

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

Since Al Smith and his closest associates left so little in the way of valuable primary material, other than their public statements, anyone who writes about Smith's political career must rely heavily upon the private and public observations of his contemporaries. I found it necessary, therefore, to consult a great number of sources, only a few of which merit inclusion here because of their special value and interest.

### Manuscripts

In search of useful material for this study, I inquired about numerous collections in more than two hundred and seventy different libraries, historical societies, and other research institutions. I personally visited over sixty repositories, where I examined, in whole or in part, well over seven hundred manuscript collections of national, state, and local Democratic and Republican political leaders; journalists; prominent public figures; Smith's acquaintances; and others whose personal papers seemed to be potential sources of material relating to Smith and his involvement in national politics between 1918 and 1944. Approximately two hundred and fifty collections proved useful to some degree, among which those cited below were the most valuable.

The Alfred E. Smith collection, in the New York State Library, Albany, New York, is divided into Smith's official and his personal papers. The first is a large but, for the purposes of this study, almost entirely irrelevant collection of routine administrative materials, and only the file on the Mullan-Gage repeal provided any useful information. Smith's personal papers, a much smaller group that dates largely from his post-gubernatorial years, is a disappointing collection. The only files pertaining to the 1920s consist of speeches, clippings, press releases, and similar material; there is, unfortunately, almost no political correspondence in Smith's personal papers for these years. One valuable feature of the collection, though, is its complete file of the articles that Smith wrote in the 1930s for the McNaught newspaper syndicate, articles that illuminate his outlook on politics and government as well as on current events.

Collections of personal papers are lacking for most members of Smith's circle, such as James J. Hoey and George W. Olvany. The papers of George R. Van Namee, in the Monterey-Fresno Diocesan Chancery and Academy of California Church History, Fresno, California, and of Belle L. Moskowitz, in the Connecticut College Library, New London, Connecticut, are fragmentary and of only minimal value. The papers of Joseph M. Proskauer, James A. Farley, and Frances Perkins were not available to me when I was doing my research. The John J. Raskob Papers, in the Eleutherian Mills Historical Library, Wilmington, Delaware, were open to researchers only through the early 1920s when I was doing my research, but I was permitted to examine the collection for the years when Raskob chaired the Democratic National Committee (1928-1932) and I am grateful for that special permission. Several other potentially valuable collections of Smith associates – the Royal S. Copeland Papers, in the Michigan Historical Collections, Ann Arbor, Michigan; the Robert F. Wagner Papers, in the Georgetown University Library, Washington, D.C.; and the Henry Morgenthau, Sr., Papers, in the Library of Congress, Washington, D.C. – contained only a few items on the subject of Smith's political career in the 1920s.

The Franklin D. Roosevelt Papers, in the Franklin D. Roosevelt Library, Hyde Park, New York, were the most valuable single manuscript collection for this study. They help one to analyze the texture of Democratic politics during the 1920s and shed light on the outlook and activities of Smith and his close advisers. In addition to a moderately useful file of letters between Smith and Roosevelt, this collection includes the extensive correspondence that Roosevelt carried on with Democrats all over the country between 1920 and 1928, a large group of campaign correspondence and other materials relating directly to Smith's presidential candidacy in 1924, and a somewhat smaller group of letters concerned with Smith's candidacy and campaign four years later. The post-1928 Roosevelt Papers also contain some items relevant to this study. Some materials in other manuscript collections in the Roosevelt Library, especially the Louis M. Howe Papers and the vast files of the Democratic National Committee for 1928 and after, illuminate various events between 1918 and 1928.

The Norman E. Mack Papers, in the Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society, Buffalo, New York, also provide an inside look at the Smith camp, especially between 1926 and 1928; but the material in this small, fragmentary collection only hints tantalizingly at how Smith and his intimates viewed issues and set strategy during these years. The Herbert H. Lehman Papers, which are housed in the Butler Library, Columbia University, New York, New York, unfortunately have little of value concerning politics during the 1920s, but the collection does contain a file that discloses Lehman's role in 1927 and 1928 as an intermediary between Smith's headquarters and Fred W. Johnson, the head of the "Western States Smith for President Association." Lehman's file of correspondence with Smith himself is of minimal value.

