

CSO Notes: This document was provided by IFC in response to CSO concerns about the lack of consultation and violation of FIP Guidelines for Consultations to be carried out in accordance with subparagraph 16(d) of FIP Design Document which necessitates an 8 part consultation process with potentially affected communities, full documentation of consultation and documentation of a "consensus reflecting broad community support for the investment strategy, program or project" which "should emerge from the the consultations before the strategy, program or project moves forward." "The strategy, program or project should not proceed without acquiring broad community support as set forth in these FIP guidelines." The events below are not consultations with civil society but include 13 MDB meetings with government agencies, 7 with donor agencies, 3 private sector meetings, 3 meetings with World Bank partner WWF, 2 with TNC, 2 meetings with unnamed CSOs in Lao PDR & Indonesia,

FIP/SC.11/CRP.1
October 30, 2013

INFORMATION SHARING AND OUTREACH EVENTS CONVENED SINCE THE ENDORSEMENT OF THE INDONESIA FIP INVESTMENT PLAN IN NOVEMBER 2012¹

and an "informal lunch" to which CSOs were invited but few attended. This document is not an appropriate response to CSO consultation concerns. Submission by the Asian Development Bank and the World Bank Group

The events described in this document further underscore the lack of meaningful (free, prior, informed) consultation throughout the FIP process.

CSO remarks in column below:

	Date	Description
Meet with WWF to discuss IFC report.	November 3, 2012	IFC FIP team met with WWF Indonesia Forestry staff to review survey report on forestry SMEs in Aceh province. Report was commissioned by IFC to identify suitable forestry enterprises involved in community forestry concession (HTR) development.
Private Sector	November 20, 2012	IFC FIP team visited plantation company at West Kalimantan to assess opportunities to collaborate on community forestry enterprise activities related to outgrower based wood production and use of plantation wood for development of small scale charcoal production for commercial use.
Government (GOI)	November 21-22, 2012	ADB FIP team discuss with the Ministry of Forestry regarding next steps for processing the ADB project. Discussions were also held with the WWF staff to know current developments on REDD+ in Kalimantan. Discussion also focused on the need for the National Forest Council (DKN) to conduct further stakeholder consultations based on guidance from FIP subcommittee.
Donor/Bilateral	November 23, 2012	ADB FIP team discussed opportunities for collaboration with Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) in design and implementation of FIP project in West Kalimantan. Both technical and co-financing possibilities were discussed.
GOI	December 13 & 26-27, 2012	A World Bank task team visited the Yogyakarta KPH and two KPHs in Lampung to meet with local government representatives and stakeholders in the KPH (private sector, community representatives). Objective of the field missions was to gather information about several aspects of KPHs relevant to project design, consultations and preparation.
Donor/Bilateral	January 15, 2013	World Bank met with French Development Agency (AFD) representatives in Jakarta to learn about their past experience working with KPHs and also to explain objectives of FIP investments. Explored possibility of cooperation and synergy, particularly in AFD-supported KPHs in Lampung province.
Donor/Bilateral	January 28, 2013	ADB FIP team discussed cooperation with representatives of GIZ in design and implementation FIP project in West Kalimantan. Progress in FMU

¹ This list includes only events initiated by the three Multilateral Development Banks (MDBs) – the World Bank, the International Finance Corporation (IFC), and the Asian Development Bank (ADB) – who are in their early stages of developing projects with the Government of Indonesia under the FIP. The list is not exhaustive; the Government has conducted a large number of their own consultation and outreach events related to the Forest Management Unit (KPH) agenda and the FIP. The above events also do not represent the entirety of consultations and outreach for the FIP in Indonesia. Additional consultation processes will be conducted at the national and regional levels to inform the design of each of the individual MDB-supported projects. These formal preparation processes are scheduled to commence before the end of 2013.

