## Lamorinda School Bus Transportation Agency Regular Meeting AGENDA

# DATE: September 12, 2017 TIME: 1:00 p.m.

City of Lafayette, 3675 Mt. Diablo Blvd., Lafayette CA Conference Room 240 (Second Floor)

- 1) CALL TO ORDER
- 2) ADOPTION OF AGENDA
- 3) PUBLIC COMMENT items not on the agenda
- 4) ADOPTION OF MINUTES (June 8, 2017 and July13, 2017)
- 5) NEW BUSINESS
  - a. Update on Enrollment for 2017-18 School Year
  - b. Update from First Student drivers and buses
  - c. Update from Orinda Subcommittee
- 6) LATE BUS REPORTS
- CHAIR AND BOARD MEMBERS' REPORTS
- 8) WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS
- 9) NEXT MEETING DATE TBD
- 10) ADJOURNMENT

I, Juliet Hansen, declare under penalty of perjury, that this agenda has been posted at least 72 hours in advance in the following locations: City of Lafayette Offices, 3675 Mt. Diablo Blvd., in the glass case downstairs, Lafayette, CA.

### Juliet Hansen, Program Manager

<sup>\*</sup>Any writings or documents pertaining to an open session item provided to a majority of the LSBTA less than 72 hours prior to the meeting shall be made available for public inspection at the Lamorinda School Bus Program office at 3675 Mt. Diablo Blvd., Suite 255, Lafayette CA during normal business hours. Agendas and packets are available for review by the public during regular Monday – Friday work hours at the Lamorinda School Bus Program office at 3675 Mt. Diablo Blvd., Suite 255, Lafayette CA and on the website at <a href="https://www.lamorindaschoolbus.org">www.lamorindaschoolbus.org</a> Agendas and packets shall be made available at least 72 hours in advance of each meeting. Upon request this agenda will be made available in appropriate alternative formats to persons with disabilities, as required by Section 202 of the ADA Act of 1990 (42 U.S.D. Sec. 12132). Any person with a disability who requires a modification or accommodation in order to participate in a meeting should direct such request to Juliet Hansen, Program Manager, at 925-299-3216 at least 48 hours before the meeting if possible.

# Lamorinda School Bus Transportation Agency

### **DRAFT MINUTES**

Orinda Union School District 8 Altarinda Rd. Orinda, CA 94563 Date: June 8, 2017 Time: 7:00 p.m.

Present: Chair Tatzin, Vice Chair Worth, Board Members Kendzierski, Gerson, Fritsky and Rossiter. Absent: O'Donnell.

Also Present: Patrick Kneib and Ian Jones, School Bus Consultants, Larry Theis, Orinda Public Works Director, Jason Chen, Orinda Senior Engineer; Juliet Hansen, LSBP Staff, approximately 50 members of the public.

- 1. Call to Order The meeting was called to order at 7:32 p.m. by Chair Tatzin.
- 2. Adoption of Agenda The agenda was adopted as amended, consolidating all the recommendations in Old Business M/S/C/U (Worth/Kendzierski).
- 3. Public Comment none.
- 4. Approval of Minutes The minutes of May 15, 2017 (both AM meeting and PM meeting) were approved as written, M/S/C/U (Fritsky/Kendzierski).
- 5. Old Business
- a. Presentation by School Bus Consultants (SBC) re: School Bus Stop Study

Chair Tatzin opened the meeting by stating there would be no decisions tonight due to some last minute information from the CHP and clarification needed. Program Manager Juliet Hansen reviewed the staff report and reported on the events since the last meeting.

Ms. Hansen stated that the CHP called yesterday afternoon. CHP may have a different interpretation of CVC 22504 (c) in that it may apply only to unincorporated areas. She said historically for 20 years both First Student and Durham School Services have indicated that the 200 ft. sight distance requirement for 25 mph roads applies to all students, regardless of where they live. Staff will have clarification at the next meeting.

Patrick Kneib summarized SBC's findings. Mr. Kneib stated SBC looked at narrow lane width with regard to bus stops and also traveling on the roads between bus stops. Traveling on narrow roads is problematic because if the 8 ft. wide bus is obstructing the passage of cars coming the opposite direction, someone has to either back up or pull off the roadway. SBC looked at the narrowness of the roads through the lens of industry best practices. Board member Gerson asked about the 200 ft. requirement. Mr. Kneib said it is a common industry standard and his understanding is that First Student has a corporate policy to follow this standard for all students.