The Bernard M. Baruch Papers, in the Princeton University Library, Princeton, New Jersey, include a massive file of letters to and from Baruch, many of which comment on the condition of the Democratic Party during the 1920s and on Smith's standing in the party. There are a few interesting exchanges between Baruch and Smith, but the collection's primary value is as an indicator of Democratic opinion throughout the decade, especially after 1926. There are many letters from anti-Smith Democrats in the collection.

The Osborne Family Papers, which include the correspondence of Thomas Mott Osborne, in the Syracuse University Library, Syracuse, New York, contain a number of useful letters on the subject of Smith's presidential candidacy in 1924. The Key Pittman Papers, in the Library of Congress, are chiefly valuable for documenting the pre-convention planning of the Smith camp in 1928 with respect to the Democratic platform, but the collection also includes some materials on the 1924 and 1928 pre-convention periods. The Frank P. Walsh Papers, in the New York Public Library, New York, New York, furnish some insights into the effort to block McAdoo's nomination in 1924.

The James R. Tolbert Papers, in the University of Oklahoma Library, Norman, Oklahoma, reveal some of the attitudes and activities of a man who helped to organize his state for Smith during the spring of 1928. The collection also provides information on Smith's standing in Oklahoma and on the strategy and opinions of those in Smith's headquarters in New York City. The Josiah W. Bailey Papers, in the Duke University Library, Durham, North Carolina, and the James M. Geraghty Papers, in the University of Washington Library, Seattle, Washington, contain similar but more limited information about the Smith movements in North Carolina and Washington.

Both the James P. Pope Papers, in the Idaho State Historical Society, Boise, Idaho, and the William A. Comstock Papers, in the Michigan Historical Collections, offer some glimpses of the changing opinions of Democrats during the late 1920s toward Smith and the issues with which he was associated. Because of Edward M. House's extensive correspondence with Democrats across the United States, the House Papers, in the Yale University Library, New Haven, Connecticut, afford still another valuable look at the attitudes of many Democrats toward their party and toward Smith. The John W. Davis Papers, also at Yale, are valuable for 1924 but also help to illuminate Democratic politics generally.

The papers of Josephus Daniels and Cordell Hull, in the Library of Congress, provide information on the anti-Smith position. Both men were Southern drys, and the letters that they exchanged with like-minded correspondents clarify the point of view of Smith's opponents. Hull's papers, in addition, contain material on his own candidacy in 1928. The Thomas J. Walsh Papers, also in the Library of Congress, are useful chiefly with respect to Walsh's presidential candidacy in 1928, but they also furnish some information on the attitudes and activities of Smith's opponents within the party. Additional, and more extensive, data on anti-Smith opinions and strategy can be found in the Edwin T. Meredith Papers, in the University of Iowa Library, Iowa City, Iowa, and in the William G. McAdoo Papers, in the Library of Congress. The McAdoo Papers are a vital collection for Democratic politics in the 1920s. McAdoo carried on a voluminous correspondence with many fellow Democrats. These letters record the events leading up to the 1924 convention, McAdoo's subsequent decline and retirement from politics, and the increasing frustration of the anti-Smith Democrats.

The Charles C. Marshall Papers, in the Library of Congress, are useful for the celebrated encounter between Marshall and Smith.

I was refused permission to examine two additional potentially valuable collections that have been made available to other researchers, the papers of J. Thomas Heflin and Joseph T. Robinson.

### Interviews and Questionnaires

At least one hundred of the oral history memoirs in the Oral History Research Office at Columbia University, New York, New York, contain references to Smith, but most of the information that they contain is inconsequential for this study. Only the memoirs of Edward J. Flynn and Claude Bowers proved to be of any real significance for Smith's political career in the 1920s, at least at the national level. I was unable to consult several oral history memoirs, including those of Joseph M. Proskauer, Jeremiah T. Mahoney, and Frances Perkins, that surely contain much valuable information about Smith.

A questionnaire that I sent to persons who served in Congress during the 1920s yielded some interesting views, but little of scholarly importance. Regrettably, so did my interview with Smith's elder daughter, Emily Smith Warner.

### Newspapers and Periodicals

The New York Times, naturally, devoted considerable attention to Smith, his governorship, and his political career. Using the Times index as a guide, I read virtually every news article and editorial in the Times that relates to Smith for the years 1915 to 1973. The editorial position of the Times was generally favorable to Smith. The summaries of national newspaper opinion found in the Literary Digest make it possible to sample some of the press opinion about Smith outside of New York City.

