THEORY BURST #4: ASSESSING LEARNERS AND EVALUATING YOUR PROGRAM

Gwen Sherwood, PhD, RN, FAAN, ANEF
Professor and Associate Dean for Global Initiatives,
The University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill
Gwen.Sherwood@unc.edu

CLEAR PURPOSE – MINDFUL ENGAGEMENT

Why are you here?

What values brought you here?

What does it mean for stakeholders?

What are you willing to invest to work by your values?
OBJECTIVES

- Evaluate best practices in IPE learning
- Create learner assessment strategies in IPE
- Develop faculty skills in IPE
- Communicate the team’s IPE objectives to decision makers

https://www.nap.edu/catalog/18738/assessing-health-professional-education-workshop-summary
ASSESSMENT

What is the purpose of assessment?

Who may want to know (stakeholders)?

How do you match the method with the purpose?

What are challenges to informative assessment?

PURPOSES OF ASSESSMENT

Identify existing knowledge, clinical competencies, values

Assess student learning, clinical performance, and other outcomes

Identify further learning needs

Address stakeholder needs
### ASSESSMENT: COLLECTING INFORMATION OVER TIME

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Formative</th>
<th>Summative</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Feedback to learner</td>
<td>Achievement of outcomes, competencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Progress toward meeting outcomes</td>
<td>End-of-instruction evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Work along the way”</td>
<td>Stakeholder interests</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

How does assessment change whether a single learning activity or an on-going sustained experience?

---

**Students in nursing, pharmacy, social work, and medicine** spend one evening working in interprofessional teams with an unfolding case study enacted by trained standardized patients (SP). Students enjoy pizza together during orientation to the learning activity. Students work in groups of 6 balanced by discipline with a faculty facilitator. Students self organize to review the case and work with a trained SP. The case unfolds as information is presented in each of three sessions and the SP reacts. After each session, the SP leaves the room so students plan their case response as the case information changes. Students write up their plan of care at each stage of the unfolding case clarifying the role of each discipline.

How would assessment change if this were an outpatient clinic and the clinicians/learners were working with this patient over time?
Planning IPE begins with assessment: What do you want to accomplish and how will you know you did?

Determine the assessment plan for this learning activity:

State the purpose of the assessment
Identify what you will measure
Determine the stakeholder it serves
Choose a method of assessment
Identify the timing of the assessment
Other questions

EMPHASIZE IPE IN LEARNER CENTERED APPROACHES:

How do varied learning strategies impact assessment and evaluation?

New Questions
Work with Clinical Partners
Narrative pedagogies
Redesign focus of Papers
Unfolding case studies
Web Modules
Develop PBL
Readings
Reflective Practice
Goal oriented assessment: IPE as a delivery method drives how we consider assessment

Process and outcomes

Learning for practice: situated context

Knowledge for content versus knowledge use is more than listening to a lecture

Considerations:
What information and metrics are needed to evaluate the impact of IPE on individual, population, and system outcomes?

Assessment has to balance resources with desired outcomes

Methods must be practical, useable, focused, and transferable

Portfolios capture the diversity of IPE experiences and competency development, especially with a “menu” approach
IPE involves Situated Coaching in Action: how one enters a client based learning activity

Subject centered learning

Teacher
Students
Patient

IPE helps create experiential learning to improve patient outcomes

Assessment: Align with objectives

Identify knowledge, competencies, values
Measure learner achievement
Identify gaps

More than testing
May cover a period of time

Provide feedback to stakeholders
Measure progress
Determine future learning needs

Consider impact of setting, cost and resources
Measuring the impact of interprofessional education on collaborative practice and patient outcomes


Whereas considerable research has focused on student learning, only recently have researchers begun to look beyond the classroom and beyond learning outcomes for the impact of IPE on such issues as patient safety, patient and provider satisfaction, quality of care, health promotion, population health, and the cost of care.

## EVALUATION AND ASSESSMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quantitative: surveys, tests</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Qualitative, Experiential: link action with consequences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Narratives, Anecdotal, Case study, Focus groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Reflection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Appreciative Inquiry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Rubrics</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reflective Assessment:
- Change behavior to improve practice
- Promote individual accountability
- Increase self awareness
- Progress novice to expert

ASSESSMENT TOOLS FOR IPE

Attitudes Toward Health Care Teams Scale

Jefferson Survey of Attitudes Toward Physician-Nurse Collaboration

Interdisciplinary Education Perception Scale (IEPS)

Roles of Health Professions

Readiness for Interprofessional Learning Scale (RIPLS)

Student Stereotypes Rating Questionnaire


Team Performance Survey


EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING: GUIDING ASSESSMENT.