Board member Worth stated her understanding is that there are some compliant bus stops on Route 18, but there are challenges with narrow lane width, terrain, curves, pitch, double yellow lines, etc. Mr. Kneib replied in the affirmative and stated that the question was asked, "Is this road safe for school bus travel?" In their field work on El Toyonal, they witnessed cars constantly crossing over the double yellow lines. Using the 8 ft. bus as a benchmark (9 ft. with the mirrors), they observed that in many places, vehicles cannot travel without encroaching into the oncoming lane or crossing the double yellow

lines. Some areas have less than 7 ft. lanes. He stated that even without the double yellow lines, there are lanes that are too narrow for a school bus to travel safely. Also, along the curves, the bus will swing wide in the front and most likely the rear wheels will cross the double yellow lines.

Mr. Kneib stated SBC has done some preliminary research on the Trans Tech narrow school buses suggested by parents. The narrowest Trans Tech bus is 87 inches in width, not including the mirrors. He stated some sections of the roadway are still too narrow for these buses and the use of these buses would not eliminate all the problems or all the risks.

Director of Public Works Larry Theis stated he will work with SBC to identify the very narrow or pinch points. He is concerned with removing the double yellow lines everywhere and mentioned a lot of the striping is based on past requests from residents. The placement of the lines is discretionary.

Chair Tatzin opened the floor for public comment. Mary Franklin from El Toyonal stated the road is narrow and dangerous and students should not have to walk up the hill. She said people don't obey the speed limit and property prices will drop if the bus is eliminated. Luke Franklin, OIS student, stated he would feel at risk walking because of vehicle speeds and traveling over the double yellow lines. Mr. Kneib clarified that there is no recommendation from SBC to walk on El Toyonal.

Laura Allaire, Wagner Ranch parent liaison, supported narrower buses and stated most Wagner Ranch parents would not use the Orinda library stop; they would drive to school. Larry Sutter expressed concern that children will be hit on the road. Michael Bowen from El Toyonal said the study is misleading. El Toyonal has always been a narrow, winding place and the board should reject the proposal and defer the decision for another year. Amy Roach from El Toyonal supported running the route for another year. She stated CVC 22504 (a) only refers to passing a stopped vehicle. The residents need more data and more time to look at the double yellow lines. David Volk from Route 18 stated the school bus is the safest and he supports continuing the bus for the whole road.

Laura Disston said there are 22 students from OIS on the Camino Don Miguel/Manzanita bus and they were not contacted directly about this meeting. She stated there is a safe bus stop on Bobolink and no double yellow lines on Camino Don Miguel. The neighborhood is the official detour for the large vehicles re: the sinkhole on Miner.

Kevin Schraith from Sleepy Hollow 13 stated he will now be 1.5 miles from a group bus stop. There are no double yellow lines where he lives and eliminating this section (Diablo View) will affect property values.

John Barnes from El Toyonal said the study was not done by professional engineers. He questioned how the roads were measured. Joanne Wagner from the Camino Don Miguel neighborhood Route 11 stated she works full time and needs safe school bus transportation. She stated she would move if she can't use the bus and encouraged delaying a decision. Jeremy Conescu from Route 12 stated his stop is now closer to the Country Club and he feels this is not safe.

Andrea Persinger from Camino Don Miguel stated she bought the house because of the bus. She has three students at three different schools and it will be a burden without the bus. Anja Luthde from El Toyonal said the comparison of safety should be made objectively. She said she didn't know about the meeting. She wanted to know the cost savings of the changes. Chair Tatzin clarified there is no cost savings to the LSBTA; it plans to run the same number of buses next year.

Elizabeth Anders from Route 13 said she didn't understand the reference to narrow versus degraded road. In 2019 Diablo View will be re-done. There are no double yellow lines and her student will have to walk to the group stop. Leih Schien from Camino Del Diablo stated all of Orinda is incorporated. Michelle Swaney from El Toyonal said she purchased her home because of the school bus stop. She said CVC

22504 refers to bus stops and unincorporated areas and not to narrow roads. There is only one bus stop eliminated from 18-1 (Wagner Ranch). She wanted to know where the bus crosses over the double yellow lines.

James Strickler from Loma Vista stated school buses are the safest. He found SBC lacking in credentials and knowledge of the law. He found that 95% of the lower road is in compliance. Sarah Butler, former OUSD board member and resident of Overhill Rd. questioned why the (Route 15) bus cannot use Davis Rd.

Jason Matthews, parent, stated that he measured the upper loop on Route 18 and many sections are near compliant. The bulk is 17.5 ft. wide, but 4 inch curbs are installed which removes 8 inches of roadway. In the location of the 2014 bus accident, the lines are painted so that there is a 7.5 ft. lane and a 11.5 ft. lane. Most of Camino del Diablo would be compliant if the double yellow lines were adjusted. #331-#345 El Toyonal is a very narrow stretch which varies from 13.6 ft. to 15.6 ft. He stated there is no way to be compliant here. He suggested giving the road to the bus (w/the placement of the double yellow lines) as the bus only travels in one direction. Charlie and Shelby Matthews (students) also worried about walking.