As one of the most prominent and controversial political figures of his time, Smith received extensive coverage in dozens of contemporary periodicals. Using the Reader's Guide to Periodical Literature, I read every article I could find that pertains to Smith and his career, covering 1915 to 1973. These articles furnish useful information and invaluable opinion about Smith, his career, and his involvement in national politics. The analyses to be found in the columns of Silas Bent, Stanley Frost, Frank R. Kent, Walter Lippmann, Dixon Merritt, and Mark Sullivan are particularly discerning and stimulating. The editorial and other unsigned comment in New Republic, Nation, Outlook, Review of Reviews, World's Work, and Independent is also very useful. George F. Milton, a leading opponent of Smith, wrote many articles during the 1920s that articulately express the anti-Smith viewpoint.

Two libraries connected with church denominations, the American Baptist Historical Society and the Methodist Publishing House, kindly supplied me with extensive selections of articles that appeared in the many religious periodicals of their respective denominations, and I am grateful for that assistance.

The editorials that Smith wrote for New Outlook in the early 1930s, as well as the articles that he wrote for the McNaught newspaper syndicate, although primarily concerned with current events, do enable one to understand his political views better. The other articles that Smith wrote are only occasionally of direct value vis a vis national politics.

### Published Sources

Henry Moskowitz (ed.), Progressive Democracy: Addresses and State Papers of Alfred E. Smith (New York, 1928), is a convenient compilation of many of Smith's notable speeches, memoranda, and other statements with implications for national politics.

Soon after his defeat in 1928, Smith dictated an autobiography, Up to Now (New York, 1929). Unfortunately, like his letters it contains little new information on his rise in New York politics, his interest in progressive reforms, his state election campaigns, and his actions as governor. Only occasionally does Smith disclose his views on such matters as the role of government, political trends, and the significance of his own career in public life. Smith says almost nothing, furthermore, about his involvement in national politics prior to June, 1928. Smith's other book, The Citizen and His Government (New York, 1935), contains a few anecdotes and also reflects some of his views on politics and government.

Some other autobiographies are important sources for any work on Smith and national politics. Claude Bowers, My Life (New York, 1962), has some observations from a pro-McAdoo point of view on the 1924 contest for the Democratic nomination. Bowers also furnishes an insider's description of how the Smith camp in 1928 planned its strategy

regarding the platform and, especially, the prohibition plank. James A. Farley, Behind the Ballots: The Personal History of a Politician (New York, 1938), and Edward J. Flynn, You're the Boss (New York, 1947), both describe Smith's career in New York, including some of the incidents that attracted national attention to him. Flynn also comments on the relationship between Smith and Charles F. Murphy and the other leaders of Tammany Hall. Neither Farley nor Flynn, however, has much to say about the 1924 and 1928 pre-convention periods or any other aspect of Smith's involvement in national politics during the 1920s.

Joseph M. Proskauer, A Segment of My Times (New York, 1950), is the most valuable of all the autobiographies that are relevant to a study of Smith's career. It sympathetically treats Smith's philosophical and political views, his personal characteristics, and his political independency. Proskauer also describes several important episodes in Smith's career, notably the Smith-Marshall exchange in 1927. Unfortunately, Proskauer too has little to say about the 1924 and 1928 pre-convention activities with which he was so intimately involved.

None of the biographies of Smith pays sufficient attention to his place in national politics during the 1920s. Henry Moskowitz, Alfred E. Smith: An American Career (New York, 1924), is a fairly typical campaign biography for its day, although it also includes useful excerpts from some of Smith's early speeches and other public statements. Up from the City Streets: Alfred E. Smith (New York, 1927), by Moskowitz and Norman Hapgood, is more penetrating and comprehensive than Moskowitz's 1924 effort, but, like its predecessor, it does not take a critical approach to its subject nor does it include an analysis of Smith's political career. Both of these volumes concentrate on state affairs and largely ignore national issues and matters of national politics. Both books, though, contain useful insights and information about Smith's views and his practical, single-minded approach to his job as governor, and both reflect what Smith's advisers wanted known – and thought – about Smith. Finally, both biographies make the best of Smith's relationship with Tammany Hall.

