IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

ROBERT BRACE and ROBERT

BRACE FARMS, INC., a PENNSYLVANIA CORPORATION

6

В

9

10

11

12

13

14

15 16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24 25

Civil Action No. 90-22 Erie

Deposition of ADRIAN SHARPE, taken before and by Janis L. Ferguson, Notary Public in and for the State of Pennsylvania, on Tuesday, March 17th, 1992, commencing at 2:00 p.m., at the Econo Lodge, Route 19 and I-90, Erie, Pa.

APPEARANCES:

DAVID A. DANA, ESQUIRE, Department of Justice, Environment and Natural Resources Division, Environmental Defense Section, Room 7119, Washington, D.C., attorney for the United States of America.

JOHN D. WARD, ESQUIRE, Vartan Parc, 30 North Third Street, Eighth Floor, Harrisburg, Pennsylvania, attorney for the Defendants.

> JANIS L. FERGUSON REPORTED BY: REGISTERED PROFESSIONAL REPORTER

EXHIBIT

INDEX Direct examination by Mr. Ward Cross-examination by Mr. Dana Redirect examination by Mr. Ward EXHIBITS: Defendant's Exhibit A - Page 21

exception of one year my folks lived in Erie. So all your life -- When were you born then? Q. 2 November 8th, 1906. So since 1906 you've lived generally in -- right Q. 4 in the Quance Road area and South Hill Road. 5 something about what kind of work you've done from the early ages on. 7 Farm work of all kinds. Milk cows and helped · A. 8 harvest the corr, grain. Just kind of a community affair. 9 Q. Did you operate your own farm? 10 Ã. Yes. 11 And what years was that? ·Q. 12 Oh, I think from 1949 I bought the farm from my 13 dad. 14 Q. 1949? 15 Α. Yeah. 16 And how long did you operate that farm? Q. 17 Until 1971. Α. 18 · Q · And how large of an operation was it in terms of 19 acreage? 20 We had a hundred and fifty-seven acres. A. 21 And was that for crop? Q. A. Yes. And pasture land. 23 For beef cattle or --Q. 24 Dairy cattle. Α. 25

A. I knew him too.

2

3

5

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

. 17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- Q. Did you work at any time for either Mr. Brace's father or his grandfather?
- A. For his grandfather. The neighborhood had a thrashing machine and a silo filler in together, in a cooperative venture. And I helped him fill silo there for several years with grain.
 - Q. Now, you say this was a cooperative?
- A. Kind of, yes. It was a neighborhood cooperative venture.
- Q. Now, obviously you are familiar with the area.

 And would you -- Your testimony is you are familiar with the farming practices in the general area?
 - A. Oh, sure.
- Q. And that would include crop farming and pasture farming?
 - A. Sure.

MR. DANA: There's an objection as to -- You can obviously use the word "farming" as the witness understands it. But we may adopt a different definition of farming. For just general purposes. You might just want to -- I just want it noted for the record.

MR. WARD: What other word would you use?

MR. DANA: Just to differentiate crop farming

from pasture or cattle farming. MR. WARD: So down the road your argument is going to be that cattle -- raising beef or livestock is not agricultural? MR. DANA: No, no. I'm not saying what our 5 argument is. I just want it to be clear as 6 to what the witness is saying when he uses 7 the word "farming". 8 BY MR. WARD: 9 Mr. Sharpe, when we use the term "farming", what 10 does that mean to you? 11 Till the soil, take care of it, plant the crops, Α. 12 and harvest them. 13 And --Q. 14 It's a livelihood for people. A. 15 Q. All right. 16 Milk the cows. Ά. 17 Q. So there would be livestock? 18 Α. Yeah. 19 Q. 20 21

Q. Now, Mr. Sharpe, I'm going to point out to a map here we've brought along. It's a map prepared by the United States Geologic Surveyor, the Department of Interior, and I believe it's the Cambridge Springs quadrangle.

22

23

25

MR. WARD: Do you need any other identification, David? It's seven point five

intersection of Greenlee Road and South Hill Road. MR. DANA: The area you were calling the 3 gravel pit area for this purpose? 4 MR. WARD: Yes. Right. It's right below the 5 intersection there. 6 There's Greenlee Road, and there's South Hill Α. Road (indicating). 8 All right. Now, generally what does that area --What has it looked like over the years? Do you recall? 10 For many years it was all farm land. Then the 11 beavers got in there and kind of dammed up the water and 12 made this so as they couldn't farm it so good. 13 pasture it. But their water backed up there from the beaver 14 dam. 15 And in 1977, do you recall how that piece of 16 property was being used? At that time, I believe Mr. 17 Brace's father cwned the farm. 18 Yes. Α. 19 Q. Up until '77. 20 Mostly pasture land. A., 21 Now, generally from time to time could you see 0. 22 water on the surface of that area? And, again, we're 23 talking about the intersection of Greenlee Road or anyplace 24 else in that whole area. . 25

24

25

- A. Not unless it was in the spring of the year, for a little while, and the late fall.
 - Q. That would be the only time?
 - A. (Witness nods head affirmatively.)
 - Q. Were there beavers in the area?
 - A. Beavers, yes.