Alvin Ziegler stated he grew up on Camino Don Miguel and he bought a house in good faith with bus service. He asked to postpone a decision. Wendy Swinton from Route 18 said the reality of life is that students will walk on the road without the bus. James and Ava Swinton (students) said their mom will make them walk. At 4:00 p.m. there is no parking at the library. She said she found narrower school buses and the 20 passenger buses are \$55,000 and \$62,000. None are in California right now. Christina Loughran from Route 18 said please look out for our kids. Laura Abrams from El Toyonal stated when the road was repaved, berms and curbs were added and now the road is more narrow.

Board Member Gerson said he understands the need for solutions, but the LSBTA is basically on notice that the buses are breaking the law on Route 18 by crossing the double yellow lines. The LSBTA has a fiduciary responsibility. He wondered if the double yellow lines could be replaced with bumps (dots).

Chair Tatzin stated that whether it's the double yellow lines, or the roads are just too narrow, it's the City of Orinda's issue. He reminded the board that each of the agencies in the LSBTA is liable. He would like updated information regarding CVC 22504. He also needs to know from First Student under what conditions it will continue the routes. He supported analyzing the smaller buses. However, if there is a 500 ft. section that isn't compliant and you can't get pass a school bus, he can't support continuing.

Board Member Worth stated that the LSBTA's goal is to preserve service wherever possible. She said the first priority is to continue with the existing buses. She needs to understand from First Student under what conditions they will continue the service. She thinks some streets can be widened (Charles Hill/Diablo View) with the 2019 work. She wondered if there were ways to incorporate the narrower buses.

Board Member Jeanette Fritsky said attorneys were consulted for this. She wondered if there was a grace period to solve problems. She wanted to know about bus service for disabled students. Board Member Rossiter said she wasn't clear on narrow roadways where there isn't a bus stop. She would like to revisit this.

Board Member Worth stated that she would like Public Works and SBC to better define the road deficiencies, to explore narrower buses and request information from First Student. She stated that since we are not revising the contract with First Student, they will determine if they can continue the routes.

Larry Theis stated that if the double yellows were replaced with a single yellow, the First Student buses would still be at fault by crossing the line. He said that, realistically, to continue bus service, some areas

will need widening which is a larger CIP project. If approved by the City, this would involve hiring a consultant and the time frame is one year at best.

Board Member Gerson stated we may have to modify routes for a period of time. Chair Tatzin noted that there may be a six month lead time to get narrow buses. Board Member Rossiter wondered if narrower buses would really solve the problem.

Mr. Kneib from SBC stated that it wasn't a requirement to be a traffic engineer to do the study. In the field they watched the Route 18 bus cross the double yellow lines multiple times per day. There are sections that are very narrow, even cars were crossing the lines.

There was some discussion about approving an additional \$5,000 for SBC to continue the work. There was a M/S/C/U (Worth/Gerson) to approve \$5,000.

Mr. Kneib clarified that the alternatives in the study can be done now. Fixing the roads takes time.

- 6. Next Meeting Date July 13, 2017
- 7. Adjournment The meeting was adjourned at 9:45 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Juliet Hansen, Program Manager

# Lamorinda School Bus Transportation Agency

### **DRAFT MINUTES**

Orinda Library 26 Orinda Way Orinda, CA 94563 Date: July 13, 2017 Time: 7:00 p.m.

Present: Chair Tatzin, Vice Chair Worth, Board Members Kendzierski, Gerson, Fritsky, O'Donnell and Rossiter. Absent: None.

Also Present: Patrick Kneib and Ian Jones, School Bus Consultants; Larry Theis, Orinda Public Works Director, Jason Chen, Orinda Senior Engineer; Dave Collins, Henry Cooper and Jose Bazurto First Student; Juliet Hansen and Sue Graves, LSBP Staff; Mala Subramanian.

- 1. Call to Order The meeting was called to order at 7:01 p.m. by Chair Tatzin.
- 2. Adoption of Agenda The agenda was adopted M/S/C/U (Kendzierski/Fritsky).
- 3. Public Comment none.
- 4. Approval of Minutes Adoption of the June 8, 2017 minutes was postponed due to objection by Orinda resident Michael Bowen, M/S/C/U (Worth/Fritsky). Mr. Bowen was directed to provide any changes to LSBTA staff.
- 5. Old Business
- a. Presentation by School Bus Consultants (SBC) re: School Bus Stop Study

