

# **EXHIBIT 44**

**REPUBLIC OF TURKEY**  
**ARTICLES OF INTEREST**  
**MIDDLE EAST AND U.S. MEDIA SOURCES**  
**2012-2015**

On April 3, 2012, *EurAsianet.org* of the Open Society Institute reported that, “[i]n recent months, Uzbek leaders have intensified a campaign *to contain Turkish economic and cultural influences in Uzbekistan*. The most prominent component of this crackdown has been *the arrest of 54 Turkish entrepreneurs over the past two years and the closure of at least 50 Turkish-operated businesses*. In addition, the presidential administration in late February ordered all state-owned and private television channels to stop airing Turkish sitcoms, claiming that they were ‘inappropriate’ for an Uzbek audience. *Turkish-funded schools have also been forced to close*. Underlying Tashkent’s actions is *mounting distrust of the Islamist orientation of Turkey’s governing Justice and Development Party (AKP)*. *It would seem that Uzbek President Islam Karimov’s government worries that the AKP is working to promote Islamic piety not only in Turkey, but in the Turkic states of Central Asia*. [...] In particular, Tashkent is suspicious that *the AKP is somehow abetting the activity of an Islamic evangelical movement led by the Turkish theologian Fetullah Gulen, whose ideas are rooted in concepts earlier espoused by Bediuzzaman Said Nursî in the mid-20th century*. [...] ‘*Uzbekistan has accused Turkey of harboring Uzbek terrorists and sponsoring banned underground religious groups in Uzbekistan,*’ said a Tashkent-based journalist who specializes in Uzbekistan’s diplomatic relations. The journalist spoke on condition of anonymity, citing safety concerns” (emphasis added).<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> See *Uzbekistan: Tashkent Takes Hardline Approach on Containing Turkish Soft Power*, EURASIANET.org (April 3, 2012), available at: <http://www.eurasianet.org/node/65217>.

During June 2012, it was reported that Muslim Brotherhood leader, Mohamed Morsi had narrowly won the Egyptian presidential elections. Shortly thereafter, he “asserted [...] total executive power through a November 2012 constitutional declaration [that] alienated a substantial cross section of the Egyptian public, setting off frequent -- and often violent -- demonstrations that continued for months. Meanwhile, as the economy plummeted and the tide of popular opinion shifted further against Morsi, Egypt's state institutions mutinied.” On July 3, 2013, Egypt’s “defense minister Abdul Fattah al-Sisi, removed Morsi from power [...] ha[ving] significant consequences for Egypt's democratic prospects.” In response to Morsi’ imprisonment and being sentenced to death, “Brotherhood leaders openly call[ed] for Sisi's death, and the Brotherhood released a statement in January 2015 calling on its followers to embrace ‘jihad’ and ‘martyrdom’ in fighting the current regime.”<sup>2</sup>

On May 31, 2013, it was reported in *The Atlantic* that, “The Justice and Development Party (AKP) has been in power for more than ten years, with Prime Minister Recep Tayyip Erdogan in charge for most of them. Their goal is change. They want to make Turkey wealthy and Islamic. They have turned from the vaguely socialist policies of their predecessors to crony capitalism, and from the staunchly secular and pro-western policies established by Ataturk, the Republic's founder, to religious and Muslim-world-centered policies. They have abandoned Ataturk's non-interventionist stance for an active role in Egypt, the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, and now Syria.” In addition, it noted that, “Turkey's building boom includes 17,000 new mosques built by the government since 2002. The state is planning an enormous mosque, more

---

<sup>2</sup> See Eric Trager, *Egypt Two Years After Morsi*, Congressional Testimony to House Committee on Foreign Affairs (May 20, 2015), available at: <http://www.washingtoninstitute.org/policy-analysis/view/egypt-two-years-after-morsi>.

than 150,000 square feet in size, to loom over Istanbul on a hill on the Asian side of the Bosphorus. Secularists are outraged, and an opposition leader, Republican People's Party (CHP) *MP Mehmet Ali Ediboglu*, calls this just another step in a process that, he claims, will end in an *Islamic republic*. Whither Turkey? Erdogan's visit to Washington last week is a reminder of how important that question is. President Barack Obama has called Turkey a critical ally and has spoken of his friendship for the Turkish leader. Yet Erdogan is trying to change the Turkish constitution from a parliamentary to a presidential system -- with the hope, of course, that he will be the president. His opponent's charge that Erdogan's model is Russia's Putin, a virtual dictator by legal means. A visitor can only wonder where Erdogan's country is headed” (emphasis added).<sup>3</sup>