MR. DANA: Again, the area is just --MR. WARD: Again, the area is -- I'm still referring to -- When I use the word "area", I am referring to that area immediately south of Greenlee Road and South Hill Road. intersection. Let's see if I have --THE WITNESS: North of -- It would be north of Greenlee Road and South Hill Road. MR. WARD: Let's do this, if the intersection shows up here (indicating). I'm trying to go back before this picture was taken now. MR. DANA: But, John, just for the record, I'd like to interpose a general objection to the use of the word "area" here. It's too imprecise a term for this case. You've only defined it as sort of south of these two roads.

MR. WARD: Let me explain it for Mr. Sharpe.

BY MR. WARD:

24

MR. WARD: Yes, 19 is up here. MR. BRACE: It doesn't show on there. MR. DANA: We should also just add for the 3 record that Mr. Brace is attending the 4 deposition, as is his daughter. Miss McAtee. 5 Turn this map around. Α. Does that help? Q. There's Sibleyville Corners. Here's where they 8 are farming. Right in here (indicating). Right, okay. 10 Q. THE WITNESS: Right, Bob? 11 Q. He can't talk right now. 12 Oh, he can't talk. Α. 13 No. Here's Tamarack Road? Q. 14 Yes. That's another road here. And this is 15 Greenlee Road (indicating). 16 Right. This (indicating) is South Hill Road. 17 Okay? 18 Yes. 19 Generally, you say that water would be -- you 20 could see water in the spring? 21 Very early in the spring. There was a little 22 stream there. After -- Before the beavers come there, there 23 was very little. There was just a little -- wet weather stream you might call it. 25

- Q. Now, did the beavers move in at any particular time, or did they come in some years and not come in other years?

 A. Oh, they was in there for several years. I can't pinpoint the years they was there, but they was in there a little time; enough to back the water up quite a ways.

 Spoil it.

 Q. And did you notice what we might call flooding in there; water moving above ground?

 A. It was -- See, there's Sibleyville Corners.

 Beaver dam was right in there (indicating). It flooded this land back up in here (indicating), which was never flooded before.

 Q. Did beavers -- Again, we're on this entire map.
 - Q. Did beavers -- Again, we're on this entire map.

 You're familiar with the -- not just the specific area, but
 the whole countryside here. Are beavers very prevalent, or
 are they --
 - A. No. There's some up in here now (indicating), but they don't interfere with this (indicating) at all.
 - Q. Okay.

- A. But these -- The highway had to take these out, because there was water coming over the highway.
 - Q. They took out what?
 - A. The beaver dams.
 - Q. The beaver dams.

MR. DANA: You may have said this for the record, but the area Mr. Ward has marked on the map he's marked with a circle in ink, and that's being used on the exhibit.

- A. Here's where they --
- Q. We don't have to pinpoint them, but if we just generally know that beavers came in the area.
- A. They came across this road right here (indicating); was Sibleyville Corners.
- Q. But do you remember in terms of years when it was more noticeable. as far -- how far back?
 - A. Well. gosh, I can't pinpoint the year, but --
- Q. Well don't worry about that. But it was prior to 1977?
 - A. Yes.

- Q. Now, I believe you mentioned in 1977 that Mr. Brace's father used this -- the area in the circle here for pasture land.
 - A. A lot of it, yes.
 - Q. Did he use it for any crops, do you know?
- A. He -- He did at certain times, I think, but mostly pasture land there at that time. Because these beavers, see, they would back that water up here and ruin it for plow land.

MR. DANA: What time frame are we talking

about?

MR. WARD: 1977.

- A. And before that.
- Q. And before. There's been testimony that Mr. Brace purchased property from his father.
 - A. Yeah.

2

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

. 15

16

17

. 18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- Q. Which included this encircled area.
- A. Sure.
- Q. In 1977. Did you ever work for Mr. Brace at all on any of his farm properties?
 - A. Not this man.
 - Q. Not this man?
 - A. No.
- Q. Did you notice the activity -- Can you tell us of the activity in the surrounding area, and including this area, as to agricultural, farming, pasturing, whatever you --

MR. DANA: Objection. What area -MR. WARD: I said the general area including
the area that's encircled. You know, we can
call it a site if that's going to make you
feel comfortable.

MR. DANA: Well, no. Your question isn't clear as to what area you're asking him to respond to.

	[] . `	
1		MR. WARD: I said the general countryside
2		around the area that was within the circle.
3		And I don't know how else to express that.
4		MR. DANA: So both in and outside the circle?
5		MR. WARD: Yes.
6	-	MR. DANA: I'm just trying to understand, Mr.
. 7		Ward. I'm not trying to be difficult.
8		MR. WARD: Yes, you are.
9	BY MR. WARD:	
10	Q.	Within the circle and surrounding the circle, did
11	you see Mr	. Brace operate a farm?
12	A.	Yes, I saw him clear that off so he could work it
13	all.	
14	Q.	What about the surrounding area outside the
15	circle?	
16	Α.	Well
17	Q.	If you know where his property is.
18	Α.	Yes.
19	Q٠	What other kind of activity did he do?
20	. A.	Cabbage and potatoes.
21	Q.	Any other crops?
22	Α.	Hay. Corn, I suppose. I know he used to raise
23	potatoes a	nd cabbage there a lot.
. 24	Q.	All right.
25	. A.	This up here (indicating) was grown up through