Program Manager Juliet Hansen reviewed her staff report for the Board. There was a meeting with the Orinda Park Pool (OPP) to discuss a potential bus stop in the parking lot. After reviewing the proposal, the OPP Board denied the request. Orinda Public Works Director, Larry Theis, held a community meeting with the constituents of El Toyonal Route 18. He discussed the narrowness of the road and that it cannot be fixed to eliminate all the problems for the bus. He proposed using a pilot car to provide assistance to the bus. Ms. Hansen stated that pilot cars are used to escort large commercial vehicles with wide loads with no passengers. The CHP confirmed that pilot cars are not used anywhere for the transportation of school children. The Route 18 parents have requested an extension of service while a solution is considered. First Student does not own buses less than 8 feet wide in its Northern California fleet. During an independent review by First Student, it found significant operational safety issues on Route 11, Route 13 and Route 18. First Student stated that operating narrower school buses will not fix the safety issues and removing the double yellow lines will not fix them. First Student does not recommend operating school bus routes with a pilot car. In a letter dated July 7, 2017 First Student states "Due to the extreme narrowness (6-7 ft.) of the lanes and multiple sharp blind turns, First Student will not operate in these areas or support the use of a pilot car to escort a school bus." Ms. Hansen stated that re-routing to stay off narrow roadways is a good option, though not popular with some parents. By offering the same number of buses with modified pick-ups, it continues its goal of traffic mitigation. With school starting in a number of weeks, the staff recommendation is to endorse modifications to bus stops and routes recommended by SBC and direct staff to open up registration for Orinda with an early bird price and deadline of August 10th.

Chair Tatzin asked LSBTA legal counsel, Mala Subramanian, to review the legal issues for the board. Ms. Subramanian stated that the LSBTA is a JPA (Joint Powers Authority) and is a separate legal entity. It has contractual liability with regard to tort which could pass to member agencies. First Student has

insurance in the amount of 20 million dollars, but not in respect to negligence or wrongful acts. In the Education Code, the LSBTA could face liability when violating the California Vehicle Code. The continued use of bus stop with inadequate sight distance would constitute a misdemeanor for individual board members.

Board member Worth offered that it was her understanding that crossing the double yellow lines adds liability exposure. Board Member Fritsky stated it was her understanding in talking with Ms. Subramanian that if there is negligence and 20 million is not enough, liability would be passed on to the individual entities. Ms. Subramanian answered in the affirmative.

Board Member Rossiter asked for the distinction between bus routes with vehicle code violations versus those with none. Ms. Subramanian stated that the highest liability exposure would be in cases where there is no legal standing, such as operating a non-compliant bus stop in violation of Vehicle Code Section 22504. The next highest or middle exposure would be crossing over the double yellow lines. The lower exposure would be operating routes which are not recommended for travel due to operational standards. Ms. Subramanian clarified that the LSBTA is not indemnified at present for negligence or misconduct.

Chair Tatzin asked about the contractual liabilities of First Student with regard to continuing bus routes. Ms. Subramanian stated that First Student is contractual required to provide bus service, but it is also required per the transportation contract to comply with the California Vehicle Code and other laws. In fact, the LSBTA can assess liquidated damages for operating in an illegal or unsafe manner. Board Member Fritsky asked if parents could sign waivers. Ms. Subramanian stated that they could, but we still wouldn't have waivers from other drivers on the road.

Patrick Kneib from School Bus Consultants (SBC) noted the July 6, 2017 report is a revised report. Regarding bus stops, 81 stops were found to be non-compliant with California Vehicle Code Section 22504 with regard to sight distance. 46 of these were active bus stops. 40 alternative bus stops were recommended. Regarding narrow roads, he stated their previous recommendations remain intact. Ian Jones, SBC, reviewed the narrow roadway tables and maps added to the report. Mr. Jones referred to the sections that discuss the roadway used for Routes 11, 13 and 18. On Route 11 there is a 35 foot section near 46 Bobolink which measured at 7'8" in lane width. A bus traveling here would be in violation of California Vehicle Code 21460 (crossing over double yellow lines). Camino Don Miguel has sections that are less than 16' in road width. Hacienda is wider, but operation is difficult due to vehicles parked on either side of the road. Some sections of the roadway used for Route 13 are less than 16' in width. There are no double yellow lines on Diablo View, but there is a lack of a turn around area. Therefore, SBC recommends a group bus stop for Route 13 at the St. Stephen's Church. Route 18 has some roadways less than 16 ft. wide with some single lanes less than 7 feet wide. Mr. Kneib stated that operating narrower school buses would not solve the problems on these routes.

Vice Chair Worth asked if it was possible to reinstate the stops on Brookwood if the bus was allowed to turn around. Mr. Kneib replied, yes, but he would have to check for a compliant bus stop on Brookwood. Board Member Worth asked for clarification on Route 11-2. Would it be feasible to stop at Manzanita @ Acacia? Mr. Jones said he would check. Mr. Jones clarified the biggest bottleneck is near #46 Bobolink.