On October 14, 2013, it was reported by *Al Arabia News* that, “Since the June 30 revolution in Egypt, Turkey has become the regional hub for the Muslim Brotherhood’s international organization. Istanbul has played host to many meetings planning what steps are to be taken against the military-backed Egyptian government after the July 3 ouster of President Mohammad Mursi. [...] Turkey’s defense of the Muslim Brotherhood, and the tears of Recep Tayyip Erdogan when the Egyptian security forces attempted to storm the sit-in of Rabaa al-Adawiya, proved Erdogan’s ties with the Muslim Brotherhood’s international organization and

---

<sup>3</sup> See Barry Strauss, *4 Jarring Signs of Turkey's Growing Islamization*, *The Atlantic* (May 31, 2013), available at: <http://www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2013/05/4-jarring-signs-of-turkeys-growing-islamization/276425/>.

their mutual interest in restoring ‘the era of Islamic rule,’ seen by the Brotherhood as the basis for protecting ‘the Islamic nation.’”<sup>4</sup>

On March 19, 2014, the *Abu Dhabi Media* reported that “[i]n the aftermath of the 2011 Arab Spring uprisings, Doha [Qatar] supported Islamist organisations and Muslim Brotherhood-led administrations, including that of Egypt’s former president Mohammed Morsi. It also host[ed] exiled members of the Brotherhood from Egypt and Syria, where Qatar [had been] accused of channelling funds to radical elements fighting the regime of Bashar Al Assad. The relationship between Qatar and the Muslim Brotherhood, according to Carnegie Center visiting fellow and Muslim Brotherhood expert, Raphael Lefevre, “has been one of converging interests and mutual trust” since the Arab Spring and is not likely to end. [...] Yet Qatar’s close relationship with the Muslim Brotherhood, a vast social and political organisation with branches across the Middle East, goes back to well before the 2011 uprisings.”<sup>5</sup>

On September 7, 2014, the *New York Times* reported that, as the result of Qatar’s “provid[ing of] at least some form of assistance — whether sanctuary, media, money or weapons — to the Taliban of Afghanistan, Hamas of Gaza, rebels from Syria, militias in Libya and allies of the Muslim Brotherhood across the region” [...] Saudi Arabia, the United Arab Emirates, Egypt and Israel [had...] all sought to portray it as a godfather to terrorists everywhere [, and s]ome in Washington ha[d] accused it of directly supporting the Islamic State in Iraq and Syria.

---

<sup>4</sup> See Mohammad Abdel Kade, *Turkey’s Relationship with the Muslim Brotherhood*, *Al Arabia News* (Oct. 14, 2013), available at: <http://english.alarabiya.net/en/perspective/alarabiya-studies/2013/10/14/Turkey-s-relationship-with-the-Muslim-Brotherhood.html>.

<sup>5</sup> See Lauren Williams, *Inside Doha, at the Heart of a GCC Dispute*, *The National World* (March 19, 2014), available at: <http://www.thenational.ae/world/qatar/inside-doha-at-the-heart-of-a-gcc-dispute>.

[...] Qatar openly provides a base for leaders of the Palestinian militant group Hamas — deemed a terrorist organization by the United States and Israel — as well as money to help prop up its government in Gaza. [...] Many analysts say it is Qatar’s support for the Muslim Brotherhood that has drawn accusations from other gulf states that have charged that Qatar is funding terrorism in Syria and elsewhere.”<sup>6</sup>

On September 15, 2014, the *New York Times* reported that “President Recep Tayyip Erdogan of Turkey said on Monday *that several exiled leaders of Egypt’s Muslim Brotherhood who fled to Qatar* but lately have come under pressure to leave that Persian Gulf monarchy could perhaps find a new refuge in his country.” It noted how “Al Jazeera Turk reported on Monday that *Amr Darrag, the foreign relations officer of the Muslim Brotherhood, had already arrived in Turkey*, while Jamal Abdul Sattar, the former deputy head of the Egyptian Religious Affairs Directorate in exile in Qatar, planned to move to Istanbul. ‘We, the Muslim Brotherhood, do not only seek a safe haven,’ said Mr. Abdul Sattar, as quoted in the report. ‘We also seek to find a safe location from where we could struggle against the bloody and brutal military coup against us in Egypt and run our activities free of pressure.’” The New York Times article also pointed out how “Mr. Erdogan ha[d] denounced the Egyptian military’s ouster of President Mohamed Morsi of the Brotherhood last year and ha[d] vouched for the democratic intentions of Mr. Morsi, who remains under arrest in Egypt. He also criticized a report in The New York Times over the weekend in which Western intelligence officials and American officials said that Turkey