Cyclical process in which thoughts and ideas change with experiences

Engage in a realistic experience of what they are learning

Process knowledge and skills through experience, reflection, experimentation and application

Apply to new concepts

Connect to real life applications.
Reflection: Developing Professional Learning (Schon, 1983)

Systematic way to think, describe, examine, reconsider situations from multiple viewpoints

- Getting in touch with what we think, believe and value
- What we know
- What we assume

Integrate knowledge and experience for a new view

REFLECTIVE PRACTICE

Build sensitivity to self and others within context of work

Check assumptions, reframe, recognize safety risks, act

Demands confrontation with self and the conditions within your work that limit achieving desirable work
SELF-ASSESSMENT: LOOKING INWARD

Reflection demands confrontation with self and the conditions that limit achieving desirable work.

The essence of learning through reflection is to surface contradiction between intention and actual practice.

Professional maturity to grasp the whole of a situation to understand factors in the context.

REFLECTIVE PRACTICE: DEVELOPING INTERPERSONAL RELATIONSHIPS, MOVING FROM INDIVIDUAL TO TEAM BASED CARE: WHAT WOULD YOU MEASURE?

EQ tools and surveys

Self-awareness: assess own capabilities, act by values and goals.

Self regulation: control emotions, composed response.

Social skill: managing relationships

Empathy: respect, sensitivity to others, trust, and managing conflict.

Self motivation: working for a larger mission
Subject Centered learning: patients and families central to practice and education

Learners contextualize -motivated to acquire and use knowledge.

Reflective process of thinking, analyzing

Move from passive knowledge acquisition to active knowledge use

Designing IPE ➔ Mindful Engagement ➔ Developing situational awareness for patient centered team based care

How do you write Learning objectives based on what learners should be able to do with the knowledge rather than what learners should know? (Lisa Day, 2016)

Competency:
- Knowledge
- Skills
- Attitudes

IPE domains
EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING THEORY (KOLB, 1984)

EXPERIENCE AS A PLATFORM FOR LEARNING:

Reflective practice: systematic way of thinking about work
• Examine experiences to build reasoned action
• Build new knowledge, skills and attitudes

Developing professional maturity
• Mindful engagement
• Make sense of work experiences
• Reconsider choices in future situations

ENGAGING LEARNERS WITH QUESTIONS

The questions you ask help learners focus on what is important.
How you ask questions conveys values.
Open ended questions help assess how learners are thinking:

• What stands out?
• What are you worried about for the patient?
• What action will you take?
REFLECTION: EXPRESS EXPECTATIONS, PERCEPTIONS AND FEELINGS OF AN EXPERIENCE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evidence</th>
<th>Domain</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reaction</td>
<td>Affective Domain:</td>
<td>examine the evidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>examine how you feel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevance</td>
<td>Cognitive domain:</td>
<td>how is the evidence related?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>add your own understanding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>give alternative views</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsibility</td>
<td>Psychomotor domain</td>
<td>how is the knowledge used?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>clarify remaining questions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

KIRKPATRICK MODEL:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Methods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reaction</td>
<td>How did participants respond?</td>
<td>Questionnaires, informal comments, focus groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning</td>
<td>What were the improvements in knowledge, skill and changes in attitudes?</td>
<td>Pre/Post test scores, on the job assessments, supervisor reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavior</td>
<td>How are they doing their work differently?</td>
<td>Self assessment questionnaire, observation, peer reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results</td>
<td>What are benefits to the organization?</td>
<td>Quality measures, financial reports, narratives, work environment, retention</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Skills or reflective papers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1 Below expectations</th>
<th>2 Basic expectations</th>
<th>3 Proficient</th>
<th>4 Advanced</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Depth of reflection</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of textual evidence or exploring and analyzing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of language or writing strategies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conventions, coherence and style</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Writing Rubrics:**
- Short, focused assignments, write for one minute
- Longer, in-depth assignments

### Reflection: Describe a satisfying experience learning or working with members of another discipline

- Describe the situation.
- **Personal growth perspective:**
  - what about the event made you feel worthwhile?
- **Civic engagement:**
  - How did others respond?
- **Professional knowledge:**
  - What about the event can I adopt as usual behaviors or attitudes?
  - How was this different from other events?
USING UNFOLDING CASE STUDIES

What stands out for you in this case/story/situation?
What are you concerned about in this situation?
What assumptions are you making?
What else can it be?
What do you already know that can help you in this situation?