	Date	Description
<p>Instead of making changes to FIP MoF posts matrix of responses to CSO input for FIP document CSOs write to FIP team and request written response to questions and concerns. No response received.</p>	<p>February 11, 2013</p>	<p>development and opportunities for using FMU as an entry point for FIP interventions, and prospects for effective engagement of local communities in project design and implementation were discussed. Ministry of Forestry uploaded the 'Updated Matrix of Comments and Responses on the Indonesia Forest Investment Plan' to the MOFOR and CIF websites: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • http://www1.dephut.go.id/files/Indonesia-FIP-Final%20comments%20Matrix%20English.pdf • https://www.climateinvestmentfunds.org/cif/sites/climateinvestmentfunds.org/files/Investment Plan for Indonesia response GoI.pdf </p>
<p>Donor</p>	<p>February 25, 2013</p>	<p>World Bank and Kemitraan representatives meet to discuss potential for Kemitraan to prepare World Bank-managed project on behalf of MOFOR. This process would entail national- and regional-level consultations on behalf of MOFOR, outreach to stakeholders and receipt of design inputs during the formal FIP project preparation phase prior to World Bank appraisal.</p>
<p>Present info to GOI, Private sector, Unnamed NGOs</p>	<p>February 28 and March 1, 2013</p>	<p>ADB FIP team held meetings with selected staff of West Kalimantan province and representatives of local NGOs and private sector to inform them of endorsement of forest investment plan and various steps for design of the FIP project.</p>
<p>Internal DKN</p>	<p>March 13, 2013</p>	<p>DKN Preparation Meeting in Bogor on programmatic engagement with the World Bank, including for preparation process for the FIP and the DGM</p>
<p>WWF</p>	<p>March 26, 2013</p>	<p>ADB FIP team discussed with WWF representatives regarding the needs of local communities in protection and conservation forest areas in Kalimantan and opportunities for livelihood improvement through FIP.</p>
<p>GOI</p>	<p>April 4, 2013</p>	<p>IFC FIP team visited KPH Yogyakarta to view small enterprise development activities and understand business models adopted.</p>
<p>GOI</p>	<p>April 10, 2013</p>	<p>All MDBs and the government representatives discussed the establishment of FIP steering committee by the Secretary General of the Ministry of Forestry. MDBs requested for inclusion of civil society representatives on the steering committee.</p>
<p>University</p>	<p>April 11, 2013</p>	<p>ADB FIP team discussed with staff of Bogor Agricultural University regarding tenure and livelihood opportunities in Kalimantan.</p>
<p>GOI? Donor/bilateral TNC</p>	<p>May 15-18, 2013</p>	<p>World Bank task team field mission to the Berau district. Objective of the field mission was the same as above for the Yogyakarta and Lampung missions, with the added goal of disseminating information about the FIP to and learning from the Nature Conservancy (TNC) and GIZ, who are both promoting KPH institutional development as part of broader assistance programs in and around Berau.</p>
<p>"selected stakeholders"</p>	<p>May 21, 2013</p>	<p>ADB FIP team discussed with selected stakeholders regarding national and sub-national fiscal policies for carbon stock improvement in Indonesia and other parts of Southeast Asia.</p>
<p>internal DKN</p>	<p>May 22, 2013</p>	<p>Internal DKN meeting with the objective to prepare a consultation plan and discuss Investment Plan and DGM guidance for the setting-up of a National</p>

	Date	Description
		Steering Committee meeting (convened on June 27-28, 2013, see below).
Unnamed CSOs from Laos, Indonesia in Lao PDR	June 17-20, 2013	ADB FIP team discussed with representatives of civil society organizations on FIP in Indonesia and Lao PDR. ADB organized a special session on 18 June focusing on "Social Forestry and FIP" as part of the 4 th ASEAN Social Forestry Network Conference – Village Forests, TREDD+, Conservation and Livelihoods, held in Luang Prabang, Lao PDR.
Donor/bilateral, GOI	June 20, 2013	GIZ Forclime and Directorate for KPH Development convene a roundtable discussion with donors on the Government's KPH development agenda, where the Government discussed its plans and donors explained the status of their various projects in support of KPHs. World Bank presented an update on the KPH support project under the Indonesia Investment Plan.
GOI	June 21, 2013	MOFOR Directorate for KPH Development socialization with relevant government ministries and agencies on their work plans and agenda. Objectives of the event were to provide information on FIP investment projects to government stakeholders and agree on preparation activities needed to appraise FIP project.
Donor/Bilateral TNC	June 26, 2013	ADB FIP team discussed with representatives of JICA, Australia and US on opportunities for potential collaboration in design and implementation of ADB FIP project in West Kalimantan. Progress on FIP was also discussed with staff of the National Council of Climate Change (DNPI) and the Nature Conservancy.
At this meeting after IFC staff couldn't answer basic questions about FIP & IFC safeguards, Indigenous Peoples Chamber of DKN voted to reject the FIP due to lack of information and improper consultation. The meeting was packed with more than 30 DKN members, more than 30 members of one national alliance; those who had signed letters critical of FIP were not invited, members of critical NGOs were only invited a few days prior to meeting. Documents were not provided in advance. Official minutes from this meeting left out entire topics of discussion, including role of military, but did record rejection of FIP by Chambers.	June 27-28, 2013	DKN National Dialogue on the DGM and the FIP. The Ministry of Forestry convened a national-level consultation via the DKN to discuss critically the final investment plan and disseminate information on next steps regarding the preparation process for the individual projects. The event also discussed next steps regarding the consultation on the individual programs under each of the MDBs as well as the role and responsibilities of the DKN. At least 110 people attended, including members of the DKN Presidium, as well as representatives from communities of FMU territories, local communities, and civil society organizations. Public information materials disseminated via the DKN website in advance of the meeting. http://dkn.or.id/2013/06/26/program-investasi-kehutanan-forest-investment-program/
Followup internal	July 19, 2013	DKN follow-up meeting in Yogyakarta to address the result of the National Dialogue on FIP in Bogor 28 June 2013.
DKN meeting in Yogya presented modified results of Bogor meeting & did not accurately describe rejection of FIP at Bogor; Stated that since FIP was GOI project, could not be rejected.	July 25-26, 2013	Ministry of Forestry and ADB FIP team met to discuss activities under components 1 and 2 of the ADB FIP project.
	July 31, 2013	Ministry of Forestry and ADB FIP team met to discuss activities under component 3 of the ADB FIP project.
Donor/Bilateral	August 21 and 22, 2013	ADB FIP team held meetings with representatives of AusAID, JICA and others regarding opportunities for collaboration in FIP in West Kalimantan.
WWF HOB meeting	September 3 and 4, 2013	ADB FIP team participated in 7 th Trilateral Meeting of the Heart of Borneo Initiative and informed nearly 200 stakeholders (representing governments of Indonesia, Brunei and Malaysia, development partners, civil society