Chair Tatzin asked about industry best practices. Mr. Knieb replied that best practices can be found at SBC, the National School Bus Council, NHTSA and other sites. SBC started with the measurement of the buses – 9 ft. wide with mirrors - and concluded that lanes less than 9 ft. wide would cause the buses to cross over into oncoming traffic or cause the bus to pull off the road which is not operationally safe. SBC did its own research on narrower school buses. Chair Tatzin asked if the narrower school buses would violate the California Vehicle Code with regard to crossing over the double yellow lines. Mr. Knieb answered in the affirmative.

Vice Chair Worth asked about Route 18, El Toyonal. Mr. Knieb stated that SBC tried to find a safe place to turn around, but there are no areas except for the OPP. A mirror on El Toyonal could assist the driver in exiting the driveway and mitigating the curve.

Chair Tatzin asked about the pilot car. Dave Collins from First Student stated that a pilot car is not used anywhere in the school bus industry. The pilot car driver has no authority to direct traffic or to stop traffic. Mr. Collins confirmed that the company does not operate buses narrower than 8 ft. wide. There is also the issue of the turning radius of the bus. The smallest bus First Student operates still has a 130 inch wide wheelbase.

Board Member Gerson asked why the buses have been operating for so many years in Orinda given the problems. Mr. Collins stated he couldn't answer that, but that First Student is always striving for safety and that Henry Cooper saw a problem and got the regional safety team to look at it. Mr. Cooper clarified that he was hired as the location manager during the 2014-15 school year. There were a number of incidents, accidents and concerns expressed by the drivers. He rode with some of them and observed conditions of concern. First Student safety coordinators came out and noted operational challenges and safety risks and vehicles operating illegally. There have been a number of sideswipes, vehicles going off the road and mail boxes getting hit. First Student has been lucky and fortunate so far (that nothing serious has happened.)

Board Member Rossiter asked about Diablo View since there are no double yellow lines up there and no legal violations. Mr. Collins stated that the company must err on the side of caution, even with no legal violations. Mr. Cooper stated that he has worked in many places including Vallejo Unified and Michaels and what he has seen in Orinda is unprecedented. Mr. Collins stated that in his 25 years of transportation he has never experienced school bus travel on these kinds of roads. The company cannot continue to put drivers in this kind of situation going forward.

Vice Chair Worth asked for more detail on a spotter car. Mr. Collins stated it is unprecedented in the industry and there is no authority over traffic. He would entertain the idea of a police escort, but not a pilot car. Chair Tatzin indicated fire trucks and other large vehicles travel on these roads. Mr. Collins stated that they are not carrying 47 students (referring to the number of students on Route 18).

Mr. Larry Theis stated he held two meetings with parents. He stated that to implement capital improvements would take time; one area would take at least 6 to 9 months. Multiple areas would take more time. Parents would like the board to consider an extension of time through the next school year or the use of a pilot car. He agreed the pilot car is unprecedented and does not have authority to direct traffic, but a pilot car driver could radio back to bus driver to stay back or if clear to pass through. Route 11 and 13 would be difficult to address with a pilot car because the whole route is not affected by the changes proposed by SBC. Mr. Theis stated he also looked at the loops on El Toyonal. Making the road one way doesn't serve all bus stops and would take time and affects a lot of people.

Board Member Rossiter asked legal counsel if the LSBTA would still have liability in terms of accidents or crossing over double yellow lines. Ms. Subramanian answered in the affirmative. The board took a five minute break at 8:55 p.m.

Chair Tatzin opened the floor for public comment. Eileen Fitz Faulkner from Route 18 used the bus for eleven years and bought the property because of the school bus. The bus drivers are good. Accidents happen, but double turning axels like fire trucks are needed. Nick Koslz from Route 18 and 11 stated he purchased his house based on the bus. He stated the board could get another consultant/traffic engineer to re-look at having the bus service versus having no bus service. Mr. Bowen from Route 18 stated that the first SBC report was flawed and SBC has a lack of proficiency and has provided no data or traffic records. He asked the board to focus on school buses being the safest form of transportation.

Elizabeth Anders from Route 13 said the stop was at the end of her driveway and now she will have to go the St. Stephens Church walking on multiple roads which are unsafe with no sidewalks. The route between home and stop was not considered. Traffic will increase with driving to bus stops. Rob Smith from Route 18 is an engineer and his son has ridden on the bus for the last two years. The study doesn't take into account the relative risk of the school bus versus the risk walking and multiple cars on the road. He stated it's a difficult drive, but not a dangerous drive. Ashok Gopinath stated 20-30 more cars causes problems and there was no problem with Durham.