---

<sup>6</sup> See David D. Kirpatrick, *Qatar’s Support of Islamists Alienates Allies Near and Far*, New York Times (Sept. 7, 2014), available at: <http://www.nytimes.com/2014/09/08/world/middleeast/qatars-support-of-extremists-alienates-allies-near-and-far.html>.

had failed to crack down on an extensive black market oil-trading network that had helped finance the Islamic State in Iraq and Syria” (emphasis added).<sup>7</sup>

On February 6, 2015, it was reported in *Al Monitor* that Turkey had been accused of escalating violence in Egypt since at least December 2014. “While some in the government would like to improve relations with Egypt, several events have spoiled the optimistic atmosphere. *One crucial development was the Istanbul meeting of the Muslim Brotherhood’s Freedom and Justice Party deputies in December 2014 and their declaration that all decisions by the “coup regime” are invalid, marking a new arena of political struggle against Egypt by the Brotherhood parliament-in-exile via Turkey. [...] One TV station with ties to the Brotherhood* aired the comment, ‘With the death of King Abdullah, Sisi’s spine is broken.’ Ashraf Abdulgaffar, the Brotherhood’s representative in Turkey, went further, claiming, ‘The Egyptian coup regime, under the pretext of sending 20,000 Egyptian soldiers to fight Houthis in Yemen, was planning to send them to Saudi Arabia to actively take part in a coup plot against the new king’. [...] Another development that triggered a return to the early days of vicious polemics between Turkey and Egypt was *the broadcasts of Istanbul-based Brotherhood TV stations to provoke violence in Egypt. Reports say Rabia, Misr al An, Al Sharq and Mukemmelin are transmitting from Istanbul.* Muhammed Nasir, a commentator on Misr al An TV, said the ‘revolutionary youth are watching the residences of police chiefs’ and warned their wives to ‘keep your spouses under control, otherwise your children will be orphaned.’ Nasir called on the Egyptian youth to ‘give up peaceful actions against bullets. It is time to start violent struggle.’

---

<sup>7</sup> See Sebnem Arsu, *Turkey Open to Bids for Refuge by Muslim Brotherhood Exiles*, New York Times (Sept. 15, 2014), available at: <http://www.nytimes.com/2014/09/16/world/europe/turkey-open-to-bids-for-refuge-by-muslim-brotherhood-exiles.html>.

Rabia TV reported that a group calling itself the Revolutionary Youth Leadership has warned foreigners in Egypt to leave the country by Feb. 11. The group reportedly asked foreign companies and diplomatic missions to end their operations in the country. Rabia TV defended itself, saying, ‘As part of the coup regime media's defaming campaign, false news about our channel was produced. We had said, while introducing that warning report, that we will seek to uncover reality with our guests. This means we don't assume the truth in that so-called warning declaration’<sup>8</sup>

On July 1, 2015, it was reported by *JerusalemOnline.com* that, Saudi intelligence sources had disclosed that “the Iranian regime is establishing relationships with Native American tribes in Canada,” and that the “Islamist government of Turkey is likewise reaching out to Native American tribes inside the United States.” Quoting an exclusive interview granted by Ryan Mauro, a national security analyst for the Clarion Project, JerusalemOnline noted that, there was an apparent “ideological race between Iran, Saudi Arabia and Turkey [that] is just as important as a potential nuclear arms race [...] *The Turks are pushing neo-Ottoman and Muslim Brotherhood-type beliefs*; the Saudis are pushing the Wahhabist form of Salafism and Iran is pushing Shiite theocratic Islamism. Turkey is promoting its Islamist ideology around the world through constructing mosques and public engagement to a degree that is only comparable to Saudi Arabia and Qatar.” According to Mauro, “*The Turkish influence is less overtly sinister* because Turkish leaders are usually less incendiary in their rhetoric and Turkey has a positive

---

<sup>8</sup> See Fehim Taştekin, *Turkey Accused of Escalating Violence in Egypt*, Al Monitor (Feb. 6, 2015), available at: <http://www.al-monitor.com/pulse/originals/2015/02/turkey-egypt-muslim-brotherhood-escalating-violence.html#>.



reputation as a NATO member. Unfortunately, *Turkish support for Islamist extremism and terrorist groups is still widely unknown in the West and often brushed off*” (emphasis added).<sup>9</sup>