The other major contemporary biography of Smith is Henry F. Pringle, Alfred E. Smith: A Critical Study (New York, 1927), a gracefully written book that remains profitable reading. It is, in fact, a critical study. Pringle, who wrote it at the request of Smith's advisers, was friendly to Smith but more objective than Hapgood and Moskowitz were. Drawing upon his contacts with some of Smith's intimates, Pringle made some perceptive comments about Smith's personality, his relationship with his advisers, his occasional conflicts with organization Democrats in New York, and various of his actions as governor. In addition, Pringle has some interesting things to say about Smith's attitudes and political outlook. Like the previous biographers of Smith, however, Pringle focuses on state affairs and on Smith's achievements in Albany, and only in the final section of the book does Pringle touch upon Smith's stands on national issues and such matters as the 1924 national convention, the Marshall letter, and the implications of the Mullan-Gage repeal.

Emily Smith Warner, The Happy Warrior: A Biography of My Father, Alfred E. Smith (Garden City, New York, 1956), is a disappointing book because it could have told so much more. It does little more than round out the picture that Smith himself presented in his autobiography (which the Warner volume generally follows in both organization and content), elaborate upon some of the themes in Up to Now, and carry the story of

Smith's life down to his death in 1944. Although she of all his family was closest to Smith politically, Warner throws little additional light on the decisions that her father made, the events of his political career, and the behind-the-scenes activities of his friends. What new information the book presents deals, for the most part, with state politics; the author almost entirely ignores national political developments between 1924 and 1928.

Robert Moses's memoir of Smith, A Tribute to Governor Smith (New York, 1962), is an adaptation of the author's article in the New York Times of October 8, 1961. This short volume deals mainly with Smith's personality and nature, but it also contains a few interesting comments about Smith's political techniques. Its reminiscences and anecdotes about Smith contribute to an appreciation of him as a man but do not do much to enlighten the reader about its subject's political career.

Oscar Handlin's short, interpretative biography, Al Smith and His America (Boston, 1958), contains a sensitive delineation of Smith's personality; a convincing account of his younger years and his rise through Tammany and state politics; and an able discussion of Smith's pragmatism, attitude toward reform, and political and administrative skills. Handlin's book, too, however, gives short shrift to the situation of the Democratic Party during the 1920s and to Smith's role in the national politics of that era. Handlin's treatment of the division of the party in 1924 is inadequate, and the book's sketchy account of developments in national politics between 1924 and 1928 fails to include a satisfactory analysis of the reasons for Smith's nomination in 1928.

Matthew and Hannah Josephson, in Al Smith: Hero of the Cities (Boston, 1969), completed a biographical study that Frances Perkins began before her death in 1965. The finished product owes most of its biographical materials, which is particularly good for Smith's earliest years, and its most interesting observations about Smith's political attitudes and techniques to Perkins's research and to her personal recollections of Smith. Beyond the first few chapters, however, the book is superficially researched and inadequately documented, and it contains little new information about Smith and his public career. The portions of the book dealing with Smith's state campaigns and his accomplishments as governor are competently developed, but the Josephsons fail to come to grips with Smith's place in Democratic politics during the 1920s. The authors' treatment of the contest for the Democratic Party's presidential nomination in 1924 is shallow, and their account of the 1928 pre-convention period is uninformed. The book's factual errors and its preoccupation from time to time with Frances Perkins further limit its usefulness as a study of Smith.

Frank Graham, Al Smith: American (New York, 1945), and Richard O'Connor, The First Hurrah: A Biography of Alfred E. Smith (New York, 1970), are journalistic, popularized accounts of Smith's life that contribute little of consequence to an understanding of his political career. The first is superficial and almost valueless today, and the second is an almost entirely derivative narrative, although it does also incorporate a veteran reporter's impressions of the texture of New York Democratic politics.

Frank Freidel's Franklin D. Roosevelt: The Ordeal (Boston, 1954), which covers the years 1919-1928, includes excellent analyses of the Smith-Roosevelt relationship, national Democratic politics during the 1920s, and the strategy of the Smith circle. In addition to its account of the highlights of Smith's New York career, the book contains

especially good descriptions of the 1924 pre-convention period and convention, the background of the Smith-Marshall exchange, and the tactical advice that Roosevelt gave Smith between 1924 and 1928. The other two volumes in Freidel's biography add a few details. Alfred B. Rollins, Jr., Roosevelt and Howe (New York, 1962), supplements Freidel's work, particularly with regard to the 1924 and 1928 pre-convention periods.