Amy Roach from Route 18 stated the LSBTA does not have tort liability. She stated it's not negligence to operate on El Toyonal because injury accidents rarely happen on El Toyonal. This was not addressed in the report. Regarding the double yellow line violations, the community needs more times to come up with answers. The school bus is 70 times safer. She requested an extension. James Hampton from Route 11 (Brookwood) stated that the turn around on Brookwood was based on a complaint that a neighbor was parking and blocking driveway access. It's a ¼ mile to the group bus stop and he asked to reconsider the turn around and keep the bus stops on Brookwood.

Laura Allaire from Route 18 stated the school bus is the safest form of transportation and we need to find a solution. A group stop at the library is not the solution. She researched the narrower school buses. If these buses will still cross the double yellow lines, then many passenger vehicles will still cross the double yellow lines. Tracy Hampton from Route 11 stated that both Durham buses and First Student buses travel on Brookwood. There are other options and she requested an extension. Darren Cooke from Route 18 stated that more students will be walking from El Toyonal to the community center. He asked if the benefits of the changes outweigh the risks.

Steve Swaney from Route 18 stated that it's not negligent to disagree with the SBC report. There is a mountain of evidence to support this is safe travel. Michelle Swaney from Route 18 stated that it's not negligent to continue this route. A whole series of events has to take place including failure to use reasonable care. This route has a flawless safety record. Regarding legal compliance with the double yellow lines, she said let us lobby the city to fix the double yellow line issue. Sofia Ruiz from Route 18 said she took the bus to Wagner Ranch and OIS. One time the bus stopped for an hour because the road was too narrow. She didn't think this was a problem, but it's a problem if her little brother has to walk.

Courtney Brothers from Route 11 stated that her students have ridden for nine years. Now they will have to walk over a mile and Bobolink is dangerous. She asked the driver Tia about her impression and she said no problems, no concerns. Sarah Butler from Overhill Rd. suggested slowing down and forming a subcommittee. Many of the roads will be improved in 2018 and 2019. She asked if small Durham buses can travel on the roads why can't First Student? Laura Disston from Route 11 stated she has children at multiple schools. Her middle school student will have to walk ¾ of a mile. Manzanita is the city's detour for the sinkhole. She suggested commissioning another study to do what is best for everyone. Jason Matthews from Route 18 endorsed an extension and use of a pilot car. He stated some of the double yellow lines can be adjusted to be bus friendly.

Chair Tatzin closed public comment at 9:54 p.m. Board Member Gerson asked and it was confirmed by Mr. Collins that First Student will no longer operate the routes as is (11, 13 and 18) for the safety of the drivers and students on the buses. He asked legal counsel to explain liability as related to the double yellow lines, if it is impossible not to cross the double yellow lines. Ms. Subramanian stated that continuing to cross the double yellow lines in violation of the California Vehicle Code is negligence per se under the evidence code if it were to be litigated. Chair Tatztin asked about the liability in walking to bus stops. Ms. Subramanian stated she has not done this analysis.

Board Member Gerson asked Mr. Theis if El Toyonal could be made one way. Mr. Theis stated it would take time to get agreement among residents, to have a design, bid out, award a contract, etc. so it would be 4-5 months minimum. Vice Chair Worth asked about the turn around on Brookwood. Mr. Theis

stated there is probably a location on Brookwood that has adequate sight distance if the bus can turn around. Vice Chair Worth asked SBC about the pilot car idea. Mr. Knieb stated there is not precedent at SBC, CHP or First Student so he has nothing to offer experientially. He stated that SBC observed the school bus on El Toyonal on numerous occasions taking up the opposing lane. He stated the way the roads are configured, a narrower bus will not solve the problems.

Board Member Gerson asked if it made sense to even consider more solutions since First Student has stated it will not run the routes in question. Chair Tatzin stated that the board needs to ask how do we feel about violating the California Vehicle Code? If we ask the operator to run the routes we are telling employees to violate the California Vehicle Code and asking the employer (First Student) to violate the California Vehicle Code daily. Chair Tatzin stated that essentially what we have here is a whistle-blower and we don't generally denigrate whistle-blowers. Chair Tatzin stated there are a number of possibilities discussed, but as Mr. Theis pointed out, these take time and we don't know what the City of Orinda will ultimately do. In the meantime we have a school year starting. So do we cancel the routes entirely or do we operate with the changes? He stated the board can still continue to look at other options.

Board Member Gerson thanked SBC and stated that the consultants did what they were asked to do which was to look at compliance with the law. He wondered if there was a third party provider the community could contract with. Board Member Worth stated she would like to pursue the turn around for 11-1 Wagner Ranch on Brookwood Dr. There was a M/S/C/U (Fritsky/Worth) to accept the SBC recommendations with the exception of 11-2 OIS, Route 13 and 18 and consider adding a suitable stop on Brookwood for 11-1 Wagner Ranch.