On August 27, 2015, the *New York Times* reported that, “the Turkish government’s recent change of heart and its sudden willingness to allow American access to the Incirlik base [...to] allow American aircraft to fly missions in Syria and Iraq with greater operational effectiveness and economic efficiency [...] was driven by domestic political considerations, rather than a fundamental rethinking of its Syria strategy.” According to the Times, “[s]hortly after granting access to the base, Turkey’s president, Recep Tayyip Erdogan, launched a wave of airstrikes on Kurdish targets, reigniting a conflict that had been on the road to resolution. To make matters worse, *Turkey has struck hard at Syrian Kurds who have, until now, been America’s most reliable ally in fighting the Islamic State, often called ISIS, in northern Syria*” (emphasis added). The Times, furthermore, explained the Turkish president’s motivations. “*Mr. Erdogan’s preference for Sunni dominance explains Turkey’s lax border policies over the past four years, as well as its tacit support for the extremist Sunni group the Nusra Front, and its failure to take the Islamic State seriously as a threat until the fall of Mosul and the beheadings of Western hostages. Even then, Turkey was reluctant to change course and fully back the American goal of degrading and defeating the militant group. Mr. Erdogan’s overriding objective has instead been to achieve a parliamentary supermajority that will grant him an executive presidency and solidify what is rapidly becoming a one-party state.* Since his party lost its governing majority in

---

<sup>9</sup> See Rachel Avraham, *Iran and Turkey Reaching Out to the Native Americans*, JerusalemOnline (July 1, 2015), available at: <http://www.jerusalemonline.com/news/world-news/around-the-globe/iran-and-turkey-reaching-out-to-the-native-americans-14335>. See also Ryan Mauro, *Iran Courting Native Americans in Canada: Leaked Document*, Clarion Project News Analysis (June 24, 2015), available at: <http://www.clarionproject.org/analysis/iran-courting-native-americans-canada-leaked-document>.

the June elections, dashing his desires, *he has focused on forcing early elections — now set for November — to regain control of Parliament.* To do so, Mr. Erdogan hopes to tar the pro-Kurdish People’s Democratic Party as a terrorist front and steal votes from the Nationalist Movement Party. [...] This strategy might help Mr. Erdogan win an election, but *it is severely undermining the fight against the Islamic State.* [...] *In the long run, undercutting the Kurds will be extremely damaging to the anti-Islamic State effort since allowing Turkey to create a no-go zone for Kurdish forces will not carve out territory for moderate fighters; instead, it risks creating a safe haven for Islamist groups like the Nusra Front and Ahrar al-Sham, whose growing strength will exacerbate the toxic sectarianism and ethnic violence that has plagued Syria for the past four years”* (emphasis added).<sup>10</sup>

On August 29, 2015, it was reported in *The Cairo Post* that “[a] month after its closure, Turkey-based pro-Muslim Brotherhood channel (*al-Sharq*) will resume broadcasts under the leadership of Ayman Nour, head of *Ghad Elthawra Party*, the channel announced in a Friday statement. ‘After the channel went through a financial crisis in the last phase, and was exposed to attempts of blocking and frequent jamming, *al-Sharq* comes back with new image and administrative shift,’ the statement said. Anonymous sources told Youm7 Friday that Nour bought the channel for \$250,000 from its owner Bassem Khafagy, who lives in Turkey. The official added that the broadcast will operate Tuesday. [...] *Al-Sharq* was one of a number of pro-Brotherhood media outlets established since 2013 in Turkey; the channels have been accused by Cairo of inciting violence against military and security personnel. *Istanbul-based pro-Muslim*

---

<sup>10</sup> See Eric S. Edelman, *America’s Dangerous Bargain With Turkey*, New York Times (Aug. 27, 2015), available at: <http://www.nytimes.com/2015/08/27/opinion/americas-dangerous-bargain-with-turkey.html>.

*Brotherhood (MB) channel, Misr Alaan*, stopped broadcasting after the Turkish government put pressure on the owners, MB sources on Aug.15.” (emphasis added).<sup>11</sup>

---

<sup>11</sup> See Kate Rankin, *Pro-Brotherhood Channel to Re-broadcast Under Ayman Nour*, The Cairo Post (Aug. 29. 2015, available at: [http://www.thecairopost.com/news/165372/inside\\_egypt/pro-brotherhood-channel-to-re-broadcast-under-ayman-nour](http://www.thecairopost.com/news/165372/inside_egypt/pro-brotherhood-channel-to-re-broadcast-under-ayman-nour)).