Two additional biographies deserve mention because they illuminate Smith (and, less so, his national political career) through two of his closest associates. They are Robert Caro, The Power Broker: Robert Moses and the Fall of New York (New York, 1974), and George Martin, Madame Secretary: Frances Perkins (Boston, 1976). Both books are insightful in dealing with their subjects and with Smith.

Paula Eldot's Ph.D. thesis, "Alfred E. Smith, Reforming Governor" (Yale University, 1961), which is the single most thorough and satisfactory account of Smith's governorship, is being published by Garland as Governor Alfred E. Smith: The Politician as Reformer. Eldot depicts Smith as a pragmatic progressive and catalogs his accomplishments in office. Although the work does not deal with national political affairs as such, the author's treatment of Smith's actions that gained him national attention and enhanced his reputation throughout the country are relevant to a study of Smith's career in national politics. Eldot also comments on Smith's state election campaigns; his executive leadership ability; his relationships with Tammany Hall, the New York Democratic Party, and his advisers; Smith's controversies with William Randolph Hearst; and Smith's encounters with the prohibition issue.

Of the relatively few monographs that deal directly with the subject of this study, the most important by far is David Burner, The Politics of Provincialism: The Democratic Party in Transition, 1918-1932 (New York, 1968). Burner's book (unfortunately, poorly edited) contains a wealth of useful information and a generally well-informed – if somewhat episodic – account of Democratic politics in the 1920s. It depicts the feebleness of the party in the post-Wilson years, especially the strife between the rural and the urban wings of the party, and it explains anti-urbanism particularly well. In treating Smith's outlook and political rise, Burner pictures Smith as less progressive by 1928 than he had been in earlier years and, in fact, as essentially a moral and economic conservative whose position as governor caused him to sponsor the practical changes that would improve the lot of the urban working class. Burner's thesis with regard to national politics is that Smith was a stubborn provincial who benefited from the rising political consciousness and ambitions of the urban ethnic groups within the Democratic Party. Burner's treatment of the 1924 pre-convention period and the maneuvering during the Madison Square Garden convention is quite good, especially for the Klan issue, but Burner takes Smith's candidacy in that year too seriously. Curiously, The Politics of Provincialism fails to provide an adequate analysis of the reasons for Smith's nomination in 1928 or the process by which he gained his party's endorsement.

Robert K. Murray, The 103rd Ballot: Democrats and the Disaster in Madison Square Garden (New York, 1976), is a superb account of not only the 1924 convention but also the context in which the convention met. The book is filled with extensive background and detail and serves as a good introduction to the crisis within the Democratic Party in the mid-1920s.

The standard account of Smith and the religious question is Edmund A. Moore's A Catholic Runs for President: The Campaign of 1928 (New York, 1956), a book that helps to clarify the distinction between the two levels – informed and uninformed – of anti-Catholicism in America and their relationship to Smith's political career. Moore describes the sometimes subtle anti-Catholicism of the 1920s and the specific opposition to Smith and provides the best available description of the Smith-Marshall episode. Along the way, Moore offers some trenchant comments on the divisions within the Democratic Party and on what Democrats regarded as the logic of Smith's nomination in 1928.

William V. Shannon, The American Irish (New York, 1963), has some unusually incisive and interesting observations about Smith as a man and as a political leader, especially his connection with Tammany Hall and his role in the 1924 national convention. J. Joseph Huthmacher, Massachusetts People and Politics, 1919-1933 (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1959), discusses Smith's popularity among the urban "Newer Americans" beginning in 1924; Huthmacher emphasizes the importance that the Klan issue played that year. David M. Ellis, et al., A History of New York State (revised edition, Ithaca, New York, 1967), contains an excellent summary of Smith's attitudes and accomplishments as governor. Frank R. Kent, The Democratic Party: A History (New York, 1928), includes a particularly good account of Smith's role as McAdoo's opponent in 1924 but does not cover the years between 1924 and 1928. Roy V. Peel and Thomas C. Donnelly, The 1928 Campaign: An Analysis (New York, 1931), briefly summarizes developments in national politics after June, 1927, and outlines some of Smith's personal and political characteristics. Allan J. Lichtman's fine Prejudice and the Old Politics: The Presidential Election of 1928 (Chapel Hill, 1979) begins, except for a few pages of background, with Smith's nomination in 1928; it does, however, contain an excellent bibliography.