Board Member Gerson stated he would support a subcommittee which could look into alternatives. Vice Chair Worth said she had a preference to continue service and to look into other options, but practically speaking, there is no provider to run these three routes next year. A subcommittee could convene over a period of months to see if there is a way to provide service.

Board Member O'Donnell stated she was not comfortable running the three routes as is. There was a M/S (O'Donnell/Kendzierski) to move approval of the changes as proposed for 11-2, Route 13 and 18 and to look into alternatives with a subcommittee. There was some more discussion about liability. Board Member Kendzierski stated the board has always been willing to modify routes and it can still explore other options for the future. Chair Tatzin noted that the subcommittee could consider looking for an alternate provider and continue to work with the City of Orinda. The motion passed with Board Member Rossiter dissenting. Ayes: Tatzin, Worth, Gerson, O'Donnell, Fritsky, Kendzierski. Noes: Rossiter. Abstentions: None.

- 6. Next Meeting Date September 12, 2017 at 1:00 pm
- 7. Adjournment The meeting was adjourned at 10:58 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,	
Sue Graves, Administrative Aide	_
Juliet Hansen, Program Manager	=

LSBTA Meeting September 12, 2017 Staff Report

### Lamorinda School Bus Program Staff Report

Date:

September 28, 2016

To:

Lamorinda School Bus Transportation Agency

From:

Juliet Hansen, Program Manager

Re:

Update on Enrollment and Operations, fall 2017-18

### Background

Each year the LSBTA adopts a budget with a forecast for enrollment. At the end of last year FY 16-17, the program had 1569 bus riders and collected \$608,893 in parent fees. One trip passes (\$3.00 each) brought in another \$16,025.

### Current Enrollment and Highlights

As of August 28, 2017 we have 1396 students enrolled for annual bus passes. Last year at this time we had 1475 students enrolled, which is a difference of 79 students. Most of the difference is from the loss of riders at Wagner Ranch in Orinda and JMIS in Moraga. Orinda Routes 10, 12, 15, 17 and 19 continue to have high ridership as do Lafayette Routes 22, 23, 25 and 28. Route 4 and 5 continue to have the highest numbers in Moraga. See Tables A and B attached.

LSBTA staff has collected \$574,088 in parent fees so far. We had forecasted receiving \$594,720 by the end of the school year. It is too early to tell if we will be able to reach our ridership and revenue goals this year.

### Lafayette Routes

Lafayette has 445 students enrolled with annual bus passes on seven buses. Stanley Route 22 and 23 are both full in the a.m. We have also closed enrollment on Burton Valley Route 28 due to the large number of students in the a.m. (62 riders on a 71 passenger bus). Burton Valley 25 and 28 were reconfigured over the summer to balance the number of students. In the first few weeks of school the routes ran late in the a.m. so both schedules were moved up by five minutes. Stanley Route 21 was re-routed over the summer to pick up Stanley students on St. Mary's Rd. in the afternoon and this change has resulted in a more efficient route in the afternoon. Route 23 ran late in the a.m. the first week of school, but is now running on time. Route 23 parents have expressed concern about the number of drivers on the route last year. The current Route 23 driver is a substitute and will change shortly. The Stanley buses are encountering more traffic on Pleasant Hill Rd. on Wednesday mornings, which is the late start for Acalanes (8:30 a.m.), the regular start for Springhill (8:30 a.m.) and the new late start for Stanley (9:25 a.m.). The pick up times for the late start on Wednesday may need to be adjusted.

### Moraga Routes

Moraga has 324 students enrolled with annual bus passes on five buses. None of the buses are full yet, but ridership is good. JM ridership is down by twenty riders and the superintendent confirms there was a large 8<sup>th</sup> grade class which graduated last year. Enrollment for Campolindo is similar to last year, despite the morning bell time changes at the AUHSD.

### Orinda Routes

Orinda has 627 students enrolled with annual bus passes on ten buses. Ridership is down a bit in Orinda, mostly due to the loss of 30 riders at Wagner Ranch. OIS ridership is down by 13 riders compared to this time last year. The Orinda routes have been running on time, with some adjustments necessary to the start time of the new Miramonte Route 2. Several Miramonte parents are using the new stops in the Michael/Meadow Lane area. Ridership at Miramonte is similar to last year despite the bell time changes at the AUHSD.

The newly configured OIS Route 18 has 42.5 round trip equivalent riders (RTES). Twenty-four students are using the stop at Wagner Ranch and fourteen students are using the stops at the library or community center. #102 Oak Rd. was added to Route 18 before the start of school to balance out the number of stops on Route 15. OIS 18 is a short route (25 - 30 min) and has been running on time. The Route 18 bus stages early in Orinda and is serving as a back up bus for the other Orinda routes. This was helpful on two occasions already when Route 11 had problems and needed assistance delivering students.