FOI
GOI

GOI

Date	Description
Private sector September 4, 2013	organizations and the private sector) regarding planned activities under FIP project in Kalimantan. IFC participates in Forestry Sector Dialogue sponsored by the Indonesia Forest Producers Association (APHI). Several national CSOs were in attendance. Among other topics discussed affecting private sector, there was concern expressed about the need to actively manage logged over Production Forest and to prevent these forests from being converted to plantations or removed from the forestry estate. Strengthening the network of KPHs was mentioned as one way to improve the condition of logged over forest.
GOI September 6, 2013	ADB FIP team attended the Ministerial meeting of the Heart of Borneo Initiative as an observer and informed the ministers of forestry and other stakeholders including civil society organizations regarding FIP interventions in West Kalimantan and potential options for positively influencing livelihoods of local communities.
GOI September 6, 2013	IFC FIP team met with MOFOR and other GoI agencies involved in FIP. An update was provided on the process to develop the private sector FIP project concept, links to KPHs, and timeline for project preparation and proposal development.
GOI September 11 and 12, 2013	MOFOR Directorate of KPH Development convened a national workshop to promote its KPH institutional development agenda to regional Ministry of Forestry offices and local provincial and district government forest units. There was also a brief discussion on the FIP program objectives.
This is very peculiar This lists invited CSOs but not who attended this "informal lunch"; Walhi refused to attend. Solidaritas Perempuan, which, along with other CSOs was still waiting for a written response to detailed questions about the FIP, did not attend. Who attended? Why is an informal lunch on this list? CSOs were blocked from attending September 19, 2013	Informal lunch with CSOs previously critical of the FIP to update them on the individual projects' preparation. In attendance were representatives from the three MDBs. CSOs invited included Greenpeace, Walhi, HuMa, Debt Watch, Solidaritas Perempuan, CSF for Climate Justice, Global Witness. Issues discussed included recap of 27-28 June Bogor meeting on FIP/DKN, FIP Pilot Country Meeting in Yogyakarta, progress update on FIP and DKN engagement
CSOs were blocked from attending September 24-26, 2013 the pilot meeting and thus some held a demonstration, after their letters had also gone unanswered.	FIP Pilot Countries Meeting. MOFOR received critical inputs from several CSOs – none who had attended September 19 informal lunch – after a small demonstration outside of the venue hotel in Yogyakarta. Their concerns were related to the FIP programmatic design and objectives. MOFOR clarified it's the FIP program's objectives in a press statement which was picked up by local media.
Private Sector. Which companies? Given the high risk/high money laundering prevalent in forest sector as per INTERPOL & WB, & IFC target of working with large-scale companies, important for IFC to respond to long-standing CSO questions re	Over the period, the IFC FIP team met with 12 forestry enterprises from across Indonesia to explore advisory and investment needs and opportunities. The meetings provided input for the development of the FIP private sector project concept, which will aim to focus on strengthening supply chains between forest product manufacturers and upstream wood suppliers of different sizes.

names of companies as well as description of IFC due diligence measure taken to ensure companies are free of tax evasion and money laundering. Detailed questions were raised about IFC due diligence measures in CSO letter of 30 Oct 2013 but not answered. October 2013: CSO letter to IFC and WB requesting written information on: scheduling, sequencing of WB, IFC FIP preparation, Board dates, management approval dates, public consultations, lack of compliance with FIP ban on funding for industrial logging, violations of FIP consultation requirements, including requirement for community support for investment strategy, and detailed questions about IFC anti-money laundering and tax evasion due diligence assessments of large scale corporate partners in the high risk forest sector, as identified by INTERPOL, questions about the extent to which IFC is basing due diligence methods on lessons learned from the Asian Agri tax evasion case, IFC interactions with Sinar Mas Group, involvement of the military in FIP projects, etc. These specific questions were responded to with a short, vague letter and a reference to this document (which provides no meaningful data regarding consultations, and a reference to an old matrix posted in February 2013.