http://www.nap.edu/openbook.php?record\\_id=11973](http://www.nap.edu/openbook.php?record_id=11973).

<sup>19</sup> See National Research Council, *Review of the U.S. Climate Change Science Program's Draft Synthesis and Assessment Product 5.3: Decision-Support Experiments and Evaluations Using Seasonal to Interannual Forecasts and Observational Data* (2008), at p. ii, available at: [http://www.nap.edu/openbook.php?record\\_id=12087](http://www.nap.edu/openbook.php?record_id=12087).

<sup>20</sup> See National Research Council, *Radiative Forcing of Climate Change: Expanding the Concept and Addressing Uncertainties* (National Academies Press, Wash., DC 2005), at p. ii, available at: [http://www.nap.edu/catalog.php?record\\_id=11175](http://www.nap.edu/catalog.php?record_id=11175).

<sup>21</sup> See National Research Council, *Mitigating Shore Erosion along Sheltered Coasts* (National Academies Press, Wash., DC 2007), at p. ii, available at: [http://www.nap.edu/download.php?record\\_id=11764](http://www.nap.edu/download.php?record_id=11764).

<sup>22</sup> See National Research Council, *Abrupt Climate Change: Inevitable Surprises*, (National Academies Press, Wash., DC 2002), at p. ii, available at: [http://www.nap.edu/download.php?record\\_id=10136](http://www.nap.edu/download.php?record_id=10136).

<sup>23</sup> See National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, *NOAA Denial of Fee Waiver Request (Re: FOIA Request No. DOC-NOAA-2014-001694)* (Oct. 10, 2014), available at: <https://nebula.wsimg.com/31e7bfa1e15c1162c804285d7b5e8140?AccessKeyId=39A2DC689E4CA87C906D&disposition=0&alloworigin=1>.