

Peer Review and Scientific Assessment

*A Handbook for
Funding Organizations,
Regulatory Agencies, and Editors*

A. Alan Moghissi
Betty R. Love
Sorin R. Straja



Institute for Regulatory Science
Alexandria, VA

PREFACE	1
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	4
CHAPTER 1 OVERVIEW	7
Introduction.....	7
Elements of Peer Review.....	8
History of Peer Review.....	10
Professional Licensing.....	12
Peer Monitoring.....	13
Scientific Publishing.....	14
Research Support.....	16
Regulatory Science	17
Other Activities.....	20
Evolution of the Peer-Review Process	20
Matthew Effect.....	21
Emergence of Peer Review.....	24
Ruckelshaus Effect	24
Opposition to Peer Review.....	28
Lack of Necessity	29
Inherent Flaws.....	29
Promotion of Freedom of Expression.....	31
Protecting Special Interest	31
Fallacies in Opposing Peer Review.....	32
CHAPTER 2 METRICS FOR EVALUATION OF SCIENTIFIC CLAIMS - BASED ON BEST AVAILABLE SCIENCE CONCEPT	36
Introduction.....	36
Scientific Method	39
Engineering Process	41
Best Available Science: The Generic System	41
Fundamental Principles of BAS.....	44
Assessment of the Reliability of Scientific Information.....	47
Standardization of Scientific Information.....	51
Class I - Proven SI.....	51
Class II - Evolving SI.....	53
Fallacious Information.....	55
Areas Outside the Purview of Science.....	56