The newly configured Route 11 has 42 RTEs. This is a smaller bus than last year due to the u-turn on Acacia. Ten OIS students are using the new #25 Acacia stop (Acacia @ Hacienda) and three are using the new EBMUD gate stop. Most of the OIS students on Camino Don Miguel and Bobolink are using the Miner @ Camino Don Miguel stop on Route 12. OIS 11 is a short route (25 to 30 min) and has been running on time.

The newly configured Route 13 has 40.5 RTEs. This is the same smaller bus as last year. Fifteen OIS students are using the new bus stop at the St. Stephens Church parking lot. A few families on Diablo View are using stops on Route 19. Due to the new routing, we were able to add a morning stop at El Nido @ El Castillo as requested by Sleepy Hollow parents (previously this was a pm only stop).

The newly configured Route 15 and Route 17 have 50.5 and 71.5 RTEs respectively. On OIS Route 15, five students are using the new Wells Fargo Bank stop, eleven are using the new #50 Brookside stop and seven are using the new #76 Orchard stop. On OIS 17, ten students are using the new #104 Overhill bus stop.

### **Driver Shortage**

Last year at this time First Student was suffering from a serious driver shortage which continued through most of the fall and winter. This year, all twenty-two routes are fully staffed with an additional two cover drivers as required by the contract. First Student indicates it should have permanent drivers for all routes throughout the school year.

### Parent Liaisons

We have parent liaisons for most schools, but are still missing liaisons for OIS, Glorietta, Springhill and Donald Rheem. Liaisons attend parent liaison meetings and assist with communication back and forth to schools.

### **Summary**

The school bus continues to be popular despite the changes in bus stops, reconfiguration of bus routes and changes to bell times. Ridership is down by 79 riders compared to last year at this time mostly due to the loss of riders at Wagner Ranch and JMIS. Staff will continue to monitor route performance and ridership and make changes as necessary. Several schools need parent liaisons, including OIS, Glorietta, Springhill and Donald Rheem.

#### Recommendation

Receive and file.

Table A
Enrollment by School
2016-17 versus 2017-2018\*

City	School	2016-2017*	2017-18**	Difference
Orinda	OIS	448	435	-13
Orinda	Glorietta	17	13	-4
Orinda	Miramonte	58	55	-3
Orinda	Sleepy Hollow	103	100	-3
Orinda	Wagner Ranch	54	24	-30
Lafayette	Stanley	230	226	-4
Lafayette	Burton Valley	157	169	12
Lafayette	Springhill	56	50	-6
Moraga	JMIS	189	169	-20
Moraga	Campolindo	67	62	-5
Moraga	Donald Rheem	69	66	-3
Moraga	Los Perales	27	27	0
	1	total 1475	1396	-79

<sup>\*</sup>As of August 28, 2016

<sup>\*\*</sup>As of August 28, 2017

TABLE B
Enrollment by Route - Round Trip Equivalents
2016-17 vs 2017-18 school year

City	Route	2016-17 RTEs*	2017-18 RTEs+	Difference
Orinda	SH 19/OIS 19	68.5	75.5	7.0
Orinda	SH 10/ OIS 10	78.0	74.5	, -3.5
Orinda	SH 17/OIS 17/Mir 17	76.0	71.5	-4.5
Lafayette	STAN 22	64.5	64.5	0.0
Lafayette	STAN 23	62.5	63.5	1.0
Lafayette	BVE 28	53.5	63.0	9.5
Orinda	OIS 14/Campo 14	61.5	61.5	0.0
Lafayette	BVE 25	66.5	57.0	-9.5
Moraga	JM/RH 5/Campo 5**	69.5	56.5	-13.0
Moraga	JM/RH 4**	57.0	55.5	-1.5
Orinda	WR 12/OIS 12	54.5	52.0	-2.5
Orinda	GL 15/OIS 15	54.5	50.5	-4.0
Moraga	JM/LP 2/ MIR 2**	42.5	48.5	6.0
Orinda	OIS 16/Mir 16	50.5	44.0	-6.5
Lafayette	BVE 21/STAN 21	47.5	43.0	-4.5
Lafayette	STAN 29	42.5	43.0	0.5
Orinda	WR/OIS 18	54.5	42.5	-12.0
Orinda	WR 11/OIS 11	64.0	42.0	-22.0
Moraga	JM/RH 3**	50.5	41.5	-9.0
Orinda	SH 13/OIS 13	50.5	40.5	-10.0
Lafayette	SPR 27	40.5	40.0	-0.5
Moraga	JM/LP 1**	28.5	24.0	-4.5
	Total RTEs	1238	1155	

<sup>\*</sup>As of January 12, 2017

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>+</sup>As of September 5, 2017

<sup>\*\*</sup>Moraga Elementary students ride together; Campo I separate run