• From Sherwood & Horton Deutsch, 2012

There’s no such thing as “nonjudgmental” debriefing: A theory and method for debriefing with good judgment

Debriefing as a means of assessment:
How does debriefing emphasize instructors' judgments?
How do instructors elicit trainees' assumptions about the situation and their reasons for acting as they did?
Debriefing with Good Judgment: draws on theory and empirical findings to improve professional effectiveness through "reflective practice."

• Rigorous self-reflection: process that helps trainees recognize and resolve pressing clinical and behavioral dilemmas raised by the simulation and the judgment of the instructor.
### DEBRIEFING WITH GOOD JUDGMENT

**Frames:** invisible, but inferable, in the mind of trainees/instructors.
**Actions** (including speech) are observable.
**Results:** (e.g., vital signs, order/chaos) are observable.

#### Reactions:
- **Feelings:** How are you feeling.....
- **Facts:** what just happened.....

#### 2. Understanding: PAAIL
- **Preview topic**
- **Advocacy:** I saw...
- **Advocacy:** I think...
- **Inquiry:** I wonder....
- **Listen...**what is the learner’s frame? What is driving their assumptions?

#### 3. Summary
- **What went well?**
- **What can we do better?**
- **What will we do next time?**

---

Center for Medical Simulation, Harvard. [https://harvardmedsim.org/](https://harvardmedsim.org/)
BOTH LEARNING AND ASSESSMENT INVOLVE CREATING SAFE SPACE: PSYCHOLOGICAL SAFETY

Clarifying expectations

- Establishing a “fiction contract” with participants,
- Attending to logistical details
- Declaring and enacting a commitment to respecting learners and concern for their psychological safety.


Appreciative Inquiry: Change Management From A Positive Perspective Rather Than Gap Analysis

Appreciate: valuing the best in people; organization is a solution to be embraced not a problem to be solved

Inquire: exploration, discovery, questioning to see new potential and possibilities

Engages others in building the kind of world they want around them
APPRECIATIVE INQUIRY

**Discovery:** find the best of what is
- What gives life? Appreciating and valuing

**Dream:** challenges the status quo by visioning the future
- What might be? envisioning

**Design:** reflective response to build to greatest potential,
- How can it be? Co-constructing the future

**Destiny:** delivers new image
- What will be? Learning, empowering, improvising to sustain the future

---

AI APPLIED TO EVALUATION

What do you value most about the work you did in this course?

When in this course did you feel alive and felt you were accomplishing your learning goals?

How did the experiences in this course help you develop your work [practice]?

What are your three wishes to improve [this course]?
AI: EVALUATING USING STAR MOMENTS

What about this experience was satisfying?

- Describe the event.
- Personal growth perspective: what about the event made me feel worthwhile?
- Civic engagement: How did others respond?
- Professional knowledge: What about the event can I adopt as usual behaviors or attitudes?
- How was this different from other events?
- What can I apply in the future?

VISUAL THINKING STRATEGIES:
WHAT DO LEARNERS SEE AND THINK?

What do you see?

Why do you say that?

What else can it be?

Anyone see anything else?

https://vtshome.org/
Reflection: Visual Thinking Strategies

Practice observation and communication of details using descriptive words

Listening to other voices to learn how others think and communicate

Opens communication to multiple interpretations

Developing critical awareness: Go deeper beyond surface observation; seeing the patient not symptoms

BRIEF FEEDBACK: HOW ARE LEARNERS THINKING?

One minute question and answer: leader poses a question and learners have one minute to respond

Pass the Problem: pose a problem to solve related to topic using small groups, then pass responses to another group to critique and add additional responses

TRIZ (Liberating Structures): Name the worst to then focus on the ideal

1-2-4-All: one minute individual reflection, share with another, the two share with another two, and then entire group
DEVELOPING A MINDSET: WORKING TOGETHER TO IMPROVE HEALTHCARE OUTCOMES.

A man meets three workers at a building site.
He asks each in turn, What are you doing?
The first one replied, I am laying bricks.
The second one replied, I am building a wall.
The third one said, I am helping build a cathedral.

IPE: getting the big picture to improve the patient experience.

HOW HAVE YOU RESPONDED TO THE SESSION TODAY?

Reflect on your expectations.

Reflect on the commitment you made to attend this session.

Reflect on what you will take with you from this session.

Write one sentence that summarizes your participation in this session today, that describes your feeling as you leave. Carry that into your group work.
ADDITIONAL RESOURCES


Institute for Healthcare Improvement: The IHI is a not-for-profit organization leading the improvement of health care throughout the world, including free Open School for students and online certifications. [http://www.ihi.org/IHI/](http://www.ihi.org/IHI/)