Walter Lippmann and Oswald Garrison Villard, two of the most influential commentators of the 1920s, wrote thought-provoking articles on Smith that were later published in Lippmann's Men of Destiny (New York, 1927) and Villard's Prophets True and False (New York, 1928). Both men make perceptive comments about Smith's nature and outlook, and Lippmann also contributes some astute observations about Smith's status in national politics in the 1920s, emphasizing the tension that his urban background and ethnic origins created.

Two articles by Lee N. Allen, "The Underwood Presidential Movement of 1924," Alabama Review, XV (April, 1962), 83-99, and "The McAdoo Campaign for the Presidential Nomination in 1924," Journal of Southern History, XXIX (May, 1963), 211-228, provide a good introduction to the contest for the 1924 Democratic presidential nomination. The articles ably describe the breakup of McAdoo's support in early 1924, Smith's subsequent gains, and the policy of obstructionism of McAdoo's opponents. Paul A. Carter's "The Other Catholic Candidate: The 1928 Presidential Bid of Thomas J. Walsh," Pacific Northwest Quarterly, LV (January, 1964), 1-8, is the best analysis of Walsh's role in 1928. Samuel B. Hand's article, "Al Smith, Franklin D. Roosevelt, and the New Deal: Some Comments on Perspective," Historian, XXVII (May, 1965), 366-381, while chiefly valuable for a later period, discusses Smith's philosophical leanings and his pragmatic approach to social and economic problems.

### Unpublished Sources



Leona F. Becker, "Alfred E. Smith: A Personality Study of a Political Leader" (M.A. thesis, University of Chicago, 1938), which has the virtue of being based on an interview with Smith, contains some interesting observations about his speech-making techniques, use of the commission method for achieving change, relations with the press, provincialism, impressionistic nature, view of success, and attitudes toward social-welfare measures. Becker notes Smith's extraordinary good fortune at critical stages of his political career.

Both Louis B. Silveri, "The Political Education of Alfred E. Smith: The Assembly Years, 1904-1915" (Ph.D. thesis, St. John's University, 1963) and Alex Diskint, "Alfred E. Smith, His Contribution as a Legislator to Administration" (M.P.A. thesis, New York University, 1949), are able studies of Smith's public career up until 1915. They are significant for the present study primarily for the information that they contain on Smith's evolving relationship with Tammany Hall and with Charles F. Murphy and the manner in which Smith helped to move Tammany in a generally progressive direction with regard to social-welfare legislation, but they incorporate some good analyses of Smith's thinking. Martin I. Feldman, "The Political Thought of Alfred E. Smith" (Ph.D. thesis, New York University, 1963), is an even better guide to Smith's thinking. It concentrates on his pragmatic approach to government, but Feldman also sheds some light on Smith and Tammany Hall.

Roosevelt and Howe, described earlier, grew out of Rollins's dissertation, "The Political Education of Franklin Roosevelt: His Career in New York Politics, 1909-1928" (Ph.D. thesis, Harvard University, 1953). The dissertation, which provides more detail than the published book does about Smith's political career between 1918 and 1928, is valuable for its discussion of the events related to the 1920 presidential nomination, Smith's fight with Hearst in 1922, and the 1924 pre-convention period – especially, Roosevelt's publicity work for Smith. Its description of the 1928 pre-convention period is less satisfactory than its account of the earlier one.

Lee N. Allen's "The Underwood Presidential Movement of 1924" (Ph.D. thesis, University of Pennsylvania, 1955), from which the two articles referred to above were drawn, is a well-rounded and detailed account of the 1924 Democratic presidential contest.

I was unable to consult two other potentially useful dissertations: David R. Colburn, "Alfred E. Smith: The First Fifty Years" (Ph.D. thesis, University of North Carolina, 1971), and Herbert Gelbart, "The Anti-McAdoo Movement of 1924" (Ph.D. thesis, New York University, 